

**U.S. District Court
Eastern District of New York (Brooklyn)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-05828-MKB-VMS**

Hall v. Welch Foods, Inc., et al
Assigned to: Judge Margo K. Brodie
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon
Case in other court: New Jersey, 3:17-cv-03997
Cause: 28:1441 Notice of Removal

Date Filed: 10/05/2017
Date Terminated: 06/12/2018
Jury Demand: Both
Nature of Suit: 195 Contract Product Liability
Jurisdiction: Diversity

Plaintiff

Lauren Hall
*on behalf of herself and others similarly
situated*

represented by **Joshua Scott Bauchner**
Ansell Grimm & Aaron, P.C.
365 Rifle Camp Road
Woodland Park, NJ 07424
973-247-9199
Fax: 973-247-9199
Email: jb@ansellgrimm.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael H Ansell
Ansell Grimm & Aaron
365 Rifle Camp Road
Woodland Park, NJ 07424
973-247-9000
Fax: 973-247-9199
Email: mha@ansellgrimm.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Clark A. Binkley
The Richman Law Group
81 Prospect Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
(212)687-8291
Fax: (718)228-8522
Email: cbinkley@richmanlawgroup.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kim Richman
The Richman Law Group
81 Prospect Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
BROOKLYN
718-705-4579
Email: krichman@richmanlawgroup.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Welch Foods, Inc.
a Cooperative

represented by **David R. King**
Herrick, Feinstein LLP
One Gateway Center
Newark, NJ 07102
973-274-2000
Fax: 973-274-2500
Email: dking@herrick.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah Kelman
Herrick, Feinstein LLP
2 Park Avenue
NY, NY 10016
212-542-1400
Email: lkelman@herrick.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel S. Silverman
Venable LLP
2049 Century Park East
Suite 2100
Los Angeles, CA 90067
310-229-9900
Fax: 310-229-9901
Email: dsilverman@venable.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elise Margaret Gabriel
Venable LLP
1270 Avenue of the Americas
24th floor
New York, NY 10020
212-307-5500
Email: emgabriel@venable.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew Gurvitz
Venable LLP
2049 Century Park East
Suite 2100
Los Angeles, CA 90067
310-229-9900
Fax: 310-229-9901
Email: mgurvitz@venable.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ronald Jay Levine
Herrick, Feinstein LLP
One Gateway Center

Newark, NJ 07102
 973-274-2000
 Email: rlevine@herrick.com
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc.

represented by **David R. King**
 (See above for address)
 LEAD ATTORNEY
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah Kelman
 (See above for address)
 LEAD ATTORNEY
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel S. Silverman
 (See above for address)
 PRO HAC VICE
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elise Margaret Gabriel
 (See above for address)
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew Gurvitz
 (See above for address)
 PRO HAC VICE
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ronald Jay Levine
 (See above for address)
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/05/2017	<u>1</u>	NOTICE OF REMOVAL by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE from Superior Court of Monmouth County, case number MON-L-1334-17. (Filing and Admin fee \$ 400 receipt number 0312-7880564), filed by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Summons and Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Yales Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Letter to Court, # <u>4</u> Certification Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 11.2, # <u>5</u> Certification of Non-Arbitrability Pursuant to Rule 201.1, # <u>6</u> Statement Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 10.1(a), # <u>7</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>8</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/05/2017	<u>2</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by RONALD J. LEVINE on behalf of THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/05/2017	<u>3</u>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE identifying National Grape Co-Operative Association, Inc. as Corporate Parent.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD)

