# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE NORTHERN DIVISION

Matthew Casella, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

- against -

**Class Action Complaint** 

Sam's West, Inc.,

Jury Trial Demanded

Defendant

Plaintiff alleges upon information and belief, except for allegations about Plaintiff, which are based on personal knowledge:

1. Sam's West, Inc. ("Defendant") manufactures and sells joint health supplements purporting to contain 500 mg of turmeric and curcumin under its Member's Mark brand ("Product").





- 2. The relevant front label representations state that the Product contains 500 mg of "standardized extract" of "turmeric curcumin complex."
- The Supplement Facts on the back label specify that "95% Standardized Turmeric 3. (Curcuma longa) Extract" was used.



- 4. Combined, these representations give consumers the impression the Product contains 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 5. However, lab testing conducted by ConsumerLab.com in 2019 revealed that instead of the expected 475 mg, the Product contains only 9.7 mg of curcuminoids per serving.<sup>1</sup>

Tod Cooperman, M.D., Turmeric and Curcumin Supplements and Spices Review, ConsumerLab.com (Sept. 15, 2019), https://www.consumerlab.com/reviews/turmeric-curcuminsupplements-spice-review/turmeric/.

	i	i	i	i	
NA	1 capsule	Adults - One capsule	\$0.06	Suitable for vegetarians.	1 capsule
Member's Mark®	500 mg Biocumin™	daily with food as a		No Artificial Colors Or	Sodium 10 mg, Total
[Sam's Club]	turmeric/curcumin	dietary supplement.	[\$3.06 based	Flavors. No Sugar. No	Carbohydrate <1 g, Biocumin™
Turmeric	complex		on amount	Gluten. No Lactose. No	Turmeric / Curcumin Complex
Curcumin		Large capsule	found]	Trans Fat.	[Turmeric (Curcuma longa) Root
Complex	Found 9.7 mg				Powder, 95% Standardized
Complex	curcuminoids per		\$14.88/250	Precaution: Contains:	Turmeric (Curcuma longa)
	serving		capsules	Soy.	Extract, Antioxidants (ascorbic
Amports.	Very low amount.				acid [Vitamin C] and d-alpha
comple	Suggests that only				tocopheryl succinate [Vitamin E])
	1.9% of Biocumin™				500 mg
Dist. by Sam's	complex is				Additional Information
West, Inc.	curcuminoids, even				Additional information
	less than in regular				1 capsule
	root powder.				Sodium 10 mg, Total
					Carbohydrate <1 g, Biocumin™
	Also tested for heavy				Turmeric / Curcumin Complex
	metals				[Turmeric (Curcuma longa)
	1				Root Powder, 95%
					Standardized Turmeric
					(Curcuma longa) Extract,
					Antioxidants (ascorbic acid
					[Vitamin C] and d-alpha
					tocopheryl succinate [Vitamin
					E]) 500 mg.
					Ingredients: Turmeric,
					Hydroxypropyl Methylcellulose,
					CurcuWIN™ Turmeric Extract,
					Silicon Dioxide, Dicalcium
					Phosphate, Stearic Acid,
					Magnesium Stearate,
					Microcrystalline Cellulose,
					Ascorbic Acid, d-Alpha
					Tocopheryl Succinate. May
					contain ascorbyl palmitate,
					ethyl cellulose, natural mixed
					tocopherols, povidone.

In addition, the Ingredients list states that "CurcuWINTM Turmeric Extract" is the 6. exact extract used.

> Turmeric, Hydroxypropyl Ingredients: Methylcellulose, CurcuWIN™ Turmeric Extract, Silicon Dioxide, Dicalcium Phosphate, Stearic Acid, Magnesium Stearate, Microcrystalline Cellulose, Ascorbic Acid, d-Alpha Tocopheryl Succinate. May contain ascorbyl palmitate, ethyl cellulose, natural mixed tocopherols, povidone. Contains: Soy.

ConsumerLab's report provides that "CurcuWin is [only] 20% curcuminoids." 7.

- 8. If the Product contains CurcuWIN, as listed in the Ingredients, the extract cannot also be "95% Standardized Turmeric (*Curcuma longa*) Extract," as listed in the Supplement Facts.
- 9. Consumers expect a joint health supplement represented directly or indirectly as containing 500 mg of "turmeric curcumin complex," utilizing "95% Standardized Turmeric (*Curcuma longa*) Extract," to contain at least 475mg of curcuminoids per serving.
- 10. Defendant makes other representations and omissions with respect to the Product which are false and misleading.

