## **CUNEO GILBERT & LADUCA, LLP**

Charles J. LaDuca Katherine Van Dyck 4725 Wisconsin Avenue, NW, Suite 200 Washington, DC 20016 Tel: (202) 789-3960 Fax: (202) 789-1813 <u>charlesl@cuneolaw.com</u> kvandyck@cuneolaw.com

### THE SULTZER LAW GROUP P.C.

Jason P. Sultzer, Esq. (Bar ID #: JS4546) 85 Civic Center Plaza, Suite 104 Poughkeepsie, NY 12601 Tel: (845) 483-7100 Fax: (888) 749-7747 sultzerj@thesultzerlawgroup.com

### HALUNEN LAW

Melissa W. Wolchansky Amy E. Boyle (*admission forthcoming*) 1650 IDS Center 80 South Eight Street Minneapolis, MN 55402 Telephone: (612) 605-4098 Facsimile: (612) 605-4099 *wolchansky@halunenlaw.com boyle@halunenlaw.com* 

### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

: : : Case No. 16 CV 6981 (VB)
:
: AMENDED CLASS ACTION : COMPLAINT
: <u>JURY TRIAL DEMANDED</u> :

Defendants.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 2 of 86

Plaintiffs Tanya Mayhew, Tanveer Alibhai, and Tara Festa (hereinafter "Plaintiffs"), individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated throughout the country, by their attorneys, allege the following upon information and belief, except for those allegations pertaining to Plaintiffs, which are based on personal knowledge:

#### NATURE OF THE ACTION

1. This is a class action against Defendant KAS Direct, LLC d/b/a Babyganics and S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc. (hereinafter "Defendants"), which develop, manufacture, market, and sell a variety of baby care, sun protection, and cleaning products for babies and children, which are sold under the brand name "Babyganics," including:

- Babyganics 3x laundry detergent fragrance free,
- Babyganics 3x laundry detergent lavender,
- Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer fragrance free refill,
- Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer mandarin refill,
- Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer fragrance free,
- Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer mandarin,
- Babyganics alcohol-free hand sanitizing wipes mandarin,
- Babyganics all-purpose surface wipes fragrance free,
- Babyganics benzocaine free gel teething pods,
- Babyganics bubble bath chamomile verbena,
- Babyganics bubble bath fragrance free,
- Babyganics cold relief chest rub,
- Babyganics conditioning shampoo and body wash chamomile verbena,
- Babyganics conditioning shampoo and body wash fragrance free,

- Babyganics diaper rash cream,
- Babyganics dryer sheets lavender,
- Babyganics eczema care skin protectant cream,
- Babyganics face, hand, and baby wipes fragrance free,
- Babyganics floor cleaner concentrate fragrance free,
- Babyganics fluoride free toothpaste strawberry,
- Babyganics fluoride free toothpaste watermelon,
- Babyganics flushable wipes fragrance free,
- Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap refill citrus,
- Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap refill fragrance free,
- Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap citrus,
- Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap fragrance free,
- Babyganics foaming hand soap chamomile verbena,
- Babyganics foaming hand soap fragrance free,
- Babyganics hand and face wipes fragrance free,
- Babyganics natural insect repellent,
- Babyganics mineral-based sunscreen spray 50+ SPF,
- Babyganics mineral-based sunscreen 50+ SPF,
- Babyganics mineral-based sunscreen 50+ SPF single use tubes,
- Babyganics moisturizing daily lotion with sunscreen 15 SPF,
- Babyganics moisturizing daily lotion chamomile verbena,
- Babyganics moisturizing daily lotion fragrance free,
- Babyganics moisturizing therapy cream wash,

- Babyganics multi-surface cleaner citrus,
- Babyganics multi-surface cleaner fragrance free,
- Babyganics night time baby lotion orange blossom,
- Babyganics night time bubble bath orange blossom,
- Babyganics night time shampoo and body wash orange blossom,
- Babyganics organic lip and face balm fragrance free,
- Babyganics pure mineral sunscreen stick 50+ SPF,
- Babyganics pure mineral sunscreen 30 SPF,
- Babyganics shampoo and body wash chamomile verbena,
- Babyganics shampoo and body wash fragrance free,
- Babyganics soothing protective ointment,
- Babyganics stain and odor remover fragrance free,
- Babyganics stain eraser fragrance free,
- Babyganics toy and highchair cleaner fragrance free,
- Babyganics toy, table, and highchair wipes fragrance free,
- Babyganics tub and tile cleaner fragrance free,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers newborn,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 1,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 2,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 3,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 4,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 5,
- Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 6, and

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 5 of 86

• Babyganics vapor bubble bath

(hereinafter the "Products").

2. This action seeks to remedy the unlawful, unfair, deceptive, and misleading business practices of Defendants with respect to the marketing and sales of the Products, which are sold throughout the States of New York, California, Florida, and throughout the country.

3. Defendants chose the name "Babyganics," a name clearly evocative of the word "organic," in order to convey to consumers that the Products are organic. Many of the Products are also advertised and labeled as having "Neonourish Natural Seed Oil."

4. Defendants' marketing materials for the Products are also replete with statements that the Products are organic, and the front and back labels of some of the Products state that the Products contain organic ingredients.

5. In addition to marketing their entire product line under the trade name "Babyganics," Defendants sell sunscreens that are labeled "mineral-based" (the "Sunscreens"). In fact, these Sunscreens are not mineral sunscreens, which use physical sunscreens such as Titanium Dioxide and Zinc Oxide that sit on top of the skin to deflect and scatter UV rays away from the skin. Instead, Defendants' "mineral-based" sunscreens use a combination of physical sunscreens and chemical sunscreens, which penetrate the skin and absorb UV radiation.



#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 6 of 86

A reasonable consumer does not deem products containing chemical ingredients such as Octinoxate and Octisalate to be "mineral-based." The claim concerning this labeling is referred to herein as the Sunscreen Claim.

6. Plaintiffs and the Class reasonably believed Defendants' false and misleading representations. Defendants knew or reasonably should have known that their representations regarding the Products were false, deceptive, misleading, and unlawful under California, New York, and Florida law.

7. But for Defendants' false and misleading identification of the Products as organic, mineral-based, or natural, Plaintiffs and the Class would not have purchased the Products or paid a premium price for the Products instead of purchasing truly organic, mineral-based, or natural products available from Defendants' competitors.

8. Plaintiffs and Class Members paid a premium for the Products over comparable products that did not purport to be organic, mineral-based, or natural. Given that Plaintiffs and Class Members paid a premium for the Products based on Defendants' misrepresentations that they are "organic," "mineral-based," or "natural," Plaintiffs and Class Members suffered an injury in the amount of the purchase price and/or the premium paid.

9. Defendants' conduct violated and continues to violate New York General Business Law §§ 349 and 350, California law, including, but not limited to, California Civil Code §§ 1750 *et seq.*, California Business & Professions Code §§ 17200 *et seq.*, and California Business & Professions Code §§ 17500 *et seq.*, Florida's Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act, New York's express warranty law, the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act, and the common law. Defendants have been and continue to be unjustly enriched. Accordingly, Plaintiffs bring this

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 7 of 86

action against Defendants on behalf of themselves and Class Members who purchased the Products during the applicable statute of limitations period (the "Class Period").

#### JURISDICTION AND VENUE

10. Jurisdiction is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1332(d)(2). Plaintiff Tanya Mayhew is a citizen of the State of New York and resides in Dutchess County. Plaintiff Tanveer Alibhai is a citizen of the State of California and resides in Oakland, California. Plaintiff Festa is a citizen of the State of Florida and resides in Port St. Lucie, Florida. Defendant KAS Direct is a corporation with its principal place of business in Westbury, New York and is organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware. Defendant S.C. Johnson is a corporation with its principal place of business in and is organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware. Defendant S.C. Johnson is a corporation with its principal place of business in Racine, Wisconsin and is organized and existing under the laws of the State of the State of the State of the State of State of the State of Delaware. Defendant S.C. Johnson is a corporation with its principal place of business in Racine, Wisconsin and is organized and existing under the laws of the State of Wisconsin. Upon information and belief, the amount in controversy is in excess of \$5,000,000, exclusive of interests and costs.

11. This Court has personal jurisdiction over Defendants because Defendants conduct and transact business in the State of New York, contract to supply goods within the State of New York, and supply goods within the State of New York. Furthermore, Defendant KAS Direct's principal place of business is in the State of New York.

12. Venue is proper because Plaintiff Mayhew and many Class Members reside in the Southern District of New York, and throughout the State of New York.

#### **PARTIES**

#### **Plaintiff Mayhew**

13. Plaintiff Mayhew is an individual consumer who, at all times material hereto, was a citizen of the State of New York and a resident of Dutchess County. During the Class Period Plaintiff Mayhew purchased the Defendants' mineral-based sunscreen, mineral-based sunscreen

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 8 of 86

stick, and shampoo & body wash in approximately 2015 from her local Target in the State of New York.

14. Plaintiff Mayhew purchased the Products because she saw the labeling, advertising, the Defendants' website, and read the packaging, which represented that the Products are "Organic" and "Mineral-Based." Plaintiff Mayhew relied on Defendants' false, misleading, and deceptive representations that the Products are "Organic" and "Mineral-Based." Had Plaintiff Mayhew known the truth—that the representations she relied upon in making her purchase were false, misleading, and deceptive—she would not have purchased the Products at a premium price.

#### <u>Plaintiff Alibhai</u>

15. Plaintiff Alibhai is a citizen of the State of California and a resident of Oakland, California. She purchased Defendants' mineral-based sunscreen in approximately 2012 from ToysRUs. She also purchased bulk packages of Defendants' bubble bath, foaming bottle & dish soap, and toy & highchair cleaner in approximately 2013 from ToysRUs.

16. Plaintiff Alibhai purchased the mineral-based sunscreen because she believed that it was organic and mineral-based as represented by Defendant. Plaintiff did not discover that the sunscreen was neither organic nor mineral-based until after she applied it to her daughter's skin, at which point her daughter suffered a rash and Plaintiff Alibhai checked the ingredients listed on the back label. Had Plaintiff Alibhai known the truth—that the representations she relied upon in purchasing the mineral-based sunscreen were false, misleading, and deceptive—she would not have purchased it.

17. Plaintiff Alibhai purchased the bubble bath, foaming bottle & dish soap, and toy & highchair cleaner because she believed they were natural and organic. However, the bubble bath aggravated her daughter's eczema, and upon closer review of the ingredients lists, Plaintiff Alibhai discovered that none of the Babyganics products were organic. Plaintiff Alibhai stopped using the

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 9 of 86

products. Had she known the truth—that the representations she relied upon in purchasing the Babyganics products were false, misleading, and deceptive—she would not have purchased them.

#### **Plaintiff Festa**

18. Plaintiff Festa is a citizen of the State of Florida and a resident of Port St. Lucie, Florida. During the Class Period Plaintiff Festa purchased Defendants' shampoo, body wash, and lotion in approximately 2016 from her local BabiesRUs in the State of Florida.

19. Plaintiff Festa purchased the Products because she saw the labeling, advertising, the Defendants' website, and read the packaging, which represented that the Products are "Organic" and "Mineral-Based." Plaintiff Festa relied on Defendants' false, misleading, and deceptive representations that the Products are "Organic" and "Mineral-Based." Had Plaintiff Festa known the truth—that the representations she relied upon in making her purchase were false, misleading, and deceptive—she would not have purchased the Products at a premium price.

#### **Defendant KAS Direct, LLC**

20. Defendant KAS Direct, LLC is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware with its principal place of business in Westbury, New York. Defendant KAS Direct manufactures, markets, advertises, and distributes the Products throughout the United States. Defendant KAS Direct created and/or authorized the false, misleading, and deceptive advertisements, packaging, and labeling for the Products.