		[Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/05/2017	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by DAVID R. KING on behalf of THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(KING, DAVID) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/05/2017	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by LEAH KELMAN on behalf of THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(KELMAN, LEAH) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/06/2017	<u>1</u>	Judge Anne E. Thompson and Magistrate Judge Lois H. Goodman added. (jjc) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/06/2017)
06/09/2017	<u>6</u>	ANSWER to Complaint with JURY DEMAND by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/09/2017)
06/09/2017	<u>7</u>	MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief in Support of Motion to Transfer, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Matthew M. Gurvitz in Support of Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A to Declaration of Matthew M. Gurvitz, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>5</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/09/2017)
06/12/2017	<u>1</u>	Set Deadlines as to <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York . Motion set for 7/3/2017 before Judge Anne E. Thompson. Unless otherwise directed by the Court, this motion will be decided on the papers and no appearances are required. Note that this is an automatically generated message from the Clerk`s Office and does not supersede any previous or subsequent orders from the Court. (mps) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/12/2017)
06/23/2017	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by MICHAEL H. ANSELL on behalf of LAUREN HALL (ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/23/2017)
06/23/2017	<u>9</u>	Letter from Michael H. Ansell, Esq. re Set/Reset Motion and R&R Deadlines/Hearings, <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York . (ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/23/2017)
06/23/2017	<u>10</u>	Letter from David R. King re <u>9</u> Letter. (KING, DAVID) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/23/2017)
06/26/2017	<u>11</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE, filed by LAUREN HALL.(ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/26/2017)
06/26/2017	<u>12</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition filed by LAUREN HALL re <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York (ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/26/2017)
06/27/2017	<u>13</u>	Letter from David R. King re <u>12</u> Memorandum in Opposition of Motion, <u>11</u> Amended Complaint. (KING, DAVID) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/27/2017)
06/27/2017	<u>14</u>	Letter from Judge Anne E. Thompson that the Defendants' <u>7</u> Motion to Transfer will be adjourned to the same motion day as Plaintiff's forthcoming Motion to Remand. Both motions will be set for the 8/7/2017 motion day. (mps) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/27/2017)
06/28/2017	<u>15</u>	Letter from Michael H. Ansell, Esq. re <u>12</u> Memorandum in Opposition of Motion, <u>13</u> Letter, <u>14</u> Letter, <u>11</u> Amended Complaint. (ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on

		10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/28/2017)
06/30/2017	<u>16</u>	MOTION to Remand by LAUREN HALL. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum of Law, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order)(ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/30/2017)
06/30/2017	<u>1</u>	Set Deadlines as to <u>16</u> MOTION to Remand , <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York . Motions set for 8/7/2017 before Judge Anne E. Thompson. Unless otherwise directed by the Court, this motion will be decided on the papers and no appearances are required. Note that this is an automatically generated message from the Clerk's Office and does not supersede any previous or subsequent orders from the Court. (mps) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 06/30/2017)
07/10/2017	<u>17</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 07/10/2017)
07/24/2017	<u>18</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition filed by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE re <u>16</u> MOTION to Remand (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Ronald J. Levine, Esq. in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Remand to State Court, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Declaration of Josh Shapiro, # <u>6</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 07/24/2017)
07/31/2017	<u>19</u>	REPLY BRIEF to Opposition to Motion filed by THE PROMOTION IN MOTION COMPANIES, INC., WELCH FOODS, INC., A COOPERATIVE re <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Ronald J. Levine, Esq. in Further Support of Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Declaration of Matthew M. Gurvitz in Further Support of Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue, # <u>7</u> Certificate of Service)(LEVINE, RONALD) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 07/31/2017)
07/31/2017	<u>20</u>	REPLY BRIEF to Opposition to Motion filed by LAUREN HALL re <u>16</u> MOTION to Remand (BAUCHNER, JOSHUA) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 07/31/2017)
08/01/2017	<u>21</u>	NOTICE by LAUREN HALL re <u>16</u> MOTION to Remand , <u>7</u> MOTION to Transfer Case to the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York <i>Request for Oral Argument</i> (ANSELL, MICHAEL) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 08/01/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>22</u>	OPINION filed. Signed by Judge Anne E. Thompson on 10/4/2017. (mps) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>23</u>	ORDER granting <u>7</u> Motion to Transfer Case to United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York; denying <u>16</u> Motion to Remand without prejudice. Signed by Judge Anne E. Thompson on 10/4/2017. (mps) [Transferred from New Jersey on 10/5/2017.] (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>24</u>	Case transferred in from District of New Jersey; Case Number 3:17-cv-03997. Original file certified copy of transfer order and docket sheet received. (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>1</u>	The case of Hall v. Welch Foods, Inc. et al , has been transferred from District of New Jersey to the Eastern District of New York. The new case number is 17cv5828 . PLEASE NOTE: if you plan to continue representing your client(s), you must be admitted to practice before this court. You must do so by applying for Pro Hac Vice or permanent admission. To apply for Pro Hac Vice admission, you must first register for an ECF login and password. Please visit the Court's website at www.nyed.uscourts.gov/attorney-admissions for guidance. Once registered, you must electronically file a Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. You must pay the required pro hac vice fee online. (Bowens, Priscilla) (Entered: 10/05/2017)

