IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF JACKSON COUNTY, MISSOURI AT INDEPENDENCE

| JOANNE MILLER, on behalf of herself |) | |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------------|
| And all others similarly situated, |) | |
| |) | |
| Plaintiff, |) | |
| |) Case No. 1616-CV | 06264 |
| v. |) | FILED |
| |) Division No. 12 | FILED |
| TELEBRANDS CORP., |) | DIVISION 12 |
| |) | 01-Jun-2017 10:58 |
| Defendant. |) | CIRCUIT COURT OF JACKSON COUNTY, MO |
| ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR | | BY Madison Pears |

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

This matter comes before the Court on Plaintiff Joanne Miller's ("Plaintiff's") Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement. Having reviewed and considered Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and the Suggestions in Support filed contemporaneously with the Motion, and having also reviewed the parties' Settlement Agreement (the "Agreement") and the proposed class settlement notices and proposed notice plan, the Court finds that the Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement should be **GRANTED**.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement is hereby **GRANTED**.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- 1. Preliminary Approval of the Settlement and Certification of the Settlement Class.
- a. This Order incorporates herein, and makes a part hereof, the Agreement, its definitions, and its Exhibits thereto. Unless otherwise provided herein, the terms defined in the Agreement shall have the same meanings herein.

b. Based on the Court's examination of the record, the Court has made a preliminary determination that there is probable cause to find that the Settlement is fair, reasonable, adequate, and in the best interests of the Settlement Class under Missouri Rule of Civil Procedure 52.08 and applicable case law. In evaluating the fairness of the Settlement, the Court has considered: (1) the absence of fraud or collusion behind the Settlement; (2) the complexity, expense, and likely duration of the action; (3) the stage of the proceedings and the amount of discovery completed; (4) the probability of Plaintiff's success on the merits; (5) the range of possible recovery; and (6) the opinions of Plaintiff's Counsel and Plaintiff. *See State ex rel. Byrd v. Chadwick*, 956 S.W.2d 369, 378 n.6 (Mo. Ct. App. 1997).

In particular, the Court preliminarily finds that: (a) the Settlement is not the product of any fraud or collusion, but rather resulted from arm's-length negotiations between adverse parties represented by experienced counsel and supervised by an experienced mediator; (b) the action is sufficiently complex, would be expensive to litigate, and would take sufficiently long to reach a judgment on the merits that the Settlement should be approved; (c) the Settlement was agreed to only after Plaintiff's counsel conducted sufficient research and discovery to effectively evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of Plaintiff's claims; (d) Plaintiff's probability of success on the merits is uncertain; (e) the Settlement benefits are within the range of possible recovery; (f) Plaintiff's counsel and Plaintiff have concluded that the Settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate; and (g) the Settlement is sufficiently fair, reasonable, and adequate to warrant sending notice of the Settlement to the Settlement Class. Having considered the essential terms of the Settlement under the standards for preliminary approval of settlements recommended in the relevant jurisprudence, the Court preliminarily approves the Settlement and finds that those Settlement Class Members whose claims would be settled, compromised, dismissed, and/or

released pursuant to the Settlement should be given notice and an opportunity to be heard regarding final approval of the Settlement and other related matters.

c. The Court preliminarily finds that the proposed Settlement Class meets all of the applicable requirements under Missouri Rule 52.08(a) and (b)(3). This Court hereby certifies the following Class for settlement purposes only:

All consumers who, at any time from January 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016 purchased Amish Secret Handmade Wood Polish in the State of Missouri for personal, household or family purposes. Excluded from the Class are (1) Defendant, subsidiaries and affiliates of Defendant, directors and officers of Defendant and members of their immediate families; (2) federal, state, and local governmental entities; and (3) any judicial officers presiding over this action, their judicial staff, and members of their immediate families.

- d. The Class Representative, Joanne M. Miller, is conditionally appointed as representative of the Settlement Class, and Plaintiff's counsel, Shank & Moore, LLC, is conditionally appointed as Class Counsel.
- e. Entry of this Order is without prejudice to the rights of: (a) Defendant Telebrands Corporation ("Telebrands") to oppose certification in the Action, and seek decertification or modification of the Settlement Class as certified, should the settlement not be approved or implemented for any reason; or (b) the Parties to terminate the Agreement as provided in the Agreement.
- 2. Approval of Class Notice and Method of Dissemination and Appointment of Settlement Administrator. Plaintiff has presented to the Court proposed forms of class settlement notices, including long form notice and short form notice, which are attached as Exhibits B and C respectively to the Settlement Agreement. The Court finds that these class settlement notices are reasonably calculated under the circumstances to apprise interested individuals of the Settlement and afford them the opportunity to exercise all options available to them with respect to it. The class settlement notices fairly and adequately: (a) describe the terms and effect of the

Settlement; (b) notify the Settlement Class that Plaintiff's counsel will seek reimbursement of litigation expenses, an award of attorneys' fees, and a case contribution award for the Plaintiff; (c) notify the Settlement Class of the time and place of the final approval hearing; (d) advise the Settlement Class that the Court will exclude all members who so request by a specified date and describe the process for requesting exclusion; (e) advise the Settlement Class that a judgment in the case, whether favorable or not, will bind all class members who do not properly request exclusion; and (f) advise the Settlement Class that members who do not request exclusion may, if so desired, file objections to the Settlement by a specified date through a specified process for objecting to the Settlement, and enter an appearance in the case through counsel. For these reasons, the Court approves the proposed class settlement notices in form and content.

Plaintiff has proposed a plan, as described in Exhibit D to the Settlement Agreement, to disseminate the settlement notices to the Settlement Class through a direct email and mail campaign and to publish notice in the *Kansas City Star*, the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, and the *Springfield News-Leader*. Each notice advises the Settlement Class Members that they may contact the Claims Administrator to obtain more information concerning the class action and the Settlement. The notice plan also incorporates the reasonable use of Internet banner notices to be placed on the internet, targeted to members of the Settlement Class, and a settlement website on which members of the Settlement Class may obtain or request additional information or copies of settlement documents, including Claim Forms and the Settlement Agreement. The Court finds that this method of dissemination provides the best notice practicable under the circumstances, and therefore approves the proposed notice plan.

The Court hereby appoints Digital Settlement Group ("DSG") as the settlement and claims administrator ("Claims Administrator") in the case for purposes of disseminating the

settlement notices and managing the claims process to follow. Thirty (30) days after the date of this Order (the "Notice Date"), DSG shall cause the direct email and mail notices to be mailed to the last known email or postal address of each Settlement Class member who can be identified in Defendant's records by reasonable effort. Within thirty (30) days after the date of this Order, DSG shall cause publication notice to be published in the *Kansas City Star*, the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, and the *Springfield News-Leader*, cause the internet notices to be placed, and make available the settlement website. The long form Notice substantially in the Form of Exhibit B to the Settlement Agreement shall be available on the settlement website and shall be provided to any Settlement Class Member who requests a copy.

3. Exclusion from the Settlement. Any member of the Settlement Class who wishes to be excluded ("Opt-Out") from the Settlement must submit a written Opt-Out request to DSG as directed in the detailed settlement notice, postmarked on or before August 15, 2017, which is forty-five (45) days after the Notice Date. In order to be valid, each Opt-Out request must include the legal name, address, telephone number and personal signature of the individual requesting exclusion, and a clear and plain statement that the individual wishes to be excluded from the lawsuit, Joanne Miller v. Telebrands Corp., Case No. 1616-CV06264. Opt-Out requests must be mailed to the Claims Administrator, DSG, as directed in the long form Notice. Members of the Settlement Class who request exclusion (a) will not participate in any distribution of the Settlement Fund and will not receive a settlement payment; (b) will not be bound by the terms of the Settlement Agreement or any judgment entered in this matter, including the releases provided therein, and will retain any right to file their own lawsuit(s) concerning the claims in this matter; and (c) will not be able to object to the Settlement. Each member of the Settlement Class who does not properly request to Opt-Out from the Settlement

Class by mailing an Opt-Out request postmarked by <u>August 15</u>, 2017 (forty-five (45) days after the Notice Date) will remain a member of the Settlement Class and will bound by the terms of the Settlement Agreement and any judgment entered in this matter, including the releases provided therein.

- 4. Claim Forms. In order to be eligible to share in the distribution of the Settlement Fund, class members must complete and timely submit a Claim Form, which shall be published on the class settlement website, included with the full notice upon request, and available from the Claims Administrator. All Claim Forms must be submitted to the settlement administrator as directed in the Claim Form, postmarked no later than August 30, 2017, sixty (60) days after the Notice Date. Any claims submitted to the Claims Administrator thereafter shall be forever barred. However, the Claims Administrator may, in its discretion, permit a Settlement Class Member who makes a timely Claim to remedy deficiencies in such Settlement Class Member's Claim Form or related documentation. Any class member who fails to submit a valid, timely Claim Form shall be forever barred from receiving any distribution from the Settlement Fund or payment pursuant to the Settlement Agreement, but shall in all other respects be bound by all of the terms of the Settlement Agreement and any judgment entered in this matter, including the releases provided therein. DSG shall cause the Claim Form (with such nonsubstantive modifications thereto as may be agreed upon by the parties) to be available to the Settlement Class via the settlement website or by email or mail upon request. Any Claim Form submitted by a class member will not bar that class member's ability to object to the Settlement or any aspect thereof.
 - 5. <u>Objections to the Settlement</u>. Any member of the Settlement Class who wishes to object to the fairness, reasonableness, or adequacy of the Settlement, to any term of the

Settlement, or to the proposed requests for litigation expenses, attorneys' fees, and/or case contribution award, may file an objection to that effect. A valid and proper objection must include: (a) the legal name, address, telephone number and personal signature of the objector; (b) a clear reference that the objection is made with respect to the Settlement in the case of *Joanne Miller v. Telebrands Corp.*, Case No. 1616-CV10559; (c) information sufficient to demonstrate membership in the Class (including the approximate date the objector purchased Amish Secret Handmade Wood Polish, the store or other seller from which the objector purchased Amish Secret Handmade Wood Polish, and the location in Missouri where the purchase occurred); (d) a statement of the specific grounds for objection asserted, along with any legal support, papers, briefs or evidence that such objector wishes to bring the Court's attention; and (e) whether the objector intends to appear at the Fairness Hearing, either in person or through counsel. Objections must be mailed to all of the following:

To the Court:

Clerk of the Court Circuit Court of Jackson County Independence Courthouse 308 West Kansas Street, 2nd Floor Independence, Missouri 64050

To Plaintiff's Counsel:

Christopher S. Shank
David L. Heinemann
SHANK & MOORE, LLC
1968 Shawnee Mission Parkway, Suite 100
Mission Woods, Kansas 66205

To Counsel for Defendant:

Natalie J. Kussart Sandberg Phoenix & von Gontard, P.C. 600 Washington Ave., 15th Floor St. Louis, MO 63101

All objections must be filed with the Court and received by parties' counsel on or before **August 15**, **2017**, which is forty-five (45) days after the Notice Date. If the objector retains an attorney to represent him or her for the purposes of making an objection, the attorney must formally enter his or her appearance in the case on or before **August 22**, **2017**, which is fifty-two (52) days after the Notice Date.

Any member of the Settlement Class who does not timely file and serve a valid written objection complying with the terms of this Order shall be deemed to have waived all objections to the Settlement and shall be foreclosed from raising any objection at the final approval hearing. The Parties may file any desired response to any objection that is made, up and until seven (7) days before the Final Approval Hearing.

6. Final Approval of the Settlement. A hearing is scheduled for October 13, 2017 at 1:30 p.m, which is at least 75 days after the Notice Date. The hearing shall be held in Division 12 of the Circuit Court of Jackson County, Missouri, in the courtroom of the Honorable Jennifer M. Phillips, Eastern Jackson County Courthouse, 308 W. Kansas, Independence, Missouri, 64050. At the hearing the Court will determine, among other things: (a) whether the Settlement merits final approval as fair, reasonable, and adequate; (b) whether this action should be dismissed with prejudice and whether judgment should be entered pursuant to the terms of the Settlement Agreement; (c) whether the settlement notice to the Settlement Class was sufficient under the circumstances; (d) whether Plaintiff's counsel adequately represented the Settlement Class for purposes of entering into and implementing the Settlement; (e) whether the applications for an

award of litigation expenses and attorneys' fees to Plaintiff's counsel and for an incentive award to the Class Representative are fair and reasonable and should be approved; and (f) whether the Court shall enter a Final Approval Order (i) providing that the Court retains jurisdiction for enforcement of the Released Claims, (ii) directing distribution of the Settlement funds in accordance with the Settlement Agreement, and (iii) entering the Release and Injunction.

On or before October 6, 2017, which is seven (7) days prior to the Final Approval hearing, Plaintiff's counsel shall file all motions associated with the final approval hearing, including a motion for final approval of the Settlement and applications for awards of litigation expenses and attorneys' fees and an incentive award for the Class Representative. The Claims Administrator also shall post a copy of these motions on the class settlement website and shall provide copies to any class member who requests them.

Any objector who files and serves a timely, valid objection may also appear at the final approval hearing, either in person or through qualified counsel retained at the objector's expense. Objectors and their attorneys intending to appear at the final approval hearing must effect filing and service of a notice of intention to appear setting forth the name, address, and telephone number of the objector and the objector's attorney, if applicable. The notice of intention to appear must be filed with the Court and served on counsel for the parties at the respective addresses listed in Section 5, above, and must be accomplished on or before **August 15**, **2017**, which is forty-five (45) days after the Notice Date. Any objector or attorney who does not timely file and serve a notice of intention to appear shall not be permitted to appear at the final approval hearing.

The Court reserves the right to approve the Settlement at or after the Final Approval Hearing with such modification(s) as may be consented to by the Parties to the Agreement and without further notice to the Settlement Class and Defendant.

- 7. <u>Termination of the Settlement</u>. This Order shall become null and void, *ab initio*, and shall be without prejudice to the rights of the parties, all of whom shall be restored to their respective positions as of March 10, 2017, if the Settlement is terminated in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement.
- 8. Use of Order. This Order is not admissible as evidence for any purpose against Defendant in any pending or future litigation involving any of the parties. This Order shall not be construed or used as an admission, concession, or declaration by or against Defendant of any fault, wrongdoing, breach, or liability, and Defendant specifically denies any such fault, wrongdoing, breach, and liability. This Order shall not be construed or used as an admission, concession, or declaration by or against Plaintiff or the Settlement Class that their claims lack merit or that the relief requested in this action is inappropriate, improper, or unavailable. This Order shall not be construed or used as an admission, concession, declaration, or waiver by any party of any arguments, defenses, or claims that may exist in the event that the Settlement is terminated. Moreover, the Settlement and any proceedings conducted pursuant to the Settlement are for settlement purposes only. Neither the fact of, nor any provision contained in, the Settlement or the documents submitted in conjunction with the Settlement, nor any actions taken thereunder shall be construed as, offered into evidence as, received in evidence as, and/or deemed to be evidence of a presumption, concession, or admission of any kind as to the truth of any fact alleged or validity of any legal argument that has been, could have been, or might in the future be asserted.

9. <u>Stay.</u> Because the Settlement entered into by the parties has been preliminarily approved by this Court, all proceedings in this action, other than those necessary to administer and evaluate the Settlement pursuant to Rule 52.08, are stayed.

10. Other Provisions.

- a. No discovery with regard to the Settlement or Agreement shall be permitted as to any of the Parties to the Agreement other than as may be directed by the Court upon a proper showing by the party seeking such discovery by motion properly noticed and served in accordance with the applicable rules of this Court.
- b. Any information received by the Claims Administrator in connection with this Settlement that pertains to a particular Member of the Settlement Class shall be confidential and shall not be disclosed by the Claims Administrator to any other Settlement Class Member or their counsel.
- c. Defendant may communicate with Settlement Class Members regarding the provisions of this Agreement, so long as such communications are not inconsistent with Class Notice or other agreed upon communications concerning the Agreement. Defendant may refer Settlement Class Members to the Claims Administrator and the settlement website. Defendant will not discourage the filing of any claims allowed under Section II of the Settlement Agreement. In addition, Defendant may continue to communicate with its customers, business contacts, and members of the public in the ordinary course of business without need to submit the communication to the Court for approval.
- d. The Court may enter its Order and Judgment approving the Settlement and dismissing the Action on the merits and with prejudice regardless of whether it has approved the plan of distribution or awarded attorneys' fees and expenses.

e. The Court may alter the time or the date of the Final Approval Hearing without further notice to the Members of the Settlement Class, provided that the time or the date of the Final Approval Hearing shall not be set at a time or date earlier than the time and date set forth in Paragraph 6 above, and retains jurisdiction to consider all further applications arising out of or connected with the proposed Settlement. The Court may approve the Settlement, with such modifications as may be agreed to by the Settling Parties, if appropriate, without further notice to the Settlement Class.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

| 01-Jun-2017 | mifr M. Phillippr |
|-------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| Date | The Honorable Jennifer M. Phillips, Circuit Judge |
| | Division 12 |

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

It is hereby certified that a copy of the foregoing was sent via the E-Filing System this <u>1st</u> day of <u>June</u>, 2017, to the following:

CHRISTOPHER S. SHANK DAVID LEE HEINEMANN STEPHEN JAMES MOORE MARY ANNE MELLOW NATALIE JEAN KUSSART MEGHAN E. LEWIS

