IT IS HEREBY ADJUDGED AND DECREED THAT:

- 1. This Judgment incorporates by reference the definitions in the Amended Stipulation of Settlement dated October 18, 2019 ("Amended Stipulation") (Dkt. 169-1), attached hereto as Exhibit A, and all capitalized terms used herein shall have the same meanings as set forth in the Amended Stipulation unless set forth differently herein. The terms of the Amended Stipulation are fully incorporated in this Judgment as if set forth fully here.
- 2. The Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and all Parties to the action, including all Class Members who do not timely exclude themselves from the Class. The list of excluded Class Members was filed with the Court on May 4, 2020 and is attached as Exhibit B.
- 3. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(b)(3), the Court hereby certifies the following Class:

All individuals in the United States who purchased Infants' Tylenol for personal or household use since October 3, 2014 until January 6, 2020. (the date notice of this Settlement to the Class was first published). Specifically excluded from the Class are (a) Defendants, (b) the officers, directors, or employees of Defendants and their immediate family, (c) any entity in which Defendants have a controlling interest, (d) any affiliate, legal representative, heir, or assign of Defendants, (e) all federal court judges who have presided over this Action and their immediate family; (f) all persons who have submitted a valid request for exclusion from the Class; and (g) those who purchased the Challenged Product for the purpose of resale or for use in a business setting.

- 4. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(c)(3), all such persons or entities who satisfy the Class definition above, except those Class Members who timely and validly excluded themselves from the Class, are Class Members bound by this Judgment.
 - 5. For settlement purposes only, the Court finds:
 - (a) Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(a), Rony Elkies

6

4

10 11

13 14

12

16 17

15

18 19

20

21 22

23

24 25

26

28

27

and Danielle Alfandary are members of the Class, their claims are typical of the Class, and they fairly and adequately protected the interests of the Class throughout the proceedings in the Action. Accordingly, the Court hereby appoints Rony Elkies and Danielle Alfandary as class representatives;

- The Class meets all of the requirements of Federal Rules of Civil (b) Procedure 23(a) and (b)(3) for certification of the class claims alleged in the First Amended Complaint, including: (a) numerosity; (b) commonality; (c) typicality; (d) adequacy of the class representative and Class Counsel; (e) predominance of common questions of fact and law among the Class for purposes of settlement; and (f) superiority; and
- Having considered the factors set forth in Rule 23(g)(1) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Class Counsel have fairly and adequately represented the Class for purposes of entering into and implementing the settlement. Accordingly, the Court hereby appoints Class Counsel as counsel to represent Class Members.
- 6. Persons or entities who filed timely exclusion requests are not bound by this Judgment or the terms of the Amended Stipulation and may pursue their own individual remedies against Defendants. However, such excluded parties are not entitled to any rights or benefits provided to Class Members by the terms of the Amended Stipulation. The list of persons and entities excluded from the Class because they filed timely and valid requests for exclusion is attached hereto as Exhibit B.
- 7. The Court directed that notice be given to Class members by publication and other means pursuant to the notice program proposed by the Parties in the Amended Stipulation and approved by the Court. (Dkt. 172 ¶¶ 11–16.) The declaration from Kurtzman Carson Consulting (KCC), attesting to the dissemination of the notice to the Class, demonstrates compliance with this Court's Preliminary Approval Order, Dkt. 172. The Class Notice advised Class members of the terms of

5

6 7 8

23 24 25

26

27

28

19

20

21

22

the settlement; the Final Approval Hearing and their right to appear at such hearing; their rights to remain in or opt out of the Class and to object to the settlement; the procedures for exercising such rights; and the binding effect of this Judgment, whether favorable or unfavorable, to the Class.

- 8. The distribution of the notice to the Class constituted the best notice practicable under the circumstances, and fully satisfied the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, the requirements of due process, 28 U.S.C. §1715, and any other applicable law.
- 9. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(e)(2), the Court finds after a hearing and based upon all submissions of the Parties and other persons that the settlement proposed by the Parties is fair, reasonable, and adequate. The terms and provisions of the Amended Stipulation are the product of arms-length negotiations conducted in good faith and with the assistance of an experienced mediator, Honorable Charles W. "Tim" McCoy (retired). The Court has considered any timely objections to the Settlement and finds that such objections are without merit and should be overruled. Approval of the Amended Stipulation will result in substantial savings of time, money and effort to the Court and the Parties, and will further the interests of justice.
- 10. Upon the Effective Date, the named Plaintiffs and each Class Member other than those listed on Exhibit B shall be deemed to have, and by operation of this Final Settlement Order and Judgment shall have released, waived and discharged with prejudice Defendants from any and all claims, demands, rights, causes of action, suits, petitions, complaints, damages of any kind, liabilities, debts, punitive or statutory damages, penalties, losses and issues of any kind or nature whatsoever, asserted or unasserted, known or unknown (including, but not limited to, any and all claims relating to or alleging deceptive or unfair business practices, false or misleading advertising, intentional or negligent misrepresentation, negligence, concealment, omission, unfair competition, promise without intent to perform,