10/05/2017	<u>25</u>	In accordance with Rule 73 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Rule 73.1, the parties are notified that <i>if</i> all parties consent a United States magistrate judge of this court is available to conduct all proceedings in this civil action including a (jury or nonjury) trial and to order the entry of a final judgment. Attached to the Notice is a blank copy of the consent form that should be filled out, signed and filed electronically only if all parties wish to consent. The form may also be accessed at the following link: http://www.uscourts.gov/uscourts/FormsAndFees/Forms/AO085.pdf . You may withhold your consent without adverse substantive consequences. Do NOT return or file the consent unless all parties have signed the consent. (Bowens, Priscilla) (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>26</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Joshua Scott Bauchner on behalf of Lauren Hall (notification declined or already on case) (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/05/2017	<u>27</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Michael H Ansell on behalf of Lauren Hall (notification declined or already on case) (Ansell, Michael) (Entered: 10/05/2017)
10/11/2017	<u>28</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 16(a), I order the parties to appear for an initial discovery planning conference on, November 20, 2017, at 10:00 a.m. in Courtroom 11D South of the United States Courthouse, 225 Cadman Plaza East, Brooklyn, New York. No later than November 16, 2017, the parties must submit, by means of electronic filing on the court's ECF (Electronic Case Filing) system, a joint proposed discovery plan. Each party's counsel must be personally prepared to discuss all factual and legal issues in the case, including the possibility of settlement; otherwise, the client must attend in person as well. SEE ATTACHED ORDER. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 10/11/2017. (Guy, Alicia) (Entered: 10/11/2017)
10/12/2017	<u>29</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kim Richman on behalf of Lauren Hall (aty to be noticed) (Richman, Kim) (Entered: 10/12/2017)
10/12/2017	<u>30</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Clark A. Binkley on behalf of Lauren Hall (aty to be noticed) (Binkley, Clark) (Entered: 10/12/2017)
10/13/2017	<u>31</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Elise Margaret Gabriel on behalf of The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (aty to be noticed) (Gabriel, Elise) (Entered: 10/13/2017)
10/19/2017	<u>32</u>	MOTION to Consolidate Cases by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A – Emails Regarding Consolidation of Cases) (Gabriel, Elise) (Entered: 10/19/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>33</u>	Letter <i>CORRECTED Letter Regarding Notice of Related Case Assignment/Designation</i> by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Emails Regarding Consolidation of Cases) (Gabriel, Elise) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>I</u>	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Judge Margo K. Brodie and Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon for all further proceedings. Judge Roslynn R. Mauskopf, Magistrate Judge James Orenstein no longer assigned to case Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned Judges, located on our website . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such.. Ordered by Chief Judge Dora Lizette Irizarry on 10/20/2017. Motions referred to Vera M. Scanlon. (Davis, Kimberly) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>I</u>	ORDER granting <u>32</u> Motion to Consolidate Cases. Ordered by Judge Margo K. Brodie on 10/20/2017. (Francis–McLeish, Ogoro) (Entered: 12/13/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>I</u>	Cases associated: Create association to 1:15–cv–05405–MKB–VMS. (Piper, Francine) (Entered: 12/15/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>I</u>	

Case Consolidated. Associated Cases: 1:15-cv-05405-MKB-VMS, 1:17-cv-05828-MKB-VMS (Piper, Francine) (Entered: 12/15/2017)