#### Jurisdiction and Venue

- Jurisdiction is based on the Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 ("CAFA"). 28 U.S.C.
   § 1332(d)(2).
- 12. The aggregate amount in controversy exceeds \$5 million, including any statutory and punitive damages, exclusive of interest and costs.
  - 13. Plaintiff is a citizen of Tennessee.
  - 14. Defendant is a citizen of Arkansas.
- 15. The class of persons Plaintiff seek to represent includes persons who are citizens of different states from which Defendant is a citizen.
- 16. The members of the classes Plaintiff seek to represent are more than 100, because the Product has been sold with the representations described here from dozens of Defendant's retail (Sam's Club) stores and website, across the States covered by the proposed classes.
- 17. Venue is in this District with assignment to the Northern Division because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to these claims occurred in Knox County, including Plaintiff's purchase and use of the Product, reliance on the representations and omissions, and/or subsequent awareness they were false and misleading.

#### **Parties**

- 18. Plaintiff Matthew Casella is a citizen of Knoxville, Tennessee, Knox County.
- 19. Defendant Sam's West, Inc. is an Arkansas corporation with a principal place of business in Bentonville, Arkansas, Benton County.
- 20. While Sam's Club stores sell leading national brands, they also sell a large number of products under one of their private label brands, Member's Mark.
- 21. Private label products are made by third-party manufacturers and sold under the name of the retailer, or its sub-brands.
- 22. Previously referred to as "generic" or "store brand," private label products have increased in quality, and often are superior to their national brand counterparts.
- Products under the Member's Mark brand have an industry-wide reputation for 23. quality and value.
- 24. In releasing products under the Member's Mark brand, Defendant's foremost criteria was to have high-quality products that were equal to or better than the national brands.
- Defendant is able to get national brands to produce its private label items due its loyal 25. customer base and tough negotiating.
- 26. That Member's Mark branded products met this high bar was proven by focus groups, which rated them above the name brand equivalent.
- 27. Private label products generate higher profits for retailers because national brands spend significantly more on marketing, contributing to their higher prices.
- 28. A survey by The Nielsen Co. "found nearly three out of four American consumers believe store brands are good alternatives to national brands, and more than 60 percent consider them to be just as good."

- 29. Private label products under the Member's Mark brand benefit by their association with consumers' appreciation for the Sam's Club brand as a whole.
- 30. The development of private label items is a growth area for Sam's Club, as they select only top suppliers to develop and produce Member's Mark products.
- 31. Plaintiff purchased the Product on one or more occasions within the statutes of limitations for each cause of action alleged, from Defendant's website and retail locations, including 8435 Walbrook Dr, Knoxville, TN 37923, between 2017 and 2020, among other times.
- 32. Plaintiff relied on the words, terms coloring, descriptions, layout, placement, packaging, tags, and/or images on the Product, on the labeling, statements, omissions, claims, statements, and instructions, made by Defendant or at its directions, in digital, print and/or social media, which accompanied the Product and separately, through in-store, digital, audio, and print marketing.
- 33. Plaintiff saw the representations "turmeric curcumin complex," "standardized extract," "500 mg," and "95% Standardized Turmeric (*Curcuma longa*) Extract."
- 34. Plaintiff believed and expected the Product contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 35. As a result of the false and misleading representations, the Product is sold at premium price, approximately not less than \$14.88 for 250 capsules, excluding tax and sales.
  - 36. Plaintiff bought the Product at or exceeding the above-referenced price.
- 37. Plaintiff paid more for the Product, would have paid less or not have purchased it had he known the representations and omissions were false and misleading.
- 38. The value of the Product that Plaintiff purchased was materially less than its value as represented by Defendant.

- Plaintiff chose between this Product and others represented similarly, but which did not misrepresent or omit their attributes, features, and/or components.
- 40. Plaintiff intends to, seeks to, and will purchase the Product again when he can do so with the assurance its representations are consistent with its attributes and/or composition.
- Plaintiff is unable to rely on the labeling and representations not only of this Product, but other turmeric curcumin supplements, because he is unsure whether those representations are truthful.
- 42. If Defendant's labeling were to be truthful, Plaintiff could rely on the labeling of other turmeric curcumin supplements.