11. All Class Members who have not timely and validly submitted requests for exclusion are bound by this Judgment and by the terms of the Amended Stipulation.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- 12. The Plaintiffs in the Action initiated this lawsuit, acted to protect the Class, and assisted their counsel. Their efforts have produced the Amended Stipulation entered into in good faith that provides a fair, reasonable, adequate and certain result for the Class. Plaintiff Elkies is entitled to a service award of \$4,000. Plaintiff Alfandary is entitled to a service award of \$4,000. Class Counsel is entitled to reasonable attorneys' fees, which the Court finds to be \$2,083,950, and expenses in the amount of \$357,917. Claims administrator Kurtzman Carson Consultants, LLC is entitled to \$516,000 for settlement administration costs.
- 13. The Court hereby dismisses with prejudice the Action, and the Released Parties are hereby released from all further liability for the Released Claims.
- 14. Without affecting the finality of this Judgment, the Court reserves jurisdiction over the implementation, administration and enforcement of this Judgment and the Amended Stipulation, and all matters ancillary thereto.
- 15. The Court finding that no reason exists for delay in ordering final judgment pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b), the clerk is hereby

directed to enter this Judgment forthwith. The Parties are hereby authorized without needing further approval from 16. the Court to agree to and adopt such modifications and expansions of the Amended Stipulation, including without limitation the claim review procedure, that are consistent with this Judgment and do not limit the rights of Class Members under the Amended Stipulation. IT IS SO ORDERED. George H. Www DATED: June 22, 2020 HON. GEORGE H. WU, UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

EXHIBIT A

CASE NO. 2:17-CV-7320-GW(JEMX)

Case	2:17-c\	v-07320-GW-JEM Document 181-1 Filed 06/22/20 Page 3 of 74 Page 1 #:7997	D
1		TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2			Page
3	I.	DEFINITIONS	1
4	II.	RECITALS	
5	III.	SETTLEMENT RELIEF	
6	IV. V.	RELEASESCLASS CERTIFICATION FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES ONLY	
	V. VI.	CLASS NOTICE AND COURT APPROVAL	
7	VII.	CONDITIONS; TERMINATION	
8	VIII.		
9	IX.	COVENANTS AND WARRANTIES	24
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			ACTION
	ll .	CLASS	ACTION

This Stipulation of Settlement is made and entered into by plaintiffs Rony Elkies and Danielle Alfandary on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated, and defendants Johnson & Johnson Consumer Inc. and Johnson & Johnson Services, Inc.

I. **DEFINITIONS**

- A. As used in this Stipulation, the following capitalized terms have the meanings specified below:
- 1. "Action" means the case entitled *Elkies v. Johnson & Johnson Services, Inc.*, filed on October 5, 2017, in the U.S. District Court for the Central District of California and assigned Case No. 2:17-cv-7320-GW(JEMx).
- 2. "Approved Claim(s)" means the claims approved by the Claim Administrator according to the claims criteria in Exhibit A.
- 3. "Claim Administrator" means the independent company agreed upon by the Parties to provide the Class and Publication Notice and administer the claims process. The Parties agree that the Kurtzman Carson Consultants LLC ("KCC") will be retained as the Claim Administrator.
- 4. "Claims Cost Estimate" is the Claim Administrator's good faith best estimate of all the expenses to be incurred in the claims process.
- 5. "Claim Form" means the form that is substantially in the form of Exhibit F hereto.
- 6. "Claim Fund" means the fund for payment of Class Members' claims, attorneys' fees and expenses in an amount to be approved by the Court, a service award to the named plaintiffs in an amount to be approved by the Court, if any, certain notice and administration costs, and Claim Fund Expenses, if any.
- 7. "Claim Fund Balance" means the balance, if any, at the end of the Claim Review Period, consisting of the Settlement Amount paid into the Claim Fund minus: (i) the total amount paid to Class Members who submit Approved Claims; (ii) the total amount, up to \$516,000, paid to the Claim Administrator

- toward Settlement Administration Expenses, including CAFA notice; (iii) Claim Fund Expenses; (iv) attorneys' fees and expenses in an amount to be approved by the Court; and (v) service awards to the named plaintiffs, if any, in an amount to be approved by the Court.
- 8. "Claim Fund Expenses" are expenses associated with maintaining the Claim Fund (including taxes that may be owed by the Claim Fund).
- 9. "Claim Review Period" means the three-month period beginning no later than 30 days after the Preliminary Approval Order.
- 10. "Claim Submission Period" means the period beginning on the date notice to the Class is first published, and continuing until 120 days after the date of the Preliminary Approval Order.
- United States who purchased Infants' Tylenol (the "Challenged Product") within the Class Period for personal or household use. Specifically excluded from the Class are (a) Defendants, (b) the officers, directors, or employees of Defendants and their immediate family members, (c) any entity in which Defendants have a controlling interest, (d) any affiliate, legal representative, heir, or assign of Defendants, (e) all federal court judges who have presided over this Action and their immediate family members; (f) all persons who submit a valid request for exclusion from the Class; and (g) those who purchased the Challenged Product for the purpose of resale or for use in a business setting.
- 12. "Class Counsel" means the attorneys of record for Plaintiffs in this Action.
- 13. "Class Notice" means the "Notice of Class Action Settlement" substantially in the same form as Exhibit E attached hereto.
- 14. "Class Notice Package" means the information as approved in form and content by Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel and to be approved by the Court. Class Notice Packages will include (a) the Class Notice, and (b) the

22. "Final Settlement Order and Judgment" means an order and judgment entered by the Court:

25

26

27

28

(a) Giving final approval to the terms of this Stipulation as fair, adequate, and reasonable;

- expenses associated with notifying the Class of this proposed settlement and administration of the claim process.

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- "Settlement Website" means the website established by the 35. Claim Administrator that will contain documents relevant to the settlement, including the Class Notice Package in English and Spanish. Claim Forms may be submitted by Class Members via the Settlement Website.
- "Stipulation of Settlement" and/or "Stipulation" means this 36. Stipulation of Settlement, including its attached exhibits (which are incorporated herein by reference), duly executed by Plaintiffs, Class Counsel, Defendants and Defendants' Counsel.

B. Capitalized terms used in this Stipulation, but not defined above, shall have the meaning ascribed to them in this Stipulation and the exhibits attached hereto.