#### Defendant S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc.

21. Defendant S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc. is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Wisconsin with its principal place of business in Racine, Wisconsin. On July 1, 2016, S.C. Johnson announced that it was acquiring Defendant KAS Direct. Defendant S.C. Johnson manufactures, markets, advertises, and distributes the Products throughout the United

States. Defendant S.C. Johnson created and/or authorized the false, misleading, and deceptive advertisements, packaging, and labeling for the Products

# FACTUAL BACKGROUND

# A. Defendants deceptively use the trade name "Babyganics" to impart to consumers that their Products are organic.

22. Defendant KAS Direct applied to the United States Patent and Trademark Office ("USPTO") in March 2006 for the mark "BABYGANICS" for "all-purpose cleaners comprised of all natural ingredients that can be used in households with babies and pets." Included with its application was a specimen, which Defendant KAS Direct described as "[a] photograph of a spray bottle of Babyganics all natural and *organic* cleaner":



23. The mark was registered on January 9, 2007, and in August 2012, the USPTO granted Defendants' application to expand the "Babyganics" mark to include a much wider range

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 11 of 86

of products such a "baby wipes; diaper creams; shampoo and body wash preparations; bubble bath preparations; lip and face balms; skin moisturizing lotions; saline nasal sprays; toothpaste; teething gels; insect sprays; [and] non-medicated skin care preparations, namely, skin ointments to promote healing." Today, the mark appears on Defendants' products, on their website, and in marketing materials in the following form:



24. The Products consist of a line of baby care and household cleaning products. The name "Babyganics" is a portmanteau of the words "baby" and "organics." Defendants knowingly and intentionally uses the "Babyganics" mark to convey to consumers that the Products are, in fact, organic. Although the Products contain small quantities of organic ingredients, Defendants knowingly and intentionally selected a brand name that looks like and sounds like the word "organics" in order to exploit the growing consumer demand for organic products. To ensure that consumers make the association between "Babyganics" and "organics," Defendants use packaging which is predominantly white and green and highlights graphics of leaves, flowers, and other plants. Each product is emblazoned with the name "Babyganics" on the front of the label of the Products in bold type.

25. Consumers have become increasingly concerned about the effects of synthetic and chemical ingredients in food, cleaning products, bath and beauty products, and everyday household products. Companies such as the Defendants have capitalized on consumers' concerns and their

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 12 of 86

desire for purportedly "organic products." Indeed, consumers are willing to pay, and have paid, a premium for products branded "organic" over products that contain synthetic ingredients. Reasonable consumers, including Plaintiffs and Class Members, value organic products for important reasons, including the belief that they are safer and healthier than alternative products that are not represented as organic.

26. Defendants' ongoing practice of advertising, marketing, labeling, selling, and representing the Products as organic—when in fact, the Products contain minimal organic ingredients—is likely to deceive ordinary consumers of the Products and has in fact deceived Plaintiffs.

27. Plaintiffs reasonably understood the labeling of the Products to mean what they say or imply to a reasonable consumer—that the Products are organic. Based on the label claims that the Products are organic, Plaintiffs believed that the Products are entirely or predominantly made with organic ingredients. In reliance on Defendants' claims that the Products are organic, Plaintiffs were willing to pay more for the Products than similar products that do not claim to be organic and in fact did pay a premium for the Products.

28. As depicted below, the Products' packaging leads consumers to believe the Products are organic. Despite these representations, the Products contain ingredients that are not organic. For example, Defendants' mineral-based sunscreens contain several non-organic and synthetic inactive ingredients that do not appear on the list of synthetic ingredients approved for use in products labeled "organic":

- a. Arachidyl Glucoside a synthetic surfactant;
- b. Butylene Glycol a synthetic humectant (a substance that retains moisture);
- c. Ethylhexylglycerin a synthetic skin conditioning agent and weak preservative;
- d. Glycerin produce by hydrolysis of fats and oils;

- e. Hydroxyethyl Acrylate/Sodium Acryloyldimethyltaurate Copolymer synthetic emulsion stabilizer;
- f. Polyhydroxystearic Acid a synthetic suspending agent; and
- g. Polysorbate 60 a synthetic surfactant and emulsifier with contamination hazards from carcinogens ethylene oxide and 1,4-dioxane.
- 29. The aforementioned ingredients are not organic.
- 30. The other Products also contain ingredients that are not organic:

Name of Product	Listed Ingredients	Product Packaging
Babyganics 3X laundry detergent fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>lauryl /myristyl glucoside</li> <li>potassium cocoate</li> <li>sodium citrate dihydrate</li> <li>propylene glycol</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>oleic acid</li> <li>protease and amylase</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>sodium gluconate</li> <li>sodium tetraborate</li> <li>calcium chloride</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics 3X laundry detergent lavender	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>lauryl/myristyl glucoside</li> <li>potassium cocoate</li> <li>sodium citrate dihydrate</li> <li>propylene glycol</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>oleic acid</li> <li>protease and amylase</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>sodium gluconate</li> <li>sodium tetraborate</li> <li>calcium chloride</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> </ul>	

	• triethyl citrate	
	• anthemis nobilis (chamomile) flower oil	
	• lavandula angustifolia (lavender) oil	
	• citrus aurantium bergamia (bergamot) fruit extract	
	• caprylyl/capryl glucoside	
	<ul> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics	benzalkonium chloride	
alcohol-free foaming	• water	
hand	• cetrimonium chloride	
sanitizer	laurtrimonium chloride	
refill	dihydroxyethyl cocamine oxide	
fragrance	• glycereth-17 cocoate	
free	• citric acid	
		babyganics
		Research and cantition
		Technology, data Britania Martina and Antonia Martina and Antonia Bis R. (Q2 U72mL)
		HOLLER HYSIRE
Babyganics	benzalkonium chloride	
alcohol-free foaming	• water	
hand	• cetrimonium chloride	
sanitizer	laurtrimonium chloride	<u> </u>
refill	dihydroxyethyl cocamine oxide	
mandarin	• glycereth-17 cocoate	0.00
	• citric acid	
	medium chain triglycerides	
	• triethyl citrate	
	• citrue reticulate (mandarin orange) peel oil	babyganics
		Forewritery in heard care and the set of the
	<ul><li>tocopherol</li><li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li></ul>	16 FL OZ (473mL)
	• citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil	

Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer fragrance free	<ul> <li>benzalkonium chloride</li> <li>water</li> <li>cetrimonium chloride</li> <li>laurtrimonium chloride</li> <li>dihydroxyethyl cocamine oxide</li> <li>glycereth-17 cocoate</li> <li>citric acid</li> </ul>	
Babyganics alcohol-free foaming hand sanitizer mandarin	<ul> <li>benzalkonium chloride</li> <li>water</li> <li>cetrimonium chloride</li> <li>laurtrimonium chloride</li> <li>dihydroxyethyl cocamine oxide</li> <li>glycereth-17 cocoate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>medium chain triglycerides</li> <li>triethyl citrate</li> <li>citrue reticulate (mandarin orange) peel oil</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li> <li>citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil</li> </ul>	

Babyganics alcohol-free hand sanitizing wipes mandarin	<ul> <li>benzalkonium chloride</li> <li>water</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>polysorbate 20</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>cocamidopropyl pg-dimonium chloride phosphate</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>tetrasodium glutamate diacetate</li> <li>tocopheryl acetate</li> <li>medium chain triglycerides</li> <li>triethyl citrate</li> </ul>	<image/>
	• citrus reticulate (mandarin orange) peel oil	
	• tocopherol	
	<ul> <li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li> <li>citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil</li> </ul>	
Babyganics all purpose surface wipes fragrance free	<ul> <li>purified water</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>malic acid</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>gluconolactone</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> </ul>	A Contraction of the contraction

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 17 of 86

Babyganics benzocaine free gel teething pods	<ul> <li>cocos nucifera</li> <li>clove oil</li> <li>stevia</li> </ul>	A CONTRACTOR OF THE OFFICE OFF
Babyganics bubble bath chamomile verbena	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>coco-glucoside</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>capryl/capramidropropyl betaine</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic calendula officinalis flower extract</li> <li>organic glycerin</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>aldehyde c-14 natural</li> <li>allyl caproate natural</li> <li>balsam copaiba</li> </ul>	

Babyganics bubble bath fragrance free	<ul> <li>cis 3 hexenyl acetate natural</li> <li>coumarin natural cucumber oil natural</li> <li>davana oil</li> <li>eucalyptus oil</li> <li>galbanum oil</li> <li>geranium eqyptian</li> <li>hexyl acetate (c-6) natural</li> <li>ionone beta natural</li> <li>lemon oil washed</li> <li>lime oil</li> <li>methyl cinnamate</li> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>palmarosa oil</li> <li>rose otto bulgarian</li> <li>vanillin</li> <li>water</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>coco-glucoside</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>capryl/capramidropropyl betaine</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> </ul>	
Babyganics bubble bath fragrance free	<ul> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>palmarosa oil</li> <li>rose otto bulgarian</li> <li>vanillin</li> <li>water</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>coco-glucoside</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>capryl/capramidropropyl betaine</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower)</li> </ul>	<image/>

	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	sodium benzoate	
Babyganics	• menthol 2.6%	
cold relief chest rub	• organic beeswax	*
chest rub	• cedrus atlantica bark oil	relieve relieve relieve
	• eucalyptus globulas leaf oil	
	• glycine soja (soybean) oil	babyganics. Wignis
	• organic helianthus annuus (snowflower) seed oil	
	• organic lavandula angustifolia (lavender) oil	
	• organic olea eurpoaea (olive) fruit oil	abyganics
	• organic ricinus communis (castor) seed oil	
	• Rosmarinus officinalis (rosemary) leaf	USE COLUMN
	extract	
	• silica	
	• tocopherol	
Babyganics	• water	
conditioning	• sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate	
shampoo and	disodium cocoamphodiacetate	
bodywash	• propanediol	
chamomile	• sodium methyl cocoyl taurate	-
verbena	• sodium lauryl glucose carboxylate	**
	• guar hydroxypropyltrimonium chloride	*
	• glycerin	*
	lauryl glucoside	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	babyganics conditioning shampoo + body wash
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	Chammenia vectorara quero y testa tarra na destructiva de las destructivas de las destructivas na recipiona de las destructivas de las destructivas entructivas de las destructivas de las de las de las destructivas • Necestructivas testavas fisanda cal fisanda de las destructivas • Necestructivas testavas fisanda cal fisanda de las destructivas • Necestructivas de las de las de las destructivas de las de la
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	12 FL OZ (354mL)
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	
	• organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract	
	• organic cucumis sativus (cucumber) fruit extract	

•	organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit	
	extract	
•	···· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
•	F	
•		
•	citric acid	
•		
•	sodium benzoate	
•	dehydroacetic acid	
•	ethylhexylglycerin	
•	sorbic acid	
•	aldehyde c-14 natural	
•	allyl caproate natural	
•	balsam copalba	
•	cederwood viginiana oil	
•	chamomile roman	
•	cis 3 hexenyl acetate natural	
•	coumarin natural cucumber oil natural	
•	davana oil	
•	eucalyptus oil	
•	11 1 11	
•	geranium eqyptian	
•		
•		
•	lemon oil washed	
	lime oil	
	methyl cinnamate	
	caprylic/capric triglyceride	
	palmarosa oil	
	rose otto Bulgarian	
	vanillin	

Babyganics conditioning shampoo and bodywash fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>propanediol</li> <li>sodium methyl cocoyl taurate</li> <li>sodium lauryl glucose carboxylate</li> <li>guar hydroxypropyltrimonium chloride</li> <li>glycerin</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed</li> </ul>	bobygonics - body was - body
	<ul> <li>oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	Andrew Standing and Standing an
	<ul> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>organic cucumis sativus (cucumber) fruit extract</li> <li>organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit extract</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>sodium chloride</li> <li>aitria anid</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>citric acid</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>dehydroacetic acid</li> </ul>	
	<ul><li>ethylhexylglycerin</li><li>sorbic acid</li></ul>	