#### Class Allegations

43. Plaintiff seeks certification under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23 of the following classes:

> Tennessee Class: All persons in the State of Tennessee who purchased the Product during the statutes of limitations for each cause of action alleged; and

> Consumer Fraud Multi-State Class: All persons in the States of Alabama, Arkansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, Montana, and Tennessee who purchased the Product during the statutes of limitations for each cause of action alleged.

- 44. Common questions of issues, law, and fact predominate and include whether Defendant's representations and omissions were and are misleading and if Plaintiff and class members are entitled to damages.
- Plaintiff's claims and basis for relief are typical to other members because all were 45. subjected to the same unfair, misleading, and deceptive representations, omissions, and actions.
- 46. Plaintiff is an adequate representative because his interests do not conflict with other members.

- 47. No individual inquiry is necessary since the focus is only on Defendant's practices and the class is definable and ascertainable.
- 48. Individual actions would risk inconsistent results, be repetitive and are impractical to justify, as the claims are modest relative to the scope of the harm.
- 49. Plaintiff's counsel is competent and experienced in complex class action litigation and intends to protect class members' interests adequately and fairly.
  - 50. Plaintiff seeks class-wide injunctive relief because the practices continue.

# Tennessee Consumer Protection Act ("TCPA"), Tenn. Code Ann. § 47-18-101, et seq. (Tennessee Class)

- 51. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all preceding paragraphs.
- 52. Plaintiff expected the Product contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 53. Plaintiff would not have purchased the Product or paid as much if the true facts had been known, suffering damages.

## <u>Violation of State Consumer Fraud Acts</u> (Consumer Fraud Multi-State Class)

- 54. The Consumer Fraud Acts of the States in the Consumer Fraud Multi-State Class are similar to the consumer protection statute invoked by Plaintiff and prohibit the use of unfair or deceptive business practices in the conduct of commerce.
- 55. The members of the Consumer Fraud Multi-State Class reserve their rights to assert their consumer protection claims under the Consumer Fraud Acts of the States they represent and/or the consumer protection statute invoked by Plaintiff.
- 56. Defendant intended that members of the Consumer Fraud Multi-State Class would rely upon its deceptive conduct, which they did, suffering damages.

# Breaches of Express Warranty, Implied Warranty of Merchantability/Fitness for a Particular Purpose and Magnuson Moss Warranty Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 2301, et seq.

- 57. The Product was manufactured, identified, marketed, and sold by Defendant and expressly and impliedly warranted to Plaintiff that it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 58. Defendant directly marketed the Product to Plaintiff through its advertisements and marketing, through various forms of media, on the packaging, in print circulars, direct mail, product descriptions, and targeted digital advertising.
- 59. Defendant knew the product attributes that potential customers like Plaintiff were seeking and developed its marketing and labeling to directly meet their needs and desires.
- 60. The representations about the Product were conveyed in writing and promised it would be defect-free, and Plaintiff understood this meant it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 61. Defendant's representations affirmed and promised that the Product contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 62. Defendant described the Product so Plaintiff believed that it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving, which became part of the basis of the bargain that it would conform to its affirmations and promises.
- 63. Defendant had a duty to disclose and/or provide non-deceptive promises, descriptions and marketing of the Product.
- 64. This duty is based on Defendant's outsized role in the market for health supplements, as custodian of the Member's Mark brand.
  - 65. Plaintiff recently became aware of Defendant's breach of the Product's warranties.

- Plaintiff provided or provides notice to Defendant, its agents, representatives, retailers, and their employees that it breached the Product's warranties.
- 67. Defendant received notice and should have been aware of these issues due to complaints by consumers and third-parties, including regulators and competitors, to its main offices and through online forums.
- 68. The Product did not conform to its affirmations of fact and promises due to Defendant's actions.
- The Product was not merchantable because it was not fit to pass in the trade as advertised, not fit for the ordinary purpose for which it was intended and did not conform to the promises or affirmations of fact made on the packaging, container, or label, because it was marketed as if it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 70. The Product was not merchantable because Defendant had reason to know the particular purpose for which it was bought by Plaintiff, because he expected it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving, and he relied on its skill and judgment to select or furnish such suitable product.