II. RECITALS

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- On October 5, 2017, Plaintiffs Rony Elkies and Danielle Alfandary Α. filed a complaint against Defendants in the U.S. District Court for the Central District of California. The complaint alleged (1) violations of California's Unfair Competition Law ("UCL"), Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200 et seq.; California's False Advertising Law ("FAL"), Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17500 et seq.; and California's Consumer Legal Remedies Act ("CLRA"), Cal. Civ. Code § 1750 et seq.; (2) negligent and intentional misrepresentation; and (3) breach of the implied warranties of merchantability and fitness for a particular purpose with regard to Infants' Tylenol. The complaint sought certification of a nationwide class of "All persons who purchased Infants' Tylenol for personal use in the United States since October 5, 2014." The complaint also sought certification of a California sub-class of "All persons who purchased Infants' Tylenol for personal use in California since October 5, 2014." Class Counsel confirm that before commencing the Action, they conducted an examination and evaluation of the relevant law and facts to assess the merits of the claims and to determine how to best serve the interests of the members of the proposed classes.
- B. On November 21, 2017, Plaintiffs filed a First Amended Complaint alleging only violations of (1) the UCL, (2) FAL, and (3) CLRA.
- C. The First Amended Complaint alleged that Defendants engaged in a false and misleading advertising campaign related to Infants' Tylenol. Plaintiffs alleged that because the label of Infants' Tylenol includes the name "Infants'" and an image of a mother holding her baby, the Challenged Product communicates to consumers that the product is specially formulated for infants, when another product manufactured by JJCI—Children's Tylenol—contains the same medicine

- D. After the Parties engaged in extensive discovery over the course of more than a year into the marketing and sale of Infants' Tylenol throughout the United States, on October 19, 2018, the Court granted Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification, and certified a class of all persons who purchased Infants' Tylenol for personal use in California since October 3, 2014. On January 15, 2019, the Court slightly revised the class definition to "All persons who purchased, in California, Infants' Tylenol for personal use since October 3, 2014."
- E. On April 4, 2019, Class Counsel, Defendants, and Defendants' Counsel participated in a settlement mediation with the Honorable Charles W. "Tim" McCoy (Ret.). A settlement was not reached during the mediation, but the parties continued to discuss the possibility of settlement, facilitated by Judge McCoy. Based upon Plaintiffs' investigation, the discovery exchanged during the litigation, and evaluation of the facts and law relating to the matters alleged in the pleadings, Plaintiffs and Class Counsel agreed to settle the Action pursuant to the provisions of this Stipulation after considering, among other things: (1) the substantial benefits available to the Class under the terms of this Stipulation; (2) the attendant risks and uncertainty of litigation, especially in complex actions such as this, as well as the difficulties and delays inherent in such litigation; and (3) the desirability of consummating this Stipulation promptly to provide effective relief to Plaintiffs and the Class.
 - F. Defendants have denied and continue to deny each and all of the

G. Nonetheless, Defendants have concluded that further defense of the Action would be protracted and expensive and have also have taken into account the uncertainty and risks inherent in any litigation. Defendants, therefore, have determined that it is desirable and beneficial to them that the Action be settled in the manner and upon the terms and conditions set forth in the Stipulation.

III. SETTLEMENT RELIEF

In consideration of the covenants set forth herein, the Parties agree as follows:

A. <u>Injunctive Relief</u>

- 1. By the later of (i) 180 days following the Effective Date or (ii) December 31, 2019 ("the Injunctive Relief Effective Date"), whichever is later, JJCI agrees that, for a period of 2 years, it will:
 - (a) use reasonably diligent efforts under the circumstances to modify the Challenged Product's current packaging so that the child depicted shall be at least two years of age to reflect the age of the child for which dosing instructions are provided (excluding packaging of Infants' Tylenol seen on retailer websites and/or other channels outside of JJCI's control); provided however, that if the FDA approves placing dosing instructions for children two years and younger on over-the

counter pediatric acetaminophen products, JJCI may use an image on the packaging of Infants' Tylenol to reflect the age of the child for whom dosing instructions are provided on the label of Infants' Tylenol;

- (b) add text on the appropriate JJCI controlled websites to the effect that the liquid medicine within the bottles of both Infants' Tylenol and Children's Tylenol contains the same concentration of liquid acetaminophen;
- (c) commit to educating and informing consumers, in response to inquiries and complaints to JJCI's Consumer Care Center (CCC) relating to comparisons of Infant's Tylenol and Children's Tylenol, that the liquid medicine within the bottles of both Infants' Tylenol and Children's Tylenol contains the same concentration of liquid acetaminophen; and
- (d) continue to include language on dosing charts that JJCI provides to healthcare providers to the effect that the liquid medicine within the bottles of both Infants' Tylenol and Children's Tylenol contains the same concentration of liquid acetaminophen.
- 2. Sales of Infants' Tylenol manufactured prior to the Injunctive Relief Effective Date, or during the time JJCI is using reasonably diligent efforts under the circumstances to modify its current packaging as described in ¶ III.A.(1)(a) above, shall not constitute a violation of this Stipulation.