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 22 of 86

	Г	
Babyganics	• zinc oxide	
diaper rash cream	• water	
cream	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	******
	• organic theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
	• theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
	• organic prunus amygdalus dulcis (sweet almond) oil	
	• glycol stearate	babyganics
	• organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil	Clipper table credit which are seen as used and an used in the second second second second second in the second second second second second relationship and second second second second relationship and second second second second relationship and second second second second second relationship and second second second second second second relationship and second second second second second second second relationship and second sec
	• organic glycerin	4 0Z (113g)
	• polyglyceryl – 3 polyricinoleate	4 0C (113g)
	• tocopherol	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic calendula officinalis flower extract	
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	
	• sorbitan sesquioleate	
	cetyl ricinoleate	
	• glyceryl caprate	
	• beeswax	
	• sodium polyacryloyldimethyl taurate	
	hydroxyethylcellulose	
	hydrogentated polydecene	
	• trideceth-10	
	• magnesium stearate	
	aluminum tristearate	
	• sodium benzoate	
	• gluconolactone	

Babyganics	• paper		
dryer sheets lavender	<ul> <li>dihydrogenated hydroxyethylm</li> </ul>		* * * • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
		ftening agent/antistatic)	
	•	grance: caprylic/capric	
		ant-based emulsifier)	babyganics
	<ul> <li>citrus aurantiu fruit oil</li> </ul>	m bergamia (bergamot)	Chryper subjects to the state states '
	• anthemis nobili	s (chamomile) flower oil	
	• lavendula angu	stifolia (lavender) oil	
	lavandula hybri	ida (lavandin) oil	
Babyganics	<ul> <li>colloidal oatme</li> </ul>	al 1%	
eczema care skin	• water		
protectant cream	<ul> <li>organic butyro butter</li> </ul>	ospermum parkii (shea)	
eream	• cetearyl alcoho	1	
	• cetyl alcohol		91-00 - 122 - 122 - 12
	<ul> <li>isopropyl palmi</li> </ul>	itate	*****
	• organic glyceri	n	*.
	• glyceryl stearat	e	babyganics
	• organic theobro butter	oma cacao (cocoa) seed	eczema care skim protocotan cream winn circlata aumani wierości edeniczna o skim protocotani edeniczna o skim protoci zakład wierowani w
	• hydrolyzed oats	8	**************************************
	• solanum lycope	ersicum (tomato) seed oil	- ne plage
	<ul> <li>organic heliant seed oil</li> </ul>	thus annuus (sunflower)	
	• vaccinium mac oil	rocarpon (cranberry) seed	
	• organic nigella oil	sativa (black cumin) seed	
	• rubus idaeus (re	ed raspberry) seed oil	
	• cetearyl glucosi	ide	
	• tocopherol		
	• glyceryl dilaura	ate	
	• caprylyl glycol		
	• xanthan gum		
	• sodium phytate		
	• ethylhexylglyce	erin	
	• citric acid		
	<ul> <li>potassium sorba</li> </ul>	ate	

	• phenoxyethanol	
Babyganics face, hand and baby wipes fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>chamomilla recutita flower extract</li> <li>vegetable oil</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>polyglyceryl-2-dipolyhydroxystearate</li> <li>glyceryl oleate</li> <li>dicaprylyl carbonate</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vacinnium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	<text></text>
Babyganics floor cleaner concentrate fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>sodium lauryl glucose carboxylate</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>methylglycinediacetic acid</li> <li>potassium cocoate</li> <li>sodium citrate</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>caprylyl glycol</li> </ul>	

Babyganics fluoride free toothpaste strawberry	<ul> <li>purified water</li> <li>carboxymethyl cellulose</li> <li>xylitol</li> <li>sodium citrate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>stevia</li> <li>flavor</li> </ul>	
Babyganics fluoride free toothpaste watermelon	<ul> <li>purified water</li> <li>carboxymethyl cellulose</li> <li>xylitol</li> <li>sodium citrate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>stevia</li> <li>flavor</li> </ul>	

Babyganics flushable wipes fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>polysorbate 20</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>disodium cocoamphodiacetate</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>tocopheryl acetate (vitamin e acetate)</li> <li>sodium citrate</li> <li>citric acid</li> </ul>	
Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap refill citrus	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>sodium lauroyl sarcosinate</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> <li>natural fragrance: medium chain triglycerides</li> <li>triethyl citrate</li> <li>citrus reticulata (mandarin orange) peel oil</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li> <li>citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil</li> </ul>	

Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap refill fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>sodium lauroyl sarcosinate</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap citrus	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>sodium lauroyl sarcosinate</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> <li>natural fragrance: medium chain triglycerides</li> <li>triethyl citrate</li> <li>citrus reticulata (mandarin orange) peel oil</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li> <li>citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil</li> </ul>	

Babyganics foaming dish and bottle soap fragrance free	<ul> <li>Water</li> <li>cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine</li> <li>lauramine oxide</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>sodium lauroyl sarcosinate</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics foaming hand soap chamomile verbena	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>organic potassium oleate</li> <li>organic glycerin</li> <li>organic potassium cocoate</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> <li>xanthan gum</li> <li>potassium citrate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>aldehyde c-14 natural</li> <li>allyl caproate natural</li> <li>balsam copalba</li> <li>cederwood viginiana oil</li> <li>chamomile roman</li> <li>cis 3 hexenyl acetate natural</li> <li>coumarin natural cucumber oil natural</li> <li>davana oil</li> <li>eucalyptus oil</li> <li>galbanium oil</li> </ul>	<image/>

	• geranium eqyptian	
	• hexyl acetate (c-6) natural	
	• ionone beta natural	
	• lemon oil washed	
	• lime oil	
	• methyl cinnamate	
	• caprylic/capric triglyceride	
	• palmarosa oil	
	• rose otto Bulgarian	
	• vanillin	
Babyganics	• water	
foaming	• organic potassium oleate	
hand soap	• organic glycerin	
fragrance free	organic potassium cocoate	
nee	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	babygonics
	• xanthan gum	foaming hand soap
	• potassium citrate	Inspectations - process provide advancement Man Database providence advancement 8.445 FL Q2 (2250mL)
	• citric acid	

Babyganics hand and face wipes fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>chamomilla recutita flower extract</li> <li>vegetable oil</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>lauryl glucoside</li> <li>polyglyceryl-2-dipolyhydroxystearate</li> <li>glyceryl oleate</li> <li>dicaprylyl carbonate</li> <li>sodium benzoate</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>potassium sorbate</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	<image/> <image/>
Babyganics natural insect repellent	<ul> <li>organic soybean oil</li> <li>rosemary oil</li> <li>citronella oil</li> <li>geranium oil</li> <li>cedarwood oil</li> <li>peppermint oil</li> <li>lemongrass oil</li> </ul>	

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 31 of 86

Babyganics mineral- based sunscreen spray 50+SPF	<ul> <li>zinc oxide 11.2%</li> <li>octinoxate 7.5%</li> <li>octisalate 5.0%</li> <li>water</li> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>VP/hexadecene copolymer</li> <li>glyceryl stearate</li> <li>hexaglyceryl polyricinoleate</li> <li>polysorbate 80</li> <li>phenethyl alcohol</li> <li>glyceryl caprylate</li> <li>sodium magnesium silicate</li> <li>xanthan gum</li> <li>hydroxyethyl acrylate/sodium acryloyldimethyltaurate copolymer</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>squalane</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>lecithin</li> <li>polysorbate 60</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>sorbitan isostearate</li> </ul>	<image/>
---	---	----------

Babyganics	octisalate 5.0%	
mineral-	<ul><li> occusatate 5.0%</li><li> titanium dioxide 3.0%</li></ul>	
based	:	
sunscreen		
50+SPF	water     butuloctul soliculate	
	butyloctyl salicylate	
	neopentyl glycol diethylhexanoate	•
	caprylic/capric triglyceride	babyganics
	• stearyl/octyldodecyl citrate crosspolymer	mineral-based sunscreen broad spectrum 8PF 50+
	• polyglyceryl-2 stearate	UV(# + UV(# protection) value resulting (8)C minuted) Mediate registrations Mediate registrations
	• organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil	November 2014 and 201
	hydrogenated dimer dilinoleyl/dimethylcarbonate copolymer	
	• glyceryl stearate	
	• certyl alcohol	
	organic cocos nucifera (coconut) oil	
	organic glycerin	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• jojoba esters	
	stearyl alcohol	
	arachidyl glucoside	
	behenyl alcohol	
	polyhydroxystearic acid	
	• xanthan gum	
	• silica	
	• alumina	
	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	
	• phenoxyethanol	

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 33 of 86

Babyganics mineral- based sunscreen 50+ SPF single use tubes	<ul> <li>octisalate 5.0%</li> <li>titanium dioxide 3.0%</li> <li>zinc oxide 6.0%</li> <li>water</li> <li>butyloctyl salicylate</li> <li>neopentyl glycol diethylhexanoate</li> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>stearyl/octyldodecyl citrate crosspolymer</li> <li>polyglyceryl-2 stearate</li> <li>simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oi</li> <li>hydrogenated dimer dilinoleyl/dimethylcarbonate copolymer</li> <li>glyceryl stearate</li> <li>cetyl alcohol</li> <li>cocos nucifera (coconut) oil</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> <li>butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter</li> <li>jojoba esters</li> <li>stearyl alcohol</li> <li>arachidyl alcohol</li> </ul>	
	-	
	• nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	-	
	-	
	arachidyl glucoside	
	behenyl alcohol	
	<ul> <li>polyhydroxystearic acid</li> <li>vonthan gym</li> </ul>	
	<ul><li> xanthan gum</li><li> silica</li></ul>	
	<ul><li>sinca</li><li>alumina</li></ul>	
	<ul><li>atunna</li><li>ethylhexylglycerin</li></ul>	
	<ul> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> </ul>	
	<ul><li> thisodram entyrenearannine disacemate</li><li> phenoxyethanol</li></ul>	
	- phonoxyculation	

[		
Babyganics	• titanium dioxide 2.0%	
moisturizing	• zinc oxide 3.0%	
daily lotion with	• water	
sunscreen	• organic cocos nucifera (coconut) oil	
15 SPF	• butyloctyl salicylate	
	• stearyl/octyldodecyl citrate crosspolymer	1 ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) (
	• organic glycerin	0-2-2-
	• polyglyceryl-2 stearate	
	• caprylic/capric triglyceride	babyganics
	• glyceryl stearate	micielus uniting (dely) Activity with summer cent
	• cetyl alcohol	Handrad Salahan Salahan Handrad Salahan Salahan Hit Girga Salah
	• stearyl alcohol	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• organic theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
	• jojoba esters	
	• xanthan gum	
	• silica	
	• alumina	
	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	
	• phenoxyethanol	

D 1 .		
Babyganics	• water	
moisturizing daily lotion	<ul> <li>organic Theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter</li> </ul>	<u> </u>
chamomile	<ul> <li>cetyl alcohol</li> </ul>	
verbena	-	
	• squalene	Constraint of the second se
	• decyl oleate	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• propanediol	
	• organic glycerin	
	• organic persea gratissima (avocado) oil	
	• organic olea europaea (olive) fruit oil	babyganics
	• organic canola oil	moisturizing daily lotion
	• tocopherol	Productican & demandability femela with share butter, device & accession in a metanome, surface, produkter, energies de properatione
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	*Memory-required to an end of a second secon
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	<ul> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> </ul>	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• cetearyl alcohol	
	• ceteareth-20	
	• stearic acid	
	• organic beeswax	
	• carbomer	
	• sodium hydroxide	
	• caprylyl glycol	
	<ul> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccunate</li> </ul>	
	• sorbic acid	
	• phenoxyethanol	
	• aldehyde c-14 natural	
	• allyl caproate natural	
	• balsam copalba	
	<ul> <li>cederwood viginiana oil</li> </ul>	
	chamomile roman	
	• cis 3 hexenyl acetate natural	
	- cis 5 novem y 1 acetaic natural	

	• coumarin natural cucumber oil natural	
	<ul><li>davana oil</li></ul>	
	<ul><li>eucalyptus oil</li><li>galbanium oil</li></ul>	
	<ul><li>garoanium on</li><li>geranium eqyptian</li></ul>	
	<ul><li>hexyl acetate (c-6) natural</li><li>ionone beta natural</li></ul>	
	1 11 1 1	
	<ul><li>lemon oil washed</li><li>lime oil</li></ul>	
	<ul> <li>methyl cinnamate</li> <li>commulia (comming trially comming)</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>polymorphic acil</li> </ul>	
	palmarosa oil	
	• rose otto Bulgarian	
Dahuganiaa	• vanillin	
Babyganics moisturizing daily lotion fragrance free	• water	
	• organic Theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
	cetyl alcohol	
	<ul> <li>squalene</li> </ul>	
	decyl oleate	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea)	
	butter	
	• propanediol	
	• organic glycerin	
	• organic persea gratissima (avocado) oil	********
	• organic olea europaea (olive) fruit oil	babyganics
	• organic canola oil	Construction and an analysis of the second sec
	• tocopherol	
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• cetearyl alcohol	
	• ceteareth-20	

Babyganics moisturizing therapy cream wash	<ul> <li>stearic acid</li> <li>organic beeswax</li> <li>carbomer</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> <li>caprylyl glycol</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccunate</li> <li>sorbic acid</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>water</li> <li>colloidal oatmeal</li> <li>cocamidopropyl hydroxysultaine</li> <li>sodium cocoyl isethionate</li> <li>organic glycerin</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>glycol distearate</li> <li>cocamidopropylamine oxide</li> <li>hydrolyzed oats</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter</li> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic chamonmilla recutita (matricaria) extract</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>catorul malaata</li> </ul>	<image/>
	<ul> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic chamonmilla recutita (matricaria) extract</li> </ul>	
	• castoryl maleate	
	<ul><li>xanthan gum</li><li>hydroxypropyl methylcellulose</li><li>caprylyl glycol</li></ul>	
	<ul> <li>caprylyl glycol</li> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> </ul>	
	trisodium hydroxide	

	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	
	• potassium sorbate	
	• phenoxyethanol	
Babyganics multi- surface cleaner citrus	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>soybean oil</li> <li>methyl esters</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>natural fragrance: medium chain triglycerides</li> <li>triethyl citrate</li> <li>citrus reticulata (mandarin orange) peel oil</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>citrus aurantium dulcis (orange) peel oil</li> <li>citrus grandis (grapefruit) peel oil</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics multi- surface cleaner fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>soybean oil</li> <li>methyl esters</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	<image/>

Babyganics	• water	
night time	• water	
baby lotion	• organic Theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
orange	cetyl alcohol	
blossom	• squalene	
	decyl oleate	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• propanediol	contra
	<ul> <li>organic glycerin</li> </ul>	
	• organic persea gratissima (avocado) oil	
	• organic olea europaea (olive) fruit oil	
	• organic canola oil	babyganics
	• tocopherol	night time baby lotion ange biogen - calming formula beign
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	Resp baby soches - non-silengeised pediatrica & demonstrations interview memory, unas, provide and and and enterprove and approved and and enterprove and approved and and
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	12 FL OZ (354mL) exercise
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	cetearyl alcohol	
	• ceteareth-20	
	• stearic acid	
	• organic beeswax	
	• carbomer	
	• sodium hydroxide	
	• caprylyl glycol	
	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccunate	
	• sorbic acid	
	• phenoxyethanol	
	• bergamot terpenes	
	• davana oil	
	• grapefruit terpenes	
	• mandarin petitgrain	
	caprylic/capric tryglyceride	
	• orange oil florida	

Г	1	
	• orange terpenes	
	• peru balsam oil	
	• petitgrain oil	
	• tangerine oil	
	• vanillin natural	
Babyganics	• water	
night time	• sodium lauryl methyl isethionate	
bubble bath orange	disodium cocoamphodiacetate	
blossom	• coco-glucoside	
	lauryl glucoside	
	capryl/capramidopropyl betaine	* 🚖 *
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	<ul> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> </ul>	babyganics
		night time bubble bath orange blosson - calming formula holps here buty control - non alregation
	<ul> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> <li>organia aloa barbadansis laaf jujaa</li> </ul>	Biolitatification & discretizational provide a solution     Montantina and a solution and a solution and a solution     Montantina and and a solution of a solution     Montantina and and a solution of a solution
	<ul> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic calendula officinalis flower</li> </ul>	12 FL 02 (354mL) ##1017877
	extract	
	• organic olea europaea (olive) leaf extract	
	• organic glycerin	
	• citric acid	
	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccunate	
	• phenoxyethanol	
	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	sodium benzoate	
	• bergamot terpenes	
	• davana oil	
	• grapefruit terpenes	
	mandarin petitgrain	
	caprylic/capric tryglyceride	
	• orange oil florida	
	orange terpenes	
	• peru balsam oil	
	• petitgrain oil	
	• tangerine oil	

• vanillin natural	
-	
5	babyganics
	night time shampoo+bodywash erene blossen-carring formida refes
• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	Monte and a second
• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
• phenoxyethanol	
<ul> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> </ul>	
• sodium phytate	
• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	
• organic cucumis sativus (cucumber) fruit extract	
• organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract	
• organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit extract	
• bergamot terpenes	
• davana oil	
• grapefruit terpenes	
mandarin petitgrain	
• caprylic/capric tryglyceride	
_	
-	
	<ul> <li>glycerin</li> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>dehydroacetic acid</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>vrubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> <li>sodium phytate</li> <li>organic cucumis sativus (cucumber) fruit extract</li> <li>organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract</li> <li>organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit extract</li> <li>bergamot terpenes</li> <li>davana oil</li> <li>grapefruit terpenes</li> <li>mandarin petitgrain</li> <li>caprylic/capric tryglyceride</li> </ul>

	• tangerine oil	
	vanillin natural	
Babyganics organic lip and face balm fragrance free	<ul> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>organic beeswax</li> <li>organic cocos nucifera (coconut) oil</li> <li>organic ricinus communis (castor) oil</li> <li>organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter</li> <li>organic calendula officinalis flower oil</li> <li>tocopherol</li> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	<image/>
Babyganics pure mineral sunscreen stick 50+ SPF	<ul> <li>titanium dioxide 7.9%</li> <li>zinc oxide 6%</li> <li>c12-15 alkyl benzoate</li> <li>caprylic/capric triglyceride</li> <li>organic beeswax</li> <li>organic copernicia cerifera (carnuba) wax</li> <li>neopentyl glycol diethylhexanoate</li> <li>tribehenin</li> <li>euphorbia cerifera (candelilla) wax</li> <li>ppg-3 benzyl ether myristate</li> <li>hydrogenated dimer dilinoleyl/dimethylcarbonate copolymer</li> <li>helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed wax</li> <li>myristyl myristate</li> <li>stearyl/octadodecyl citrate crosspolymer</li> <li>organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil</li> <li>polyqlycervl-10 pentaoleate</li> <li>jojoba esters</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> </ul>	

	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed	
	oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• polyhydroxystearic acid	
	<ul> <li>caprylyl glycol</li> </ul>	
	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	• silica	
	• alumina	
Babyganics	• titanium dioxide 3.0\$	
pure	• zinc oxide 3.0%	
mineral	• water	<b>30</b>
sunscreen 30 SPF	butyloctyl salicylate	
50 51 1	cetearyl olivate	
	• organic cocos nucifera (coconut) oil	*****
	• sorbitan olivate	
	• caprylic/capric triglyceride	babyganics
	• organic carthamus tinctorius (safflower)	pure mineral Sunscreen break working miner PS 30 UVA VDB powerson water measurer
	seed oil	Advisionality - non alter gene 2 Mercanine di demandari gene anno 1 mercanine y constante series Mercanico de facio participa
	• cetyl alcohol	4 FL 02 (118 mL)
	• stearyl/octadodecyl citrate crosspolymer	
	• organic glycerin	
	hydrogenated dimer dilinoleyl/dimethylcarbonate copolymer	
	• ozokerite	
	• organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil	
	• organic butyrospermum parkii (shea) butter	
	• organic theobroma cacao (cocoa) seed butter	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	<ul> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	
	(	

	• jojoba esters	
	• squalene	
	<ul> <li>glyceryl caprylate</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>arachidyl alcohol</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>behenyl alcohol</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>arachidyl glucoside</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>sucrose stearate</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>stearic acid</li> </ul>	
	<ul><li>polyglyceryl-2 caprate</li></ul>	
	<ul> <li>xanthan gum</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>polyhydroxystearic acid</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>silica</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>alumina</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> </ul>	
	<ul> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> </ul>	
	<ul><li>phenoxyethanol</li></ul>	
Babyganics	water	
shampoo	<ul> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> </ul>	
and body	<ul> <li>caprylyl/capryl glucoside</li> </ul>	
wash	<ul> <li>propanediol</li> </ul>	
chamomile verbena	<ul> <li>acrylates copolymer</li> </ul>	
verbena	<ul> <li>sodium lauroyl oat amino acids</li> </ul>	
	• glycerin	
	<ul> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> </ul>	
	• citric acid	
	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	
	dehydroacetic acid	
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	le la
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower)	shampoo-body wash
	seed oil	Ohannan la surbana, autor gantila non-alignatic: popularization demattologisti testad-valtin tassara la ganchastana et anna alignatica alignatica alignatica da di eta cara da di eta
	<ul> <li>vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil</li> </ul>	* Manufacture, and and and a second or other * Manufacture, and a factor of a filtered 16 FEL OZ (473mL) second
	<ul> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed</li> </ul>	
	oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• phenoxyethanol	
	sodium hydroxide	
	• sodium phytate	
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	

•	organic cucumis sativus (cucumber) fruit extract
•	organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract
•	organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit extract
•	aldehyde c-14 natural
•	allyl caproate natural
•	balsam copaiba
•	cedarwood virginiana oil
•	chamomile roman
•	cis 3 hexenyl acetate natural
•	coumarin natural cucumber oil natural
•	davana oil
•	eucalyptus oil
•	galbanum oil
•	geranium eqyptian
•	hexyl acetate (c-6) natural
•	ionone beta natural
•	lemon oil washed
•	lime oil
•	methyl cinnamate
•	caprylic/capric triglyceride
•	palmarosa oil
•	rose otto bulgarian
•	vanillin

Babyganics shampoo and body wash fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate</li> <li>caprylyl/capryl glucoside</li> <li>propanediol</li> <li>acrylates copolymer</li> <li>sodium lauroyl oat amino acids</li> <li>glycerin</li> <li>ethylhexylglycerin</li> <li>citric acid</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>dehydroacetic acid</li> <li>solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil</li> <li>organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> <li>sodium phytate</li> <li>organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice</li> <li>organic chamomilla recutita (matricaria) flower extract</li> <li>organic persea gratissima (avocado) fruit extract</li> </ul>	<image/>
--	--	----------

	1	
Babyganics	• ricinus communis (castor) seed oil	
soothing	hydrogenated castor oil	
protective ointment	organic beeswax	* * * * * ~ *
omunent	• organic cocos nucifera (coconut) oil	
	• lanolin	
	• tocopherol	
	• organic calendula officinalis flower extract	babyganics
	• organic simmondsia chinensis (jojoba) seed oil	Soothing Protective ontment Montaics and helps protect dy intracts data and dispose and being protective transmission terms being protective transmission terms being protective transmission terms being protective te
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	Providence Contraction of Contraction Contractions
	• organic helianthus annuus (sunflower) seed oil	3.25 GZ (92g)
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic glycine soja (soybean) oil	
Babyganics	deionized water	
stain and	• sodium laurylglucosides	
odor	hydroxypropylsulfonate l	
remover fragrance	lauryl dimethylamine oxide	
free	sodium gluconate	
	• sodium citrate dehydrate	
	lauryl glucoside	
	• caprylyl/myristyl glucoside	
	• proplene glycol	
	• methylisothiazolinone	<b>bobygonics</b> <b>brind of memory</b> <b>brind of memory</b>

Babyganics stain eraser fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>methylglycinediacetic acid</li> <li>potassium cocoate</li> <li>sodium gluconate</li> <li>sodium citrate</li> <li>phenoxyethanol</li> <li>caprylyl glycol</li> </ul>	
Babyganics toy and highchair cleaner fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	<image/>

Babyganics toy, table and highchair wipes fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>caprylyl/myristyl glucoside</li> <li>tetrasodium glutamate diacetate</li> <li>magnesium chloride</li> <li>magnesium nitrate</li> <li>methyl chloro isothiazolinone</li> <li>methyl isothiazolinone</li> </ul>	<image/>
Babyganics tub and tile cleaner fragrance free	<ul> <li>water</li> <li>lactic acid</li> <li>cocamidopropyl betaine</li> <li>sodium hydroxide</li> <li>decyl glucoside</li> <li>trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate</li> <li>ethylhydroxyethyl cellulose</li> <li>methylisothiazolinone</li> </ul>	
Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size newborn		

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 50 of 86

Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 1	
Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 2	Image: Strategy of the strategy
Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 3	<image/>
Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 4	

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 51 of 86

Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 5	
Babyganics ultra absorbent diapers size 6	

Pohygonias	a motor	
Babyganics vapor	• water	
bubble bath	• sodium lauroyl methyl isethionate	
	disodium cocoamphodiacetate	
	• coco-glucoside	
	lauryl glucoside	
	• capryl/capramidopropyl betaine	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	• solanum lycopersicum (tomato) seed oil	*
	• vaccinium macrocarpon (cranberry) seed oil	*
	• organic nigella sativa (black cumin) seed oil	
	• rubus idaeus (red raspberry) seed oil	
	• organic aloe barbadensis leaf juice	
	• organic calendula officinalis flower extract	babyganics. vapor bubble bath
	• organic olea europaea (olive) leaf extract	with natural menthol, eucalyptius and rosemary - comforts babies with colds - pon-allecaretic
	• organic glycerin	Pediatrician & dermatologist teterad ministano, adjuga patriciano, advido tagencian dela
	• citric acid	12 FL 0Z (354mL)
	• trisodium ethylenediamine disuccinate	
	• phenoxyethanol	
	• ethylhexylglycerin	
	• sodium benzoate	
	• camphor	
	<ul> <li>cedarwood virginiana oil</li> </ul>	
	citronellol natural	
	• clary sage oil	
	eucalyptol natural	
	• eucalyptus oil	
	<ul> <li>laevo linalool natural</li> </ul>	
	• lavandin	
	• lime oil	
	• menthol crystals	
	• pine (fir) needle siberian	
	<ul> <li>rosemary</li> </ul>	
	• terpineol alpha natural	
	<ul> <li>thyme oil</li> </ul>	
	• vanillin	
L		

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 53 of 86

31. Defendants' scheme to exploit consumer demand for organic products by falsely advertising their Products as organic has been extraordinarily successful. In 2014, it was reported that Defendants experienced 277 percent sales growth over a 3-year period, and they were named to the Inc. 5000 list of fastest growing private companies.

32. The majority of the Products are intended to be rubbed, poured, sprinkled, or sprayed on; introduced into; or otherwise applied to the human body, or any part of the human body, for cleansing, beautifying, promoting attractiveness, or altering the appearance, and are thus "cosmetics" under California law. CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 109900.

33. The California Organic Products Act of 2003 ("COPA") provides that "no product shall be sold as organic pursuant to this article unless it is produced according to regulations promulgated by the NOP, and consists entirely of products manufactured only from raw or processed agricultural products." CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 110820. "Sold as organic' means any use of the terms 'organic,' 'organically grown,' or grammatical variations of those terms, whether orally or in writing, in connection with any product grown, handled, processed, sold, or offered for sale in this state, including, but not limited to, any use of these terms in labeling or advertising of any product and any ingredient in a multi-ingredient product." CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 110815(k).

34. Furthermore, under COPA, "Cosmetic products sold, labeled, or represented as organic or made with organic ingredients shall contain, at least 70 percent organically produced ingredients." CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 110838(b). "Multi-ingredient cosmetic products sold as organic in California with less than 70 percent organically produced ingredients, by weight or by fluid volume, excluding water and salt, may only identify the organic content." CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 110839.

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 54 of 86

35. Defendants' use of the name "Babyganics" on packaging, labeling, and advertising of the Products—which looks and sounds like the word "organics"—constitutes selling, labeling, and representing the Products as organic under COPA. The Products are thus "sold as organic" pursuant to COPA as they are advertised and labeled as "Babyganics" and sold in California.

# B. Defendants Misrepresent the Sunscreens are "Mineral-Based."

36. Active ingredients in sunscreens come in two forms, physical barriers and chemical filters. Chemical filters are absorbed into the skin and absorb UVA and UVB rays. Physical barriers, usually minerals Zinc Oxide or Titanium Dioxide, are not absorbed into the skin and instead create a physical barrier between the skin and UVA and UVB rays.

37. Throughout the Class Period Defendants have continually advertised and marketed the following sunscreens as "mineral-based":

## Mineral-Based Sunscreen Lotion



# **Mineral-Based Sunscreen Spray**



38. The "mineral-based" lotion lists the following active ingredients on the back of their packaging: Octisalate (5.0%), Titanium Dioxide (3.0%), and Zinc Oxide (6.0%). Likewise, the "mineral-based" spray lists the following active ingredients on the back of their packaging:

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 55 of 86

Zinc Oxide (11.2%), Octinoxate (7.5%), Octisalate (5.0%). Both Octinoxate and Octisalate are chemical compounds. Defendants' labeling of these sunscreens as "mineral-based" is therefore false, misleading, deceptive, fraudulent, and unfair.

39. Defendants' labeling of the Products as "mineral-based" unequivocally demonstrates their intent to persuade consumers that all active ingredients in the Products are mineral-based. However, Defendants' "mineral-based" sunscreens' active ingredients include Octinoxate and Octisalate, both of which are non-mineral, chemical compounds.

40. Defendants are well aware of consumers' concerns regarding chemical sunscreens. It has a close relationship with the Environmental Working Group ("EWG"), with whom it founded a "sun safety coalition." Through this coalition, EWG promotes the theory that physical sunscreens are safer than chemical sunscreens. According to EWG, "Two European studies have detected sunscreen chemicals [including Octinoxate] in mothers' milk, indicating that the developing fetus and newborns may be exposed to these substances."<sup>1</sup> EWG lists Octinoxate as a UV filter with "higher toxicity concerns" and a potential endocrine disruptor and known skin allergen. Octisalate is listed as a "moderate toxicity" concern by EWG.

41. As part of this lobbying effort, EWG publishes an annual Guide to Sunscreens with ratings of hundreds of different sunscreens. It consistently rates mineral sunscreens higher than chemical sunscreens, based in large part on the idea that the mineral sunscreens are safer. Notably, EWG gives a high rating to Defendants' "mineral-based" sunscreen, even higher than Defendants' actual mineral sunscreen which is labeled as "Pure."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Environmental Working Group, *The Trouble With Sunscreen Chemicals* (last visited Oct. 13, 2015), available at: http://www.ewg.org/2015sunscreen/report/the-trouble-with-sunscreen-chemicals/.

## Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 56 of 86

42. Defendants save considerable resources during the manufacturing process when

using chemical sunscreens. Octinoxate and Octisalate cost less than Titanium Dioxide (which has been the subject of several price fixing lawsuits in recent years) and Zinc Oxide.

43. Defendants knew or reasonably should have known that their representations

regarding their sunscreens' ingredients are false, deceptive, misleading, and unlawful under

California, New York, and Florida laws. In fact, Defendants have received numerous consumer

complaints about their labeling on Amazon.com:

Not true mineral sunscreen - buyer beware

Bymamagleeon August 7, 2014

This is not a chemical free sunblock! I purchased this as it is described as 'mineral based.' Technically it is mineral based because it contains zinc oxide, but the other 2 active ingredients are chemicals which most people looking for mineral sunblock are attempting to avoid. Buyer be aware that the the active ingredients lists Octinoxate 7.5% and Octisalate 5.0% (in addition to the zinc oxide) True mineral based sunscreen should have the active ingredients of zinc oxide and/or titanium oxide and that's all. More info here for those who are interested: http://www.ewg.org/2014sunscreen/the-trouble-with-sunscreen-chemicals/

The product packaging is misleading

Misleading name of product and off-putting smell

ByAlison Hayward "emergentologist" on July 25, 2015

Size: 6 Ounce (Pack of 2)Style Name: SPF 50Verified Purchase

Foolishly I didn't read the reviews and didn't realize that something advertised as mineral sunscreen might also have chemical ingredients in it. Obviously I'm purchasing mineral sunscreen because I don't want chemical sunscreen, so I regret this purchase. Also, I would recommend trying a sample of this somehow before purchasing this quantity... it smells really off-putting to me, strongly like fake flowers.

Pretty annoyed that I bought this "mineral based sunscreen" only ... Byafrodeityon September 18, 2014 Size: 6 Ounce (Pack of 2)Package Type: Frustration-Free PackagingVerified Purchase

Pretty annoyed that I bought this "mineral based sunscreen" only to receive it, start using it and realize that 2 of the three active ingredients are chemical sunscreens, i.e. Octinoxate (7.5%) and Octisalate (5.0%). There is also zinc oxide (11.7%), but that is beside the point. If you want a physical sunscreen, which is what I was looking for, DO NOT BUY THIS. Chemical sunscreens actually are designed to

## Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 57 of 86

absorb into the skin and can disrupt your hormonal balance, amongst other things. I would not want to expose my babies to that risk. The product info is very misleading.

44. Reasonable consumers, including Plaintiffs Mayhew, Alibhai, and Festa purchased the sunscreen Products based upon their belief they were mineral-based. However, a reasonable consumer would not deem the Products to be mineral-based if he or she knew the active ingredients included chemical sunscreens.

45. Hence, Defendants' claims that the Sunscreens are mineral-based are false and misleading.

46. Defendants' labeling is effective. Their "mineral-based" sunscreen lotion is the "#1 Best Seller in Baby Sun Protection" on Amazon.com.

47. In fact, Plaintiffs Mayhew, Alibhai, and Festa and members of the Sunscreen Class suffered an ascertainable loss in at least the following amounts, in that they paid a premium for Defendants' Sunscreens over comparable products that are not marketed as mineral or organic:<sup>2</sup>

a. Babyganics Mineral-Based Sunscreen Spray - \$2.32 per ounce

b. Coppertone Water Babies Sunscreen Spray - \$1.76 per ounce

c. Babyganics Mineral-Based Sunscreen Lotion - \$2.24 per ounce

d. Coppertone Water Babies Sunscreen Lotion - \$1.34 per ounce

## C. Defendants Misrepresent the Products are "Natural."

48. Defendants have systematically marketed and advertised the Products throughout the United States as "natural" on the front label of the Products, such that any United States consumer who purchased the Products, or who purchases the Products in the future, is exposed to Defendants' "natural" claim.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Based on prices listed on Diapers.com.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 58 of 86

49. Whether Defendants' labeling of the Products as "natural" is deceptive is judged by whether it would deceive or mislead a reasonable person. To assist in ascertaining what a reasonable consumer believes the term "natural" means, one can look to the regulatory agencies for their guidance. For example, the Food and Drug Administration ("FDA") takes the position that natural "mean[s] that nothing artificial or synthetic" has been included in or added to the product. 58 Fed. Reg. 2302, 2407 (Jan. 6, 1993).

50. As guidance as to what a reasonable consumer believes the term "synthetic" means, the United States Department of Agriculture ("USDA") defines "synthetic" as "a substance that is formulated or manufactured by a chemical process or by a process that chemically changes a substance extracted from naturally occurring plant, animal, or mineral sources . . . ." 7 U.S.C. § 6502(21).

51. As such, a reasonable consumer would not believe that a "natural" product would contain synthetic ingredients.

52. Contrary to Defendants' representations, and to the detriment of consumers, the Products contains one or more ingredients that a reasonable consumer would not deem natural. *See supra* ¶ 30.

53. To label the Products as "natural" creates consumer deception and confusion. A reasonable consumer purchases the Products believing they are "natural" (i.e. they do not contain synthetic ingredients) based on the Products' label. However, a reasonable consumer would not deem the Products to be "natural" if the consumer knew that the Products contain synthetic ingredients.

54. Defendants' conduct harms consumers by inducing them to purchase and use Products containing synthetic ingredients on the false premise that the Products are "natural,"

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 59 of 86

when the consumers would not have otherwise purchased and used the Products, and by inducing consumers to pay a premium price for the Products.

#### **RULE 9(B) ALLEGATIONS**

55. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure ("Rule") 9(b) provides that "[i]n alleging fraud or mistake, a party must state with particularity the circumstances constituting fraud or mistake." Fed. R. Civ. P. 9(b). As detailed in the paragraphs above, Plaintiff has satisfied the requirements of Rule 9(b) by establishing the following elements with sufficient particularity:

56. WHO: Defendants made material misrepresentations to Plaintiffs and the Class and failed to adequately disclose material facts as detailed herein. Except as identified herein, Plaintiffs are unaware, and therefore unable to identify, the true names and identities of those individuals at Defendants who are responsible for such material misrepresentations and omissions.

57. WHAT: Defendants made material misrepresentations regarding the organic, mineral-based, and natural quality of the Products. Specifically, Defendants misrepresented the sunscreen Products are "mineral-based." Also, Defendants misrepresented the Products are organic by using the trade name "Babyganics." Finally, Defendants misrepresented the Products are natural by labeling the products as "Natural." These representations are false and misleading because the Products contain, among other things, Octinoxate, Octisalate, Arachidyl Glucoside, Ethylhexylglycerin, Butylene Glycol. Glycerin, Hydroxyethyl Acrylate/Sodium, Copolymer, Polyhydroxystearic Acid, Acryloyldimethyltaurate Polysorbate 60. and Phenoxyethanol, in contradiction to Defendants' claims.

58. WHEN: Defendants made the material misrepresentations, omissions, and nondisclosures detailed herein continuously at every point of purchase and consumption throughout the Class Period. Specifically, Plaintiff Alibhai purchased the purchased the Sunscreen on or about 2012 and other Products on or about 2013 Plaintiff Mayhew purchased the Sunscreen and

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 60 of 86

Shampoo & Body Wash on or about 2015, and Plaintiff Festa purchased the Shampoo, Body wash, and Lotion on or about 2016.

59. WHERE: Defendants' material misrepresentations, omissions, and non-disclosures detailed herein were made, inter alia, on the packaging of the Products. Plaintiff Alibhai purchased the Sunscreen and other Products at ToysRUs in California, Plaintiff Mayhew purchased the Sunscreens and Shampoo & Body Wash at Target in New York, and Plaintiff Festa purchased the Shampoo, Body Wash, and Lotion at BabiesRUs in Florida.

60. HOW: Defendants made numerous written material misrepresentations on the packaging of the Products which were designed to, and, in fact, did, mislead Plaintiffs and the Class into purchasing the Products.

61. WHY: Defendants engaged in the material misrepresentations, omissions, and nondisclosures detailed herein for the express purpose of inducing Plaintiff and other reasonable consumers to purchase and/or pay a premium for the Products based on the belief the Products are organic, mineral-based, or natural. Defendants profited by selling the Products to thousands of unsuspecting consumers.

#### **CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

62. Plaintiffs bring this matter on behalf of themselves and those similarly situated. As detailed at length in this Amended Complaint, Defendants orchestrated deceptive marketing and labeling practices. Defendants' customers were uniformly impacted by and exposed to this misconduct. Accordingly, this Amended Complaint is uniquely situated for class-wide resolution, including injunctive relief.

63. The Class is defined as all consumers who purchased the Products anywhere in the United States during the Class Period (the "Class").

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 61 of 86

64. Plaintiffs also seek certification, to the extent necessary or appropriate, of a subclass of individuals who purchased the Products in the State of New York at any time during the Class Period (the "New York Subclass"), of a subclass of individuals who purchased the Products in the State of California at any time during the Class Period (the "California Subclass"), and of a subclass of individuals who purchased the Products in the State of Florida at any time during the Class Period (the "Florida Subclass").

65. Additionally, Plaintiff Alibhai brings this action on behalf of the following subclass: All persons who, during the Class Period, purchased any of Defendants' sunscreen labeled as mineral-based in California ("the "Sunscreen Subclass").

66. The Class, the New York Subclass, the California Subclass, the Florida Subclass, and the Sunscreen Subclass shall be referred to collectively throughout the Amended Complaint as the Class.

67. The Class is properly brought and should be maintained as a class action under Rule 23(a), satisfying the class action prerequisites of numerosity, commonality, typicality, and adequacy because:

68. <u>Numerosity</u>: Class Members are so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable. Plaintiffs believe that there are thousands of consumers who are Class Members who have been damaged by Defendants' deceptive and misleading practices.

69. <u>Commonality</u>: The questions of law and fact common to the Class Members which predominate over any questions which may affect individual Class Members include, but are not limited to:

a. Whether Defendants engaged in fraudulent, unfair, unlawful, or deceptive business practices by falsely representing the ingredients in their Sunscreens;

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 62 of 86

- b. Whether Defendants engaged in fraudulent, unfair, unlawful, or deceptive business practices by representing that their Products are organic;
- c. Whether Plaintiff and the Class are entitled to equitable and/or injunctive relief;
- d. Whether Defendants' fraudulent unlawful, unfair, and deceptive practices harmed Plaintiff and the Class; and
- e. Whether Defendants were unjustly enriched by their deceptive practices.

70. <u>Typicality</u>: Plaintiffs are members of the Class. Plaintiffs' claims are typical of the claims of each Class Member in that every member of the Class was susceptible to the same deceptive, misleading conduct and purchased the Defendants' Products. Plaintiffs are entitled to relief under the same causes of action as the other Class Members.

71. <u>Adequacy</u>: Plaintiffs are adequate Class representatives because their interests do not conflict with the interests of the Class Members they seek to represent; their consumer fraud claims are common to all members of the Class, and they have a strong interest in vindicating their rights; and they have retained counsel competent and experienced in complex class action litigation, and they intend to vigorously prosecute this action. Plaintiffs have no interests which conflict with those of the Class. The Class Members' interests will be fairly and adequately protected by Plaintiffs and their counsel. Defendants have acted in a manner generally applicable to the Class, making relief appropriate with respect to Plaintiffs and the Class Members. The prosecution of separate actions by individual Class Members would create a risk of inconsistent and varying adjudications.

72. The Class is properly brought and should be maintained as a class action under Rule 23(b) because a class action is superior to traditional litigation of this controversy. Pursuant to Rule 23(b)(3), common issues of law and fact predominate over any other questions affecting only individual members of the Class. The Class issues fully predominate over any individual issue because no inquiry into individual conduct is necessary; all that is required is a narrow focus on

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 63 of 86

Defendants' deceptive and misleading marketing and labeling practices. In addition, this Class is

superior to other methods for fair and efficient adjudication of this controversy because, *inter alia*:

73. <u>Superiority</u>: A class action is superior to the other available methods for the fair

and efficient adjudication of this controversy because:

- a. The joinder of thousands of individual Class Members is impracticable, cumbersome, unduly burdensome, and a waste of judicial and litigation resources;
- b. The individual claims of the Class Members may be relatively modest compared with the expense of litigating the claim, thereby making it impracticable, unduly burdensome, and expensive—if not totally impossible—to justify individual actions;
- c. When Defendants' liability has been adjudicated, all Class Members' claims can be determined by the Court and administered efficiently in a manner far less burdensome and expensive than if it were attempted through filing, discovery, and trial of all individual cases;
- d. This class action will promote orderly, efficient, expeditious, and appropriate adjudication and administration of Class claims;
- e. Plaintiffs know of no difficulty to be encountered in the management of this action that would preclude its maintenance as a class action;
- f. This class action will assure uniformity of decisions among Class Members;
- g. The Class is readily definable and prosecution of this action as a class action will eliminate the possibility of repetitious litigation;
- h. Class Members' interests in individually controlling the prosecution of separate actions is outweighed by their interest in efficient resolution by a single class action; and
- i. It would be desirable to concentrate in this single venue the litigation of all Class Members who were induced by Defendants' uniform false advertising to purchase their products as being "organic" or "natural."
- 74. Accordingly, this Class is properly brought and should be maintained as a class

action under Rule 23(b)(3) because questions of law or fact common to Class Members predominate over any questions affecting only individual members and because a class action is superior to other available methods for fairly and efficiently adjudicating this controversy.

## **INJUNCTIVE CLASS RELIEF**

75. Rules 23(b)(1) and (2) contemplate a class action for purposes of seeking classwide injunctive relief. Here, Defendants have engaged in conduct resulting in misleading consumers about ingredients in their Products. Since Defendants' conduct has been uniformly directed at all consumers in the United States, and the conduct continues presently, injunctive relief on a class-wide basis is a viable and suitable solution to remedy Defendants' continuing misconduct. Plaintiffs would purchase the Products again if the ingredients were changed so that they were indeed "organic" and "natural" as represented by Defendants.

76. The injunctive Class is properly brought and should be maintained as a class action under Rule 23(a), satisfying the class action prerequisites of numerosity, commonality, typicality, and adequacy because:

- a. <u>Numerosity</u>: Individual joinder of the injunctive Class Members would be wholly impracticable. Defendants' Products have been purchased by thousands of people throughout the United States;
- b. <u>Commonality</u>: Questions of law and fact are common to members of the Class. Defendants' misconduct was uniformly directed at all consumers. Thus, all Class Members have a common cause against Defendants to stop their misleading conduct through an injunction. Since the issues presented by this injunctive Class deal exclusively with Defendants' misconduct, resolution of these questions would necessarily be common to the entire Class. Moreover, there are common questions of law and fact inherent in the resolution of the proposed injunctive class, including, *inter alia*:
  - i. Resolution of the issues presented in the 23(b)(3) class;
  - ii. Whether Class Members will continue to suffer harm by virtue of Defendants' deceptive Products' marketing and labeling; and
  - iii. Whether, on equitable grounds, Defendants should be prevented from continuing to deceptively mislabel their Products as being "organic" or "natural."
- c. <u>Typicality</u>: Plaintiffs' claims are typical of the claims of the injunctive Class because their claims arise from the same course of conduct (i.e. Defendants' deceptive and misleading marketing, labeling, and advertising practices). Plaintiffs are typical representatives of the Class because, like all members

of the injunctive Class, they purchased Defendants' Products which were sold unfairly and deceptively to consumers throughout the United States.

d. <u>Adequacy</u>: Plaintiffs will fairly and adequately represent and protect the interests of the injunctive Class. Their consumer protection claims are common to all members of the injunctive Class and they have strong interests in vindicating their rights. In addition, Plaintiffs and the Class are represented by counsel who are competent and experienced in both consumer protection and class action litigation.

77. The injunctive Class is properly brought and should be maintained as a class action under Rule 23(b)(2) because Plaintiffs seek injunctive relief on behalf of the Class Members on grounds generally applicable to the entire injunctive Class. Certification under Rule 23(b)(2) is appropriate because Defendants have acted or refused to act in a manner that applies generally to the injunctive Class (i.e. Defendants have marketed their Products using the same misleading and deceptive labeling to all of the Class Members). Any final injunctive relief or declaratory relief would benefit the entire injunctive Class as Defendants would be prevented from continuing their misleading and deceptive marketing practices and would be required to honestly disclose to consumers the nature of the contents of their Products. Plaintiffs would purchase the Products again if the ingredients were changed so that they were indeed "organic" or "natural" as represented by Defendants.

# FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF NEW YORK GBL § 349 (On Behalf of Plaintiff Mayhew and All Class and/or New York Subclass Members)

78. Plaintiff Mayhew repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in all the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

79. New York General Business Law Section 349 ("GBL § 349") declares unlawful "[d]eceptive acts or practices in the conduct of any business, trade, or commerce or in the furnishing of any service in this state."

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 66 of 86

80. The conduct of Defendants alleged herein constitutes recurring, "unlawful" deceptive acts and practices in violation of GBL § 349, and as such, Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members seek monetary damages and the entry of preliminary and permanent injunctive relief against Defendants, enjoining them from inaccurately describing, labeling, marketing, and promoting the Products.

81. There is no adequate remedy at law.

82. Defendants misleadingly, inaccurately, and deceptively presents their Products to consumers.

83. Defendants' improper consumer-oriented conduct—including labeling and advertising the Products as being "organic," "mineral-based," and "natural"—is misleading in a material way in that it, inter alia, induced Plaintiff Mayhew and Class and/or New York Subclass Members to purchase and pay a premium for Defendants' Products and to use the Products when they otherwise would not have. Defendants made their untrue and/or misleading statements and representations willfully, wantonly, and with reckless disregard for the truth.

84. Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members have been injured inasmuch as they paid a premium for products that are—contrary to Defendants' representations—not "organic," "mineral-based," or "natural." Accordingly, Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members received less than what they bargained and/or paid for.

85. Defendants' advertising and Products' packaging and labeling induced Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members to buy Defendants' Products and to pay a premium price for it.

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 67 of 86

86. Defendants' deceptive and misleading practices constitute a deceptive act and practice in the conduct of business in violation of New York General Business Law §349(a) and Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class have been damaged thereby.

87. As a result of Defendants' recurring, "unlawful" deceptive acts and practices, Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members are entitled to monetary, compensatory, treble, and punitive damages; injunctive relief, restitution, and disgorgement of all moneys obtained by means of Defendants' unlawful conduct; and interest, attorneys' fees, and costs.

## SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF NEW YORK GBL § 350 (On Behalf of Plaintiff Mayhew and All Class and/or New York Subclass Members)

88. Plaintiff Mayhew repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in all

the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

89. N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 350 provides, in part, as follows:

False advertising in the conduct of any business, trade or commerce or in the furnishing of any service in this state is hereby declared unlawful.

90. N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 350a(1) provides, in part, as follows:

The term 'false advertising, including labeling, of a commodity, or of the kind, character, terms or conditions of any employment opportunity if such advertising is misleading in a material respect. In determining whether any advertising is misleading, there shall be taken into account (among other things) not only representations made by statement, word, design, device, sound or any combination thereof, but also the extent to which the advertising fails to reveal facts material in the light of such representations with respect to the commodity or employment to which the advertising relates under the conditions proscribed in said advertisement, or under such conditions as are customary or usual . . .

91. Defendants' labeling and advertisements contain untrue and materially misleading

statements concerning Defendants' Products inasmuch as it misrepresented that the Products are

"organic" and "natural."

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 68 of 86

92. Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members have been injured inasmuch as they relied upon the labeling, packaging, and advertising and paid a premium for the Products which are—contrary to Defendants' representations—not "organic," "mineral-based," or "natural." Accordingly, Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members received less than what they bargained and/or paid for.

93. Defendants' advertising, packaging, and products' labeling induced Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members to buy Defendants' Products.

94. Defendants made their untrue and/or misleading statements and representations willfully, wantonly, and with reckless disregard for the truth.

95. Defendants' conduct constitutes multiple, separate violations of N.Y. Gen. Bus. Law § 350.

96. Defendants made the material misrepresentations described in this Amended Complaint in Defendants' advertising and on the Products' packaging and labeling.

97. Defendants' material misrepresentations were substantially uniform in content, presentation, and impact upon consumers at large. Moreover, all consumers purchasing the Products were and continue to be exposed to Defendants' material misrepresentations.

98. As a result of Defendants' recurring, "unlawful" deceptive acts and practices, Plaintiff Mayhew and the Class and/or New York Subclass Members are entitled to monetary, compensatory, treble and punitive damages; injunctive relief, restitution, and disgorgement of all moneys obtained by means of Defendants' unlawful conduct; and interest, attorneys' fees, and costs.

## THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF THE "UNLAWFUL" PRONG OF THE CALIFORNIA UCL (On Behalf of Plaintiff Alibhai and the California and Sunscreen Subclass Members)

99. Plaintiff Alibhai repeats and re-alleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

100. California's Unfair Competition Law ("UCL") prohibits any "unlawful, unfair, or fraudulent" business practice. Cal Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200. Defendants' labeling of their "mineral-based" sunscreens and Products as "organic" and "natural" is "unlawful," "unfair," and "fraudulent."

101. A business practice is "unlawful" under the UCL if it violates any other law or regulation.

102. Defendants' use of the label "Babyganics" is a violation of COPA.

103. As a result of the conduct described above, Defendants have been, and will continue to be, unjustly enriched at the expense of Plaintiff Alibhai and the Class and/or California and Sunscreen Subclass Members. Specifically, Defendants have been enriched by obtaining revenues and profits it would not otherwise have obtained absent their false, misleading, and deceptive practices.

104. Plaintiff Alibhai seeks to enjoin further unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent acts or practices by Defendants, to obtain restitutionary disgorgement of all monies and revenues generated as a result of such practices, and all other relief allowed under California Business & Professions Code § 17200.

## FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF THE "UNFAIR" PRONG OF THE CALIFORNIA UCL (On Behalf of Plaintiff Alibhai and the California and Sunscreen Subclass Members)

105. Plaintiff Alibhai repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 70 of 86

106. California's UCL prohibits any "unlawful, unfair, or fraudulent" business practice.Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200. Defendants' labeling is "unlawful," "unfair," and "fraudulent."

107. A business practice is "unfair" under the UCL if the gravity of the harm to the victim outweighs the utility of the defendant's conduct.

108. Defendants have violated, and continues to violate, the "unfair" prong of the UCL by luring consumers into buying their Products by using the name "Babyganics," and "mineral-based" and "natural" labels discussed herein.

109. The gravity of the harm to Plaintiff Alibhai and the other California and Sunscreen Subclass Members resulting from these unfair acts and practices outweighs any conceivable utility of Defendants' conduct.

110. As a result of the conduct described above, Defendants have been, and will continue to be, unjustly enriched at the expense of Plaintiff Alibhai and the other California and Sunscreen Subclass Members. Specifically, Defendants have been enriched by obtaining revenues and profits it would not otherwise have obtained absent their false, misleading, and deceptive practices.

111. Plaintiff Alibhai seeks to enjoin further unlawful, unfair, and/or fraudulent acts or practices by Defendants, to obtain restitutionary disgorgement of all monies and revenues generated as a result of such practices, and all other relief allowed under California Business & Professions Code § 17200.

### FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF THE "FRAUDULENT" PRONG OF THE CALIFORNIA UCL (On Behalf of Plaintiff Alibhai and the California and Sunscreen Subclass Members)

112. Plaintiff Alibhai repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

California's UCL prohibits any "unlawful, unfair, or fraudulent" business practice.Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17200. Defendants' labeling is "unlawful," "unfair," and "fraudulent."

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 71 of 86

114. A fraudulent business practice is one in which members of the public are likely to be deceived.

115. Defendants have violated, and continues to violate, the "fraudulent" prong of the UCL by deceiving customers in buying their Products with deceptive labeling.

116. As a result of the conduct described above, Defendants have been, and will continue to be, unjustly enriched at the expense of Plaintiff Alibhai and the other California and Sunscreen Subclass Members. Specifically, Defendants have been unjustly enriched by obtaining revenues and profits it would not otherwise have obtained absent their false, misleading, and deceptive practices.

117. Plaintiff Alibhai seeks to enjoin further unlawful, unfair, and fraudulent acts or practices by Defendants, to obtain restitutionary disgorgement of all monies and revenues generated as a result of such practices, and all other relief allowed under California Business & Professions Code § 17200.

#### SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION

# **<u>VIOLATION OF THE CALIFORNIA CONSUMER LEGAL REMEDIES ACT</u>** (On Behalf of Plaintiff Alibhai and the California and Sunscreen Class Members)

118. Plaintiff Alibhai repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

119. This cause of action is brought under the Consumer Legal Remedies Act, California Civil Code §§ 1750 *et seq*.

120. Plaintiff Alibhai, as well as each member of the California Class, constitute a "consumer" within the meaning of Civil Code § 1761(d).

121. Defendants' representations to Plaintiff Alibhai and the other California and Sunscreen Subclass Members that the Products they were receiving were organic, mineral-based, or natural violated (1) Civil Code § 1770(a)(5), which prohibits "[r]epresenting that goods or

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 72 of 86

services have sponsorship, approval, characteristics, ingredients, uses, benefits, or qualities which they do not have or that a person has a sponsorship, approval, status, affiliation, or connection which he or she does not have" and (2) Civil Code § 1770(a)(7), which prohibits "[r]epresenting that goods or services are of a particular standard, quality, or grade, or that goods are of a particular style or model, if they are of another."

122. Under Civil Code § 1780(a)(2), Plaintiff Alibhai, on behalf of herself and the California and Sunscreen Subclasses, requests that this Court enjoin Defendants from continuing to engage in these unlawful and deceptive practices.

123. CLRA SECTION 1782 NOTICE. On December 21, 2015, a CLRA demand letter was sent to Defendant KAS Direct that provided notice of Defendants' violation of the CLRA and demanded Defendants correct, repair, replace, or otherwise rectify the unlawful, unfair, false, and/or deceptive practices complained of herein. The letter also stated that, if Defendants refused to do so, a complaint would be filed seeking damages in accordance with the CLRA. Defendants failed to comply with the letter. Accordingly, pursuant to California Civil Code Section 1780(a)(3), Plaintiff, on behalf of herself and all other California and Sunscreen Subclass Members, seeks compensatory damages, punitive damages, and restitution of any ill-gotten gains due to Defendants' acts and practices.

124. Pursuant to California Civil Code sections 1780 and 1782, Plaintiff and the California and Sunscreen Subclass Members seek damages in an amount to be proven at trial, an injunction to bar Defendants from continuing their deceptive advertising practices, and reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

### SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF THE CALIFORNIA FALSE ADVERTISING LAW (On Behalf of Plaintiff Alibhai and the California and Sunscreen Subclass Members)

125. Plaintiff Alibhai repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

126. This cause of action is brought under California's False Advertising Law, California Business & Professions Code §§ 17500 et seq. ("FAL").

127. The FAL prohibits the dissemination of any advertising which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading. Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code § 17500.

128. Defendants used, and continue to use, labeling—including the terms "Babyganics," "mineral-based," or "natural"—that is untrue and misleading. This labeling is unfair, deceptive, and misleading within the meaning of California Business & Professions Code §§ 17500 et seq.

129. Defendants knew or should have known that their labeling was and is misleading or likely to mislead for the reasons set forth above.

130. Plaintiff Alibhai suffered injury in fact and a loss of money or property as a result of Defendants' acts and practices, which violate California Business & Professions Code §§ 17500 *et seq.* 

# EIGHTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF THE FLORIDA DECEPTIVE AND UNFAIR TRADE PRACTICES <u>ACT</u> (On Behalf of Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass Members)

131. Plaintiff Festa repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

132. This cause of action is brought pursuant to the FDUPTA. The stated purpose of the Act is to "protect the consuming public ... from those who engage in unfair methods of competition,

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 74 of 86

or unconscionable, deceptive, or unfair acts or practices in the conduct of any trade or commerce." Fla. Stat. § 501.202(2).

133. Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass are consumers as defined by Fla. Stat. § 501.203. The Products are goods within the meaning of the Act. Defendants are engaged in trade or commerce within the meaning of the Act.

134. Fla. Stat. § 501.204(1) declares unlawful "[u]nfair methods of competition, unconscionable acts or practices, and unfair or deceptive acts or practices in the conduct of any trade or commerce."

135. Defendants have violated the Act by engaging in the unfair and deceptive practices as described herein which offend public policies and are immoral, unethical, unscrupulous and substantially injurious to consumers.

136. Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass have been aggrieved by Defendants' unfair and deceptive practices in that they paid more for the Products than they otherwise would have as a result of Defendants' misrepresentations.

137. The damages suffered by Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass were directly and proximately caused by the deceptive, misleading and unfair practices of Defendants, as more fully described herein.

138. Pursuant to Fla. Stat. § 501.211(1), Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass seek a declaratory judgment and court order enjoining the above-described wrongful acts and practices of Defendants, as well as for restitution and disgorgement.

139. Additionally, pursuant to Fla. Stat. §§ 501.211(2) and 501.2105, Plaintiff Festa and the Florida Subclass make claims for damages, attorneys' fees and costs.

# NINTH CAUSE OF ACTION BREACH OF NEW YORK EXPRESS WARRANTY (On Behalf of Plaintiff Mayhew and All Class and/or New York Subclass Members)

140. Plaintiff Mayhew repeats and realleges each and every allegation contained in all the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

141. Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members formed a contract with Defendants at the time they purchased the Products. As part of that contract, Defendants represented that the Products were "organic," "mineral-based," "natural," as described above. These representations constitute express warranties and became part of the basis of the bargain between Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members, on the one hand, and Defendants, on the other.

142. Defendants made the above-described representations to induce Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members to purchase the Products, and Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members relied on the representations in purchasing the Products.

143. All conditions precedent to Defendants' liability under the above-referenced contract have been performed by Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members.

144. Defendants breached their express warranties about the Products because, as alleged above, the Products are not "organic," "mineral-based," or "natural." Consequently, Defendants breached New York's warranty laws. N.Y. U.C.C. Law § 2-313.

145. As a result of Defendants' breaches of express warranties, Plaintiff Mayhew, the Class members, and the New York Subclass members were damaged in the amount of the purchase price or a premium they paid for the Products, in an aggregate amount that Plaintiff will prove at trial.

# <u>TENTH CAUSE OF ACTION</u> VIOLATION OF MAGNUSON-MOSS WARRANTY FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION IMPROVEMENT ACT (On Behalf of Plaintiffs and All Class Members)

146. Plaintiffs repeat and reallege each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

147. Plaintiffs bring this claim on behalf of the Class for violation of the Magnuson-Moss Warranty—Federal Trade Commission Improvement Act, 15 U.S.C. § 2301 *et seq.* (the "MMWA").

148. Upon certification, the Class will consist of more than 100 named plaintiffs.

149. Pursuant to the MMWA, "a consumer who is damaged by the failure of a supplier, warrantor, or service contractor to comply with any obligation under [the MMWA], or under a written warranty, implied warranty, or service contract, may bring suit for damages and other legal and equitable relief[.]" 15 U.S.C. § 2310(d)(1).

150. Under the MMWA, "consumer product" means "any tangible personal property which is distributed in commerce and which is normally used for personal, family, or household purposes (including any such property intended to be attached to or installed in any real property without regard to whether it is so attached or installed)." *Id.* § 2301(1).

151. The Products are "consumer products" under the MMWA. Id.

152. Under the MMWA, "consumer" means "a buyer (other than for purposes of resale) of any consumer product, any person to whom such product is transferred during the duration of an implied or written warranty (or service contract) applicable to the product, and any other person who is entitled by the terms of such warranty (or service contract) or under applicable State law to enforce against the warrantor (or service contractor) the obligations of the warranty (or service contract)." *Id.* § 2301(3).

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 77 of 86

153. Plaintiffs and the Class members are "consumers" under the MMWA. Id.

154. Under the MMWA, "supplier" means "any person engaged in the business of making a consumer product directly or indirectly available to consumers." 15 U.S.C. § 2301(4).

155. Defendants are "supplier[s]" under the MMWA. Id.

156. Under the MMWA, "warrantor" means "any supplier or other person who gives or offers to give a written warranty or who is or may be obligated under an implied warranty." *Id.* § 2301(5).

157. Defendants are "warrantor[s]" under the MMWA. Id.

158. Plaintiffs have purchased more than \$25 worth of the Products within the liability period.

159. Packages of the Products can cost more than \$5.

160. By reason of Defendants' breaches of their express warranties concerning the purported "organic," "mineral-based," and "natural" qualities of the Products, Defendants have caused economic damage to Plaintiff and the Class members and has violated the statutory rights due to them under the MMWA.

# ELEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF STATE CONSUMER PROTECTION STATUTES (On Behalf of Plaintiffs and All Class Members)

161. Plaintiffs repeat and reallege each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

162. Plaintiffs bring this claim on behalf of themselves and consumers nationwide.

163. Plaintiff and the Nationwide Class Members have been injured as a result of Defendants' violations of the following state consumer protection statutes, which also provide a basis for redress to Plaintiff and the Nationwide Class Members based on Defendants' fraudulent, deceptive, unfair, and unconscionable acts, practices, and conduct.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 78 of 86

164. Defendants' conduct as alleged herein violates the consumer protection, unfair trade practices and deceptive acts laws of each of the following jurisdictions:

- Alaska: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Alaska's Unfair
   Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Act, Alaska Stat. § 45.50.471, *et seq.*;
- b. Arizona: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Arizona's Consumer Fraud Act, Ariz. Rev. Stat. Ann. §§ 44-1521, *et seq.*;
- c. Arkansas: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Arkansas
   Code Ann. § 4-88-101, *et seq.*;
- d. California: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of California
   Consumer Legal Remedies Act, Civil Code § 1750, *et seq.*, and California's
   Unfair Competition Law, California Business and Professions Code § 17200, *et seq.*;
- e. **Colorado**: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Colorado's Consumer Protection Act, Colo. Rev. Stat. §§ 61-1-101, *et seq.*;
- f. **Connecticut:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Connecticut's Gen. Stat. § 42-110a, *et seq.*;
- g. **Delaware:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Delaware's Consumer Fraud Act, Del. Code Ann. tit. 6, § 2511, *et seq.* and the Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Del. Code Ann. tit. 6, § 2531, *et seq.*;
- h. District of Columbia: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of the District of Columbia's Consumer Protection Act, D.C. Code § 28-3901, *et seq.*;

- i. **Florida:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act, Fla. Stat. Ann. § 501.201, *et seq.*;
- j. Hawaii: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of the Hawaii's Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Haw. Rev. Stat. § 481A-1, *et seq.* and Haw. Rev. Stat. § 480-2;
- k. Idaho: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Idaho's Consumer Protection Act, Idaho Code Ann. § 48-601, *et seq.*
- Illinois: Defendants' acts and practices were and are in violation of Illinois' Consumer Fraud and Deceptive Business Practices Act, 815 Ill. Comp. Stat. 505/2; and Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, 815 Ill. Comp. Stat. 510/2;
- m. Indiana: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Indiana's
   Deceptive Consumer Sales Act, Ind. Code Ann. § 24-5-0.5-1, *et seq.*;
- n. Kansas: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Kansas's
   Consumer Protection Act, Kat. Stat. Ann. § 50-623, *et seq.*;
- Kentucky: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Kentucky's
   Consumer Protection Act, Ky. Rev. Stat. Ann. § 367.110, *et seq.*;
- p. Maine: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of the Maine Unfair Trade Practices Act, 5 Me. Rev. Stat. Ann. Tit. 5, § 205-A, *et seq.* and 10 Me. Rev. Stat. Ann. § 1101, *et seq.*;
- q. Maryland: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Maryland's
   Consumer Protection Act, Md. Code Ann. Com. Law § 13-101, *et seq.*;

- r. Massachusetts: Defendants' practices were unfair and deceptive acts and practices in violation of Massachusetts' Consumer Protection Act, Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 93A, § 2;
- s. **Michigan:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Michigan's Consumer Protection Act, Mich. Comp. Laws Ann. § 445.901, *et seq.*;
- t. **Minnesota:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Minnesota's Prevention of Consumer Fraud Act, Minn. Stat. § 325F.68, *et seq.* and the Unlawful Trade Practices law, Minn. Stat. § 325D.09, *et seq.*;
- Missouri: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Missouri's Merchandising Practices Act, Mo. Rev. Stat. § 407.010, *et seq.*;
- Nebraska: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Nebraska's Consumer Protection Act, Neb. Rev. Stat. § 59-1601, *et seq.* and the Uniform Deceptive Trade Practices Act, § 87-302, *et seq.*;
- w. Nevada: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Nevada's Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Nev. Rev. Stat. Ann. §§ 598.0903 and 41.600;
- New Hampshire: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of New Hampshire's Regulation of Business Practices for Consumer Protection, N.H. Rev. Stat. Ann. § 358-A:1, *et seq.*;
- y. **New Jersey:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of New Jersey's Consumer Fraud Act, N.J. Stat. Ann. § 56:8-1, *et seq.*;
- New Mexico: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of New Mexico's Unfair Practices Act, N.M. Stat. Ann. § 57-12-1, *et seq.*;

- aa. New York: Defendants' practices were in and are in violation of New York's Gen. Bus. Law §§ 349, et seq.;
- bb. North Carolina: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of North Carolina's Unfair Deceptive Trade Practices Act, N.C. Gen. Stat. Ann. § 75-1, *et seq.*;
- North Dakota: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of North Dakota's Unlawful Sales or Advertising Practices law, N.D. Cent. Code § 51-15-01, *et seq.*;
- dd. Ohio: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Ohio's Consumer Sales Practices Act, Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 1345.01, *et seq.* and Ohio's Deceptive Trade Practices Act. Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 4165.01, *et seq.*;
- ee. **Oklahoma:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Oklahoma's Consumer Protection Act, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 15 § 751, *et seq.*, and Oklahoma's Deceptive Trade Practices Act, Okla. Stat. Ann. tit. 78 § 51, *et seq.*;
- ff. **Oregon:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Oregon's Unlawful Trade Practices law, Or. Rev. Stat. § 646.605, *et seq.*;
- gg. Pennsylvania: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Pennsylvania's Unfair Trade Practice and Consumer Protection Law, 73 Pa. Stat. Ann. § 201-1, *et seq.*;
- hh. **Rhode Island:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Rhode Island's Deceptive Trade Practices Act, R.I. Gen. Laws § 6-13.1-1, *et seq.*;

- South Dakota: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of South Dakota's Deceptive Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Act, S.D. Codified Laws § 37-24-1, *et seq.*;
- **Texas:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Texas' Deceptive
   Trade Practices Consumer Protection Act, Tex. Bus. & Com. Code Ann. §
   17.41, *et seq.*;
- kk. Utah: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Utah's Consumer
  Sales Practices Act, Utah Code Ann. § 13-11-1, *et seq.*, and Utah's Truth in
  Advertising Law, Utah Code Ann. § 13-11a-1, *et seq.*;
- 11. Vermont: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Vermont's Consumer Fraud Act, Vt. Stat. Ann. tit. 9 § 2451, *et seq.*;
- mm. Washington: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Washington Consumer Protection Act, Wash. Rev. Code Ann. § 19.86, *et seq.*;
- nn. **West Virginia:** Defendants' practices were and are in violation of West Virginia's Consumer Credit and Protection Act, W. Va. Code § 46A-6-101, *et seq.*;
- oo. Wisconsin: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Wisconsin'sConsumer Act, Wis. Stat. §421.101, *et seq.*; and
- pp. Wyoming: Defendants' practices were and are in violation of Wyoming'sConsumer Protection Act, Wyo. Stat. Ann. §40-12-101, *et seq*.

165. Defendants violated the aforementioned states' unfair and deceptive acts and practices laws by representing the Products are organic, natural