# Negligent Misrepresentation

- 71. Defendant had a duty to truthfully represent the Product, which it breached.
- 72. This duty was non-delegable, and based on Defendant's position, holding itself out as having special knowledge and experience in this area, as custodian of the Member's Mark brand.
- 73. Defendant's representations regarding the Product went beyond the specific representations on its packaging and labels, as they incorporated its extra-labeling promises and commitments to quality Member's Mark has been known for.
  - 74. These promises were outside of the standard representations that other companies

may make in a standard arms-length, retail context.

- The representations took advantage of consumers' cognitive shortcuts made at the 75. point-of-sale and their trust in Defendant.
- Plaintiff reasonably and justifiably relied on these negligent misrepresentations and omissions, which served to induce and did induce, his purchase of the Product.

#### Fraud

- 77. Defendant misrepresented and/or omitted the attributes and qualities of the Product, that it contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 78. Defendant was aware the Product did not contain contained 95% (475mg) of curcuminoids per serving.
- 79. The records Defendant is required to maintain, and/or the information inconspicuously disclosed to consumers, provided it with actual and constructive knowledge of the falsity or deception, through statement and omission, of the representations.

### **Unjust Enrichment**

80. Defendant obtained benefits and monies because the Product was not as represented and expected, to the detriment and impoverishment of Plaintiff and class members, who seek restitution and disgorgement of inequitably obtained profits.

#### Jury Demand and Prayer for Relief

Plaintiff demands a jury trial on all issues.

#### **WHEREFORE**, Plaintiff prays for judgment:

- 1. Certifying Plaintiff as representative and the undersigned as counsel for the classes;
- 2. Entering preliminary and permanent injunctive relief by directing Defendant to correct the challenged practices to comply with the law;
- 3. Awarding monetary, statutory and/or punitive damages and interest;

- 4. Awarding costs and expenses, including reasonable attorney and expert fees; and
- 5. Other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

Dated: March 23, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Brent S. Snyder BPR # 021700

2125 Middlebrook Pike Knoxville TN 37921 (865) 264-3328

brent@brentsnyderlaw.com

Sheehan & Associates, P.C. Spencer Sheehan (*Pro Hac Vice* forthcoming) 60 Cuttermill Rd Ste 412 Great Neck NY 11021 (516) 268-7080 spencer@spencersheehan.com