B. <u>Monetary Relief</u>

JJCI primarily sells Infants' Tylenol to retailers, not directly to consumers, and thus has no way to identify all individual Class Members. Additionally, an individual Class Member's recovery may be too small to make traditional methods of proof economically feasible. To assure that Class Members have access to the proceeds of this settlement, a Claim Fund will be established and administered as

follows: 1 1. JJCI shall pay the Settlement Amount to the Fund Institution to 2 establish the Claim Fund for payment of Class Member claims for alleged 3 misrepresentations, for attorneys' fees and costs in an amount to be approved by the 4 Court, for a service award to the named plaintiffs in an amount to be approved by 5 6 the court, if any, and for the payment of certain notice and administration costs and expenses (including CAFA notice), as follows: 7 Not more than 30 days after the Court's order granting (a) 8 Preliminary Approval, JJCI shall pay \$516,000 to the Fund Institution to cover the 9 Settlement Administration Expenses. 10 Within 30 days after the Effective Date, JJCI shall pay the (b) 11 remaining \$5,799,000 in trust to the Fund Institution. 12 The Claim Fund shall be applied as follows in the following 2. 13 order: 14 To reimburse or pay up to, but not to exceed, \$516,000 of 15 (a) the total costs reasonably and actually incurred by the Claim Administrator in 16 connection with providing notice to and administering claims submitted by the 17 Class and to pay for Claim Fund Expenses; 18 To the payment of attorneys' fees in the amount approved (b) 19 by the Court; 20 To the payment of costs and expenses in the amount 21 (c) approved by the Court; 22 To the payment of the class representative service awards (d) 23 in an amount as approved by the Court; and 24 To distribute to Class Members who submit Approved (e) 25 Claims to the Claim Administrator as follows: 26 With Proof of Purchase:

Class Members who have a proof of purchase for all of their Infants' Tylenol

1.

27

purchases during the Class Period will be entitled to a refund of \$2.15 for every 1 fl oz. bottle of Infants' Tylenol and 2 fl oz. bottle of Infants' Tylenol for which they have a valid proof of purchase, for each and every bottle without limitation. A valid proof of purchase means a receipt or other documentation, produced by a third-party commercial source, that reasonably establishes the fact and date of purchase of Infants' Tylenol during the Class Period in the United States. Class Members will be restricted to 1 claim per household. For purposes of this Settlement and calculating cash refunds, a 2-pack (*e.g.* "club" size) of Infants' Tylenol is the same as 2 bottles.

2. Without Proof of Purchase:

Class Members who do not have a proof of purchase for all of their Infants' Tylenol purchase(s) during the Class Period will be entitled to a refund of \$2.15 for every 1 fl oz and 2 fl oz bottle of Infants' Tylenol for a maximum of 7 units, i.e., a total of up to \$15.05 per household. For purposes of this Settlement and calculating cash refunds, a 2-pack (e.g. "club" size) of Infants' Tylenol is the same as 2 bottles. Class Members will be restricted to 1 claim per household. For the sake of clarity, Class Members may not receive reimbursement for any bottle over 7 bottles unless the Class Member has a proof of purchase for every bottle, including the bottles over the 7 bottle cap.

- (f) If the total amount to be paid for eligible claims pursuant to ¶¶ III.B(2)(e) above exceeds the Claim Fund Balance after accounting for and deducting the items described in ¶¶ III.B(2)(a) through (d) above, then each Class Member's award shall be proportionately reduced on a pro rata basis.
- (g) If the Claim Fund Balance is greater than the total amount to be paid for eligible claims pursuant to ¶¶ III.B(2)(a) above, after accounting for and deducting the items described in ¶¶ III.B(2)(a) through (d) above, then each Class Member's award shall be proportionately increased on a pro rata basis up to \$6.99 for a 1 oz. bottle and \$9.99 for a 2 oz. bottle (such amount being based on the

according to the claims criteria in Exhibit A. The determination of claims shall

5

6

7

8 9

11

12

10

13 14

15

16 17

18 19

21 22

20

23 24

25

26

27 28

occur during the Claim Review Period. The decision of the Claim Administrator shall be final and binding on Defendants and all Class Members submitting Claims, and neither Defendants nor such Class Members shall have the right to challenge or appeal the Claim Administrator's decision.

- Within 30 days after conclusion of the Claim Review Period, the 7. Claim Administrator shall provide to JJCI and Class Counsel a written final accounting and Distribution Plan identifying (a) each claimant whose claim was approved, including the dollar amount of the payment awarded to each such claimant, and the dollar amount of any pro rata reduction or increase required by ¶¶ III.B.2(g); (b) each claimant whose claim was rejected; and (c) a final accounting of all administration fees and expenses incurred by the Claim Administrator. No sooner than 20 days, but not later than 45 days after delivering the Distribution Plan, the Claim Administrator shall disburse the remaining amounts in the Claim Fund according to the Distribution Plan and mail and/or email letters to all claimants with Rejected Claims explaining the rejection. In no event shall a Class Member's claim be paid until the conclusion of the Claim Review Period.
- 8. If any distribution payments delivered to Class Members are returned as non-deliverable, or are not cashed within 180 days, or are otherwise not payable, any such funds shall be disbursed as provided in ¶ III.B.2(i).

RELEASES IV.

As of the Effective Date, in consideration of the settlement obligations Α. set forth herein, any and all claims, demands, rights, causes of action, suits, petitions, complaints, damages of any kind, liabilities, debts, punitive or statutory damages, penalties, losses and issues of any kind or nature whatsoever, asserted or unasserted, known or unknown (including, but not limited to, any and all claims relating to or alleging deceptive or unfair business practices, false or misleading advertising, intentional or negligent misrepresentation, negligence, concealment, omission, unfair competition, promise without intent to perform, unsuitability,

unjust enrichment, and any and all claims or causes of action arising under or based		
upon any statute, act, ordinance, or regulation governing or applying to business		
practices generally, including, but not limited to, any and all claims relating to or		
alleging violation of Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200 et seq.; Cal. Bus. & Prof.		
Code § 17500 et seq.; and Cal. Civ. Code § 1750 et seq., arising out of or related to		
the Action, including the alleged false advertising at issue in the Action, that were		
asserted or reasonably could have been asserted in the Action by or on behalf of all		
Releasing Parties, whether individual, class, representative, legal, equitable,		
administrative, direct or indirect, or any other type or in any other capacity, against		
any Released Party ("Released Claims") shall be finally and irrevocably		
compromised, settled, released, and discharged with prejudice.		

B. Each of the Releasing Parties hereby waives any and all rights and benefits arising out of the facts alleged in the Action by virtue of the provisions of Civil Code § 1542, or any other provision in the law of the United States, or any state or territory of the United States, or principle of common law or equity that is similar, comparable or equivalent to Civil Code § 1542, with respect to this release. The Releasing Parties are aware that Civil Code § 1542 provides as follows:

A general release does not extend to claims which the creditor does not know or suspect to exist in his favor at the time of executing the release, which if known by him must have materially affected his settlement with the debtor.

The Releasing Parties expressly acknowledge that they may hereafter discover facts in addition to or different from those which they now know or believe to be true with respect to the subject matter of the Released Claims, but the Releasing Parties, upon the Effective Date, shall be deemed to have, and by operation of law shall have, fully, finally and forever settled, released, and discharged any and all Released Claims, known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, whether or not concealed or hidden, that now exist or heretofore have existed upon any theory of law or equity, including, but not limited to, Released Claims based on conduct that

is negligent, reckless, intentional, with or without malice, or a breach of any duty, law or rule, without regard to the subsequent discovery or existence of such different or additional facts. The Parties agree that the Released Claims constitute a specific and not a general release.

- C. The Releasing Parties shall be deemed to have agreed that the release set forth in ¶¶ IV.A and B (the "Release") will be and may be raised as a complete defense to and will preclude any action or proceeding based on the Released Claims. The Releasing Parties agree that any members of the current Class are barred from bringing a future claim against JJCI on the same theory alleged in the Complaint based on any purchase of Infants' Tylenol after the Class Period.
- D. As of the Effective Date, by operation of entry of judgment, the Released Parties shall be deemed to have fully released and forever discharged Plaintiffs, all other Class Members and Class Counsel from any and all claims of abuse of process, malicious prosecution, or any other claims arising out of the initiation, prosecution or resolution of the Action, including, but not limited to, claims for attorneys' fees, costs of suit or sanctions of any kind, or any claims arising out of the allocation or distribution of any of the consideration distributed pursuant to this Stipulation of Settlement.

V. CLASS CERTIFICATION FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES ONLY

Solely for the purposes of the settlement of this Action, the Parties agree to the certification of a Class of all persons who purchased, in the United States, Infants' Tylenol for personal use since October 3, 2014 to the date notice to the Class is published. Plaintiffs shall make this request for certification to the U.S. District Court for the Central District of California, currently assigned to the Honorable George H. Wu; and Class Counsel shall request the Court to enter an order, which, among other things, certifies the Class for settlement purposes, as set forth in this paragraph. Defendants contend that certification of the alleged class (other than on a settlement basis) would not be possible absent this settlement

because individual issues would predominate.

In the event this Stipulation of Settlement and the settlement proposed herein is not finally approved, or is terminated, canceled, or fails to become effective for any reason whatsoever, this class certification, to which the parties have stipulated solely for the purpose of the settlement of the Action, shall be null and void and the Parties will revert to their respective positions immediately prior to the execution of this Stipulation of Settlement. Under no circumstances may this Stipulation of Settlement be used as an admission or as evidence concerning the appropriateness of class certification in these or any other actions against Defendants.

VI. CLASS NOTICE AND COURT APPROVAL

A. <u>Notice Order; Preliminary Approval</u>

Within 30 days after the execution of the Stipulation of Settlement, the Parties shall apply to the Court for a Preliminary Approval Order substantially in the form and content of Exhibit B, conditionally certifying the Class for settlement purposes as defined in ¶ V, for preliminary approval of the settlement, for scheduling a final approval hearing, and for approving the contents and method of dissemination of the proposed Publication Notice and Class Notice Package.

B. The Notice Program

The notice program shall consist of notice by publication (the Publication Notice, attached hereto as Exhibit C) which generally describes the settlement and directs all interested parties to a detailed Class Notice available on the Settlement Website and, at the request of interested parties, by U.S. Mail. Class Counsel shall also place a link to the Settlement Website on the websites of Milstein Jackson Fairchild & Wade, LLP and Heideman Nudelman & Kalik, P.C. for a period starting from the date the Publication Notice is published, and continuing no longer than the end of the Claim Submission Period. The cost associated with the Publication Notice and Class Notice Package shall be paid from the Claim Fund as described in ¶III.B.1.(a), except those costs associated with posting and maintaining

notice on Class Counsel's Internet websites.

1. Publication Notice

Commencing at least 90 days before the Final Approval Hearing or some other date as set by the Court, the Claim Administrator shall cause to be published the Publication Notice substantially in the form and content of Exhibit C pursuant to the Notice Plan described in Exhibit D. The Notice Plan shall include dissemination of the Publication Notice translated into Spanish.

2. Class Notice Package

The Class Notice Package shall be available in electronic format on the Settlement Website and mailed as a hard copy or emailed by the Claim Administrator upon request. The Parties are not currently aware of any other litigation involving the same claims as the Action. However, should the parties become aware, within the Claim Submission Period, of pending litigation that concerns false advertising claims related to the Challenged Products, they will notify JJCI and JJCI shall direct the Claim Administrator to mail or email the Class Notice Package to counsel for the plaintiff(s) in such pending litigation.

Each Class Notice Package shall contain a Class Notice substantially in the form of Exhibit E and the Claim Form substantially in the form of Exhibit F.

3. Notice of Deadlines

Both the Publication Notice and the Class Notice shall inform Class Members of the dates by which they must file any objections, requests for exclusions, and submit a Claim Form. Class Members must file any objections, notices of intent to appear at the Final Approval Hearing, or to submit exclusion requests no later than 120 days after the date of the Preliminary Approval Order and 28 days prior to the Final Approval Hearing. Class Members will have the opportunity to submit a Claim Form during the period beginning on the date notice to the Class is first published, and continuing until 120 days after the date of the Preliminary Approval Order and 28 days prior to the Final Approval Hearing.

C. Final Approval Hearing

Not later than twenty-one (21) days prior to the deadline to object to the Settlement (described in ¶ VI(E)), Class Counsel shall move for entry of an order of a Final Settlement Order and Judgment granting final approval of this Settlement and holding this Agreement to be final, fair, reasonable and adequate, and ordering that the settlement relief be provided as set forth in ¶ III, ordering the releases as set forth in ¶ IV, and entering judgment in this case. The Parties shall request that after notice is given, the Court hold a Final Approval Hearing for the purpose of determining whether final approval of the settlement of the Action as set forth herein is fair, adequate, and reasonable to the Class Members, and enter a Final Settlement Order and Judgment dismissing the Action with prejudice substantially in the form and content of Exhibit G.

D. Requests for Exclusion

- 1. Members of the Class shall have the right to elect to exclude themselves, or "opt out," of the monetary portion of this Agreement, relinquishing their rights to cash compensation under this Stipulation and preserving their claims for damages that accrued during the Class Period, pursuant to this paragraph:
- (a) A member of the Class wishing to opt out of this Stipulation must send to the Claim Administrator by U.S. Mail a personally signed letter including his or her name and address, and providing a clear statement communicating that he or she elects to be excluded from the Class. The request for exclusion must be personally signed by the member of the Class wishing to opt out. A member of the Class cannot opt out on behalf of anyone other than himself or herself.
- (b) Any request for exclusion must be postmarked on or before the opt-out deadline specified in the Preliminary Approval Order, which shall be no later than twenty-eight (28) calendar days before the Final Approval Hearing. The date of the postmark on the return-mailing envelope shall be the

exclusive means used to determine whether a request for exclusion has been timely submitted.

- 2. Any member of the Class who does not file a timely request for exclusion as provided in the preceding \P VI(D)(1) shall be bound by all subsequent proceedings, orders, and judgments, including, but not limited to, the Release in this Action.
- 3. If the number of putative Class Members who timely request exclusion from the class in accordance with the provisions of the Preliminary Approval Order exceeds 250, Defendants shall have the right, but not the obligation, to terminate this Stipulation of Settlement or to seek appropriate modifications to this Stipulation of Settlement that adequately protect the Parties.
- 4. Copies of all Requests for Exclusion received by the Claim Administrator, together with copies of all written revocations of Requests for Exclusion received, shall be delivered to the Parties' counsel no later than 8 days after the Class Members' deadline to submit such exclusion requests, or at such other time as the Parties may mutually agree in writing.

E. Objections to Settlement

- 1. Any Class Member wishing to object to or oppose the approval of this Settlement, the motion for the service award to Plaintiffs and/or the Fee and Cost Applications shall file with the Court a written objection no later than twenty-eight (28) days before the date of the Final Approval Hearing. The objecting Class Member must send a copy of the written objection and supporting documents to the counsel listed in $\P X(M)$ of this Stipulation. The objection must contain:
 - (a) The name of this Action;
- (b) The objecting Class Member's full name, address, email address (if available) and signature (a Class Member's attorney's signature is not sufficient);
 - (c) A written statement containing all grounds for the

objection, accompanied by any legal support known to the objecting Class Member or his or her counsel and any supporting papers, evidence and/or documents;

- (d) A statement of the objecting Class Member's membership in the Class, including all information required by the Claim Form;
- (e) The identity of all counsel who represent the objecting Class Member, including any former or current counsel who may be entitled to compensation for any reason relating to the objection;
- (f) A statement confirming whether the objecting Class Member or any counsel representing the objecting Class Member intends to personally appear and/or testify at the Final Approval Hearing;
- (g) A detailed list of any other objections submitted by the objecting Class Member and/or his/her counsel, to any class actions submitted in any court in any jurisdiction within the United States in the previous five (5) years. If the Class Member or his/her counsel has not objected to any other class action settlement in any court in the United States in the previous five (5) years, he/she shall affirmatively state so in the written materials provided in connection with the written objection to this Settlement; and,
- (h) A list of persons who may be called to testify at the Final Approval Hearing in support of the objection.

Any Class Member who fails to timely file and serve a written Objection containing all of the information listed in (a) through (h) of the previous paragraph shall not be permitted to object to the Settlement and shall be foreclosed from seeking any review of the Settlement or the terms of the Agreement by any means, including but not limited to an appeal.

2. If any objection is received by the Settlement Administrator, but not filed with the Court, the Settlement Administrator shall forward the Objection and all supporting documentation to Class Counsel and Counsel for Defendants. The failure of the Class Member to file the written objection with the Court shall be

1

2

5 6

8

9

7

10

11 12

13 14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

grounds for striking and/or overruling the objection, even if the objection is submitted to the Settlement Administrator.

- 3. A Class Member who objects to the settlement may also submit a Claim Form on or before the deadline to do so, which shall be processed in the same way as all other Claim Forms. A Class Member shall not be entitled to an extension to the deadline to submit a Claim Form merely because the Class Member has also submitted an objection.
- 4. Class Counsel will file with the Court his briefs in support of Final Approval, the requested service awards for Plaintiffs and an application for attorneys' fees and costs no later than twenty-one (21) days before the deadline for Class Members to object to the Settlement.
- 5. Class Counsel and/or Defendants have the right, but not the obligation, to respond to any objection no later than seven (7) days prior to the Final Approval Hearing. The party so responding shall file a copy of the response with the Court, and shall serve a copy, by regular mail, hand or overnight delivery, to the objecting member of the Class or to the individually-hired attorney for the objecting member of the Settlement Class; to Class Counsel; and to Defendants' Counsel.

F. Parties' Duty to Defend

From the date of execution of this Stipulation, the Parties, via Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel, shall take all reasonable steps to defend the terms of this Stipulation as fair, reasonable, and adequate, shall defend the proposed Class as meeting the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 as applied to proposed settlement class, and shall defend the notice program set forth in the Stipulation as meeting the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 and giving the best and most reasonable notice practicable under the circumstances.

VII. CONDITIONS; TERMINATION

This Settlement shall become final on the first date after which all of Α.

28

the following events and conditions have been met or have occurred (the "Effective

Class Members to make an objection to the Settlement, Class Counsel shall make,

5

3

8 9

10 11

12 13

15

16

14

17 18

19 20

21

23

24

22

25

26

27 28

an application for an award of attorneys' fees and expenses. Class Counsel acknowledges that the amount of attorneys' fees and expenses remains in the discretion of the Court.

- 3. In the application described in ¶VIII(A)(2), Class Counsel will seek an award of attorneys' fees in an amount not to exceed \$2,083,950.
- 4. In the application described in \P VIII(A)(2), Class Counsel will seek reimbursement of litigation costs and expenses, estimated to be approximately \$385,000 This amount includes the cost of the class notice disseminated at the time the California class was certified, as described in § II(D) above, but does not include the Settlement Administration Expenses. The Claims Administrator shall pay from the Claim Fund the award of Class Counsels' fees and expenses within 10 days after the Effective Date.
- 5. In the event the amount of the attorney's fees requested is decreased or denied by the Court, such denial or decrease in the requested fees shall have no effect on this Stipulation and shall not invalidate the settlement agreed to herein.
- 6. Class Counsel, in their sole discretion, shall allocate and distribute the award of attorneys' fees and expenses among Class Counsel. In the event that any Class Members object to any aspect of this Stipulation of Settlement, JJCI shall under no circumstances be obligated or required to pay attorneys' fees or costs claimed by or associated with such objectors (if any).

B. Class Representative Awards

Defendants agree not to oppose an application for class representative service awards to be paid out of the Claim Fund to Plaintiffs in an amount not to exceed \$4,000 for Plaintiff Alfandary and \$4,000 for Plaintiff Elkies. Such awards shall be paid within 30 days after the Effective Date or within 30 days after the issuance of an order awarding such amount, whichever is later. In the event that a Class Member appeals the award of attorneys' fees and costs, or the class representative

service awards, Defendants shall not take a position contrary to this Stipulation.

C. Claim Administration Costs and Costs of Class Notice

The Settlement Administration Expenses shall be paid from the Claim Fund as described in ¶III.

IX. COVENANTS AND WARRANTIES

A. Authority to Enter Agreement

Plaintiffs and Defendants each covenant and warrant that they have the full power and authority to enter into this Stipulation of Settlement and to carry out its terms, and that they have not previously assigned, sold, or otherwise pledged or encumbered any right, title or interest in the claims released herein or their right, power and authority to enter into this Stipulation of Settlement. Any person signing this Stipulation of Settlement on behalf of any other person or entity represents and warrants that he or she has full power and authority to do so and that said other person or entity is bound hereby.

B. Represented by Counsel

In entering into this Stipulation of Settlement, the Parties represent they have relied upon the advice of attorneys, who are the attorneys of their own choice, concerning the legal consequences of this Stipulation of Settlement; that the terms of this Stipulation of Settlement have been explained to them by their attorneys; and that the terms of this Stipulation of Settlement are fully understood and voluntarily accepted by the Parties.

C. No Other Actions

As of the date of executing this Stipulation, Plaintiffs and Class Counsel represent and warrant that they are not aware of any action or potential action other than the Action that (1) raises allegations similar to those asserted in the Action, and (2) is pending or is expected to be filed in any forum by any person or entity against Defendants. Until the Effective Date, Plaintiffs and Class Counsel shall have a continuing duty to notify Defendants if Plaintiffs or Class Counsel become

aware of any such action.

X. MISCELLANEOUS

A. Governing Law

The interpretation and construction of this Stipulation of Settlement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California.

B. <u>Counterparts</u>

This Stipulation of Settlement may be executed in counterparts. All counterparts so executed shall constitute one agreement binding on all of the Parties hereto, notwithstanding that all Parties are not signatories to the original or the same counterpart.

C. <u>No Drafting Party</u>

Any statute or rule of construction that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting party shall not be employed in the interpretation of this Stipulation of Settlement, and the Parties agree that the drafting of this Stipulation has been a mutual undertaking.

D. <u>Entire Agreement</u>

All agreements, covenants, representations and warranties, express or implied, written or oral, of the Parties hereto concerning the subject matter hereof are contained in this Stipulation of Settlement and the exhibits hereto. Any and all prior or contemporaneous conversations, negotiations, drafts, terms sheets, possible or alleged agreements, covenants, representations and warranties concerning the subject matter of this Stipulation of Settlement are waived, merged herein and superseded hereby.

E. Retained Jurisdiction

The Court shall retain jurisdiction with respect to the implementation and enforcement of the terms of this Stipulation, and all Parties hereto submit to the jurisdiction of the Court for purposes of implementing and enforcing the settlement embodied in this Stipulation.

F. <u>Cooperation</u>

Each of the Parties hereto shall execute such additional pleadings and other documents and take such additional actions as are reasonably necessary to effectuate the purposes of this Stipulation of Settlement.

G. Amendments in Writing

This Stipulation of Settlement may only be amended in writing signed by Class Counsel and Defendant's Counsel.

H. Binding Effect; Successors and Assigns

This Stipulation of Settlement shall inure to the benefit of, and shall be binding upon, the Parties hereto as well as the legal successors and assigns of the Parties hereto and each of them.

I. <u>Construction</u>

As used in this Stipulation of Settlement, the terms "herein" and "hereof' shall refer to this Stipulation in its entirety, including all exhibits and attachments, and not limited to any specific sections. Whenever appropriate in this Stipulation of Settlement, the singular shall be deemed to refer to the plural, and the plural to the singular, and pronouns of any gender shall be deemed to include both genders.

J. Waiver in Writing

No waiver of any right under this Stipulation of Settlement shall be valid unless in writing.

K. Computation of Time

All time periods set forth herein shall be computed in business days, if seven days or fewer, and calendar days, if eight days or more, unless otherwise expressly provided. In computing any period of time prescribed or allowed by this Stipulation or by order of the Court, the day of the act, event or default from which the designated period of time begins to run shall not be included. The last day of the period so computed shall be included, unless it is a Saturday, a Sunday, or a legal or court holiday, or, when the act to be done is the filing of a paper in Court, a

1	day in which weather or other conditions have made the office of the clerk of the
2	Court inaccessible, in which event the period shall run until the end of the next day
3	as not one of the aforementioned days. As used in this subsection, "legal or court
4	holiday" includes New Year's Day, Martin Luther King Day, Presidents' Day,
5	Memorial Day, Independence Day, Labor Day, Columbus Day, Veterans Day,
6	Thanksgiving Day, Christmas Day, and any other day appointed as a holiday by the
7	President or the Congress of the United States or by the State of California.
8	L. <u>No Admission of Liability</u>
9	Each of the Parties understands and agrees that he, she or it has entered into
10	this Stipulation of Settlement for purpose of purchasing peace and preventing the
11	risks and costs of any further litigation or dispute. This settlement involves
12	disputed claims; specifically, Defendants deny any wrongdoing, and the Parties
13	understand and agree that neither this Stipulation of Settlement, nor the fact of this
14	settlement, may be used as evidence or admission of any wrongdoing by
15	Defendants.
16	M. <u>Notice</u>
17	Any notice to the Parties required by this Stipulation of Settlement shall be
18	given in writing by first-class U.S. Mail and e-mail to:
19	For Plaintiff:
20	Noel J. Nudelman
21	Tracy Reichman Kalik Heideman Nudelman & Kalik, PC 1146 10th Street NW, Fifth Floor
22	Heideman Nudelman & Kalik, PC 1146 19th Street, NW, Fifth Floor Washington, DC 20036 njnudelman@hnklaw.com trkalik@hnklaw.com
23	trkalik@hnklaw.com
24	For Defendants:
25	Matthew D. Powers
26	O'Melveny & Myers LLP Two Embarcadero Center 28th Floor
27	O'Melveny & Myers LLP Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 984-8700
28	mpowers@omm.com

Case	2:17-cv-07320-GW-JEM Docume	ent 181-1 Filed 06/22/20 Page 31 of 74 Page ID #:8025		
		#. 0023		
1	Joe O'Conn	or % Margar LLD		
2	O'Melveny & Myers LLP 400 South Hope Street Los Angeles, California 90071-2899 Telephone: 1 (213) 430-8365			
3	Los Angeles, California 900/1-2899 Telephone: 1 (213) 430-8365			
4	joconnor@omm.cóm			
5	IN WITNESS WHEREO	OF, the parties hereto have executed this Stipulation		
6	of Settlement as of the dates se	t forth below.		
7	DATED: 10/17/2019	/s/		
8		DANIELLE ALFANDARY		
9				
10				
11	DATED:	/s/		
12		RONY ELKIES		
13				
14				
15	DATED:	JOHNSON & JOHNSON CONSUMER INC.		
16		<u>/s/</u>		
17		BY:		
18		TITLE:		
19				
20	DATED:	JOHNSON & JOHNSON SERVICES, INC.		
21		<u>/s/</u>		
22		BY:		
23		TITLE:		
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

Case 2:17-cv-07320-GW-JEM Document 181-1 Filed 06/22/20 Page 32 of 74 Page ID

			#:8027	
1 2 3	DATED:		MILSTEIN JACKSON FAIRCHILD & WADE, LLP GILLIAN L. WADE /s/ GILLIAN L. WADE	
5			10250 Constellation Blvd., Ste. 1400 Los Angeles, CA 90067 Telephone: (310) 396-9600	
6 7 8 9		10/18/19	HEIDEMAN NUDELMAN & KALIK, P.C. NOEL J. NUDELMAN /s/ NOEL J. NUDELMAN	
10 11			1146 19th Street, NW 5th Floor Washington, DC 20036 Telephone: (202)463-1818	
12			Attorneys for Plaintiff	
13	DATED:		O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP MATTHEW D. POWERS	
14			/s/	
15			MATTHEW D. POWERS	
16 17			Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 984-8700	
18			Attorneys for Defendants	
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				
				CLASS ACTION

-		
	A	*
1 2	DATED:	MILSTEIN JACKSON FAIRCHILD & WADE, LLP GILLIAN L. WADE
3		/s/
4		GILLIAN L. WADE
5		10250 Constellation Blvd., Ste. 1400 Los Angeles, CA 90067 Telephone: (310) 396-9600
6		
7		HEIDEMAN NUDELMAN & KALIK, P.C. NOEL J. NUDELMAN
8		/s/
9		NOEL J. NUDELMAN
10		1146 19th Street, NW 5th Floor Washington, DC 20036 Telephone: (202)463-1818
11		Telephone: (202)463-1818
12	*	Attorneys for Plaintiff
13	DATED : 10/18/19	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP MATTHEW D. POWERS
14 15		MATTHEW D. POWERS
16	1 1	Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor
17		Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 984-8700
18		Attorneys for Defendants
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	1	