12/19/2017	<u>İ</u>	STATUS REPORT ORDER: In light of the Atik and Lau stipulations of dismissal, the Hall parties are to file a status letter as to whether and how the Hall action should proceed in this District by 1/2/2018. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 12/19/2017. Associated Cases: 1:15-cv-05405-MKB-VMS, 1:17-cv-05828-MKB-VMS (Scanlon, Vera) (Entered: 12/19/2017)
01/02/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>34</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (Gabriel, Elise) (Entered: 01/02/2018)
01/09/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>35</u>	MOTION for Hearing by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (Silverman, Daniel) Modified on 1/10/2018 to add motion. (Quinlan, Krista). (Entered: 01/09/2018)
01/10/2018	<u>İ</u>	ORDER granting <u>35</u> Motion for Hearing. At the request of parties, an in person Status Conference is set for 1/23/2018 at 3:00 PM in Courtroom 13A South before Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon. Mr. Silverman may appear by telephone by calling into Chambers at (718) 613-2300. All others must appear in-person. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 1/10/2018. (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 01/10/2018)
01/10/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>36</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of <i>Daniel S. Silverman</i> Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0207-10104543. by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit in Support of Daniel S. Silverman, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Good Standing) (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 01/10/2018)
01/10/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>37</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of <i>Matthew M. Gurvitz</i> Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0207-10104586. by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit in Support of Matthew M. Gurvitz, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Good Standing) (Gurvitz, Matthew) (Entered: 01/10/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>İ</u>	ORDER granting <u>36</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice. The attorney shall register for ECF, registration is available online at the NYED's homepage. Once registered, the attorney shall file a notice of appearance and ensure that he receives electronic notification of activity in this case. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 1/11/2018. (Pearce, Jessica) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>İ</u>	ORDER granting <u>37</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice. The attorney shall register for ECF, registration is available online at the NYED's homepage. Once registered, the attorney shall file a notice of appearance and ensure that he receives electronic notification of activity in this case. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 1/11/2018. (Pearce, Jessica) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>38</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Daniel S. Silverman on behalf of The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (notification declined or already on case) (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>39</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Matthew Gurvitz on behalf of The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (notification declined or already on case) (Gurvitz, Matthew) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/23/2018	<u>İ</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon: Status Conference held on 1/23/2018 in Courtroom 13A South. Joshua Bauchner, Clark Binkley and Kim Richman appearing for Plaintiff. David King, Daniel Silverman (via telephone) and Elise Gabriel appearing for Defendants. See separate docket entry for Order issuing from this proceeding. (FTR Log #3:17-3:55.) (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 01/23/2018)
01/23/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>40</u>	

		SCHEDULING ORDER: As discussed during the 1/23/2018 conference (see attached order for additional detail and deadlines), all discovery must be completed by 7/31/2018. Fact discovery due on 5/30/2018. On or before 7/31/2018, the Parties will file a joint status report letter confirming that discovery is complete. On or before 8/31/2018, the Parties will initiate any dispositive motions in accordance with the Individual Rules of the District Judge. On or before 9/28/2018, the Parties will file their joint Proposed Pretrial Order. Counsel may continue with the previously discussed schedule as agreed on the schedule in Atik. An in person Status Conference is set for 3/15/2018 at 10:30 AM in Courtroom 13A South before Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon. Mr. Silverman may appear by telephone. Materials produced in the Atik case is considered to have been produced in the Hall case. Defendant to identify expert (other then previously identified experts) by 4/30/2018. Plaintiff report due on 5/31/2018. Defendant rebuttal due on 7/13/2018. Expert discovery due on 7/31/2018. If no new expert disclosed by 4/30/2018, class certification PMC letter is due on 6/8/2018. If expert disclosed by 4/30/2018, class certification PMC letter due on 8/6/2018. The expert schedule previously set for expert discovery is still in place. Defendants' counsel is evaluating whether counsel will make a motion to transfer back to NJ. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 1/23/2018. (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 01/23/2018)
01/29/2018	<u>41</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on January 23, 2018, before Judge SCANLON. Court Reporter/Transcriber TypeWrite Word Processing Service, Telephone number 518-581-8973. Email address: transcripts@typewp.com. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER.File redaction request using event "Redaction Request – Transcript" located under "Other Filings – Other Documents". Redaction Request due 2/19/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 3/1/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/30/2018. (Hong, Loan) (Entered: 01/29/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>41</u>	Incorrect Case/Document/Entry Information. Stipulation filed by plaintiff docketed in wrong case. Entry is deleted. (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>42</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/15/2018	<u>41</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon:Status Conference held on 3/15/2018 in Courtroom 13A South. Joshua Bauchner and Clark Binkley appearing for Plaintiff. Daniel Silverman, Elise Gabriel, David King and Ellen Horowitz appearing for Defendants. See separate docket entry for Order issuing from this proceeding. (FTR Log #10:48-11:02; 11:47-12:03; 12:38-12:44.) (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 03/15/2018)
03/15/2018	<u>43</u>	STATUS REPORT ORDER: As discussed during the 3/15/2018 conference (see attached order for additional detail and deadlines), the discovery agreements were stated on the record during the third call. As to the motion to transfer venue to NJ, Defendant letter due on 3/22/2018; Plaintiff's letter due on 3/29/2018. No reply needed. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 3/15/2018. (Quinlan, Krista) (Entered: 03/15/2018)
03/22/2018	<u>44</u>	Letter to Judge Brodie re: <i>Motion to Transfer Venue</i> by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (King, David) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>45</u>	Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>44</u> Letter from Defendants regarding <i>Motion to Transfer Venue</i> by Lauren Hall. (Ansell, Michael) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
03/28/2018	<u>46</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>45</u> Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>44</u> Letter from Defendants regarding <i>Motion to Transfer Venue</i> filed by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (King, David) (Entered: 03/28/2018)
03/28/2018	<u>45</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>45</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. Per the 3/15/18 conference, the parties are to submit letter briefs, not pre-motion conference letter(s). The motion will be decided on these submissions. Plaintiff may have until

		4/5/2018 to submit its opposition. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 3/28/2018. (Pearce, Jessica) (Entered: 03/28/2018)
04/02/2018	Ī47	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on March 15, 2018, before Judge Scanlon. Court Transcriber: TypeWrite Word Processing Service, Telephone number 518-581-8973. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. File redaction request using event "Redaction Request - Transcript" located under "Other Filings - Other Documents". Redaction Request due 4/23/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/3/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/2/2018. (Rocco, Christine) (Entered: 04/02/2018)
04/02/2018	Ī48	Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>joint letter re: unresolved discovery disputes</i> by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (King, David) (Entered: 04/02/2018)
04/03/2018	Ī49	RESPONSE to Motion re 48 Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>joint letter re: unresolved discovery disputes</i> filed by Lauren Hall. (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 04/03/2018)
04/04/2018	Ī	ORDER: By COB 4/5/18, the parties are to file their respective letters as to the possible transfer of this action to the District of New Jersey. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 4/4/2018. (Scanlon, Vera) (Entered: 04/04/2018)
04/05/2018	Ī50	Letter MOTION to Change Venue by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of David R. King in Support of Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue, # 2 Exhibit A, # 3 Exhibit B, # 4 Exhibit C, # 5 Exhibit D, # 6 Exhibit E, # 7 Exhibit F, # 8 Certificate of Service) (King, David) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	Ī	ORDER granting 48 Motion for Extension of Time to File. The discovery deadline is extended to 4/13/18. All other dates remain the same. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 4/5/2018. (Pearce, Jessica) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	Ī51	RESPONSE in Opposition re 50 Letter MOTION to Change Venue filed by Lauren Hall. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of Joshua S. Bauchner, Esq. with Exhibits A-D, # 2 Certificate of Service) (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/13/2018	Ī52	STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Discovery Status Report</i> by Lauren Hall (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E) (Ansell, Michael) (Entered: 04/13/2018)
04/19/2018	Ī53	MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery - <i>Expert Discovery</i> by Lauren Hall. (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 04/19/2018)
04/19/2018	Ī54	RESPONSE in Opposition re 53 MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery - <i>Expert Discovery</i> filed by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B) (King, David) (Entered: 04/19/2018)
04/20/2018	Ī55	MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery - <i>Expert Discovery</i> by Lauren Hall. (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 04/20/2018)
04/23/2018	Ī	ORDER granting in part and denying in part 53 Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. Plaintiff to identify additional experts by 5/30/2018. Plaintiff's report due on 7/2/2018. Plaintiff's motion at 55 is denied as moot. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 4/23/2018. (Tuffaha, Omar) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
05/31/2018	Ī56	Letter dated May 31, 2018, Regarding Case Schedule by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc. (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
06/01/2018	Ī57	Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery by Lauren Hall. (Richman, Kim) (Entered: 06/01/2018)

06/04/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>58</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>57</u> Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery filed by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D) (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 06/04/2018)
06/06/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>59</u>	REPLY in Opposition re <u>58</u> Response to Motion, <u>57</u> Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery filed by Lauren Hall. (Bauchner, Joshua) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>60</u>	REPLY in Opposition re <u>59</u> Reply in Opposition filed by The Promotion In Motion Companies, Inc., Welch Foods, Inc.. (Silverman, Daniel) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/08/2018	<u>İ</u> <u>61</u>	ORDER granting <u>50</u> Motion to Change Venue. For the reasons stated herein, the Court grants Defendants' motion. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to transfer this action to the United States District Court for the District of New Jersey in accordance with the procedures set forth in Local Civil Rule 83.1 of the Local Rules of the United States District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York. Ordered by Magistrate Judge Vera M. Scanlon on 6/8/2018. (Tuffaha, Omar) (Entered: 06/08/2018)
06/12/2018	<u>İ</u>	Case transferred to the District of New Jersey. Original file, certified copy of transfer order, and docket sheet sent. ALL FILINGS ARE TO BE MADE IN THE TRANSFER COURT, DO NOT DOCKET TO THIS CASE. (Brucella, Michelle) (Entered: 06/12/2018)