# **CIVIL COVER SHEET**

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

purpose of initiating the civil do	ocket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC	TIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF	<u> </u>				
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS  Matthew Casella, ind similarly situated	lividually and on	behalf of all oth	ners   DEFENDANTS Sam's West, l				
(b) County of Residence of	of First Listed Plaintiff	Knox	County of Residence	e of First Listed Defendant			
(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)			NOTE: IN LAND C	(IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)			
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A Brent S. Snyder, 2125 Mid (865) 264-3328			Attorneys (If Known)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	ICTION (Place an "X" in	One Box Only)	II. CITIZENSHIP OF P				
☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	☐ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government)	Not a Party)		PTF DEF  1			
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant	☑ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizensh	ip of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of Another State	2 Incorporated and F of Business In A			
			Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	□ 3 Foreign Nation	□ 6 □ 6		
IV. NATURE OF SUIT				Click here for: Nature of S			
CONTRACT  □ 110 Insurance	PERSONAL INJURY	PERSONAL INJURY	FORFEITURE/PENALTY  ☐ 625 Drug Related Seizure	BANKRUPTCY  ☐ 422 Appeal 28 USC 158	OTHER STATUTES  □ 375 False Claims Act		
<ul> <li>□ 120 Marine</li> <li>□ 130 Miller Act</li> <li>□ 140 Negotiable Instrument</li> <li>□ 150 Recovery of Overpayment &amp; Enforcement of Judgment</li> <li>□ 151 Medicare Act</li> <li>□ 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excludes Veterans)</li> <li>□ 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits</li> <li>□ 160 Stockholders' Suits</li> <li>□ 190 Other Contract</li> <li>□ 195 Contract Product Liability</li> <li>□ 196 Franchise</li> </ul>	□ 310 Airplane □ 315 Airplane Product Liability □ 320 Assault, Libel & Slander □ 330 Federal Employers' Liability □ 340 Marine □ 345 Marine Product Liability □ 350 Motor Vehicle □ 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability □ 360 Other Personal Injury	□ 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability □ 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability □ 368 Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERT □ 370 Other Fraud □ 371 Truth in Lending □ 380 Other Personal Property Damage □ 385 Property Damage	of Property 21 USC 881  □ 690 Other  Y  LABOR □ 710 Fair Labor Standards Act □ 720 Labor/Management Relations □ 740 Railway Labor Act	□ 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157  INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS □ 820 Copyrights □ 830 Patent □ 835 Patent-Abbreviated New Drug Application □ 840 Trademark □ 880 Defend Trade Secrets Act of 2016  SOCIAL SECURITY □ 861 HIA (1395ff)	□ 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a))      □ 400 State Reapportionment     □ 410 Antitrust      □ 430 Banks and Banking     □ 450 Commerce     □ 460 Deportation     □ 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations     □ 480 Consumer Credit     □ (15 USC 1681 or 1692)      □ 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act     □ 490 Cable/Sat TV		
REAL PROPERTY	□ 362 Personal Injury - Medical Malpractice CIVIL RIGHTS	Product Liability  PRISONER PETITION	☐ 751 Family and Medical Leave Act	□ 862 Black Lung (923) □ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) □ 864 SSID Title XVI	Exchange  890 Other Statutory Actions  891 Agricultural Acts		
REAL PROPERTY  210 Land Condemnation 220 Foreclosure 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property	☐ 440 Other Civil Rights ☐ 441 Voting ☐ 442 Employment ☐ 443 Housing/ Accommodations ☐ 445 Amer. w/Disabilities-	Habeas Corpus:  ☐ 463 Alien Detainee ☐ 510 Motions to Vacate Sentence ☐ 530 General ☐ 535 Death Penalty	□ 791 Employee Retirement Income Security Act  IMMIGRATION	□ 865 RSI (405(g))  FEDERAL TAX S UITS □ 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) □ 871 IRS—Third Party	□ 893 Environmental Matters □ 895 Freedom of Information Act □ 896 Arbitration □ 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision □ 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes		
	Employment  ☐ 446 Amer. w/Disabilities- Other  ☐ 448 Education	Other:  540 Mandamus & Other  550 Civil Rights  555 Prison Condition  640 Civil Detainee - Conditions of Confinement	☐ 462 Naturalization Application	26 USC 7609			
		Remanded from  Appellate Court	4 Reinstated or Reopened □ 5 Transfer Anoth (specify	er District Litigation			
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	29 II C C 8 1222		filing (Do not cite jurisdictional st	atutes unless diversity):			
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:		S IS A <b>CLASS ACTION</b> 3, F.R.Cv.P.	DEMAND \$	CHECK YES only i JURY DEMAND:	if demanded in complaint: : ☑ Yes ☐ No		
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(See instructions):	шрсг		DOCKET AT A COED			
DATE Marrala 22	2022	JUDGESIGNATURE OF ATTO		DOCKET NUMBER			
March 23	, 2023		/s/B	rent S. Snyder			

RECEIPT# \_\_\_\_\_ CaseM9!23-cv-00102 DocuMMeM6 11 Filed 03/23/28 Dop age 1 of 1 Рафено 13

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

Eastern District of Tennessee

Matthew Casella, individually others similarly situated,	y and on behalf of all ) ) ) )	
Plaintiff(s)		
V.	)	Civil Action No.
٠.	)	Civil 7 Edoli 140.
Sam's West, Inc.,	)	
Defendant(s	)	
	SUMMONS IN A C	IVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address)	Sam's West, Inc.	
	c/o C T Corporation System 124 W Capitol Ave Ste 190 Little Rock AR 72201-3717	0
are the United States or a United P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must sthe Federal Rules of Civil Proce whose name and address are:	evice of this summons on you (noted States agency, or an officer or serve on the plaintiff an answer dure. The answer or motion mutually appears to the property of the serve	not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of ast be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, ebrook Pike Knoxville TN 37921
If you fail to respond, ju You also must file your answer		red against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.  CLERK OF COURT
		CLLIN OF COUNT
Date:		
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

Civil Action No.

### PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (nan	ne of individual and title, if any)						
was red	ceived by me on (date)							
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individu	ual at (place)					
			on (date)					
	☐ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with (name)							
		, a person of suitable age and discretion who resides there,						
	on (date)	n (date), and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or						
	☐ I served the summo	ns on (name of individual)			, who is			
	designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization)							
			on (date)	; or				
	☐ I returned the summ	nons unexecuted because			; or			
	☐ Other ( <i>specify</i> ):							
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$					
	I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true.							
Date:								
			Server's signature					
			Printed name and title					
			Server's address					

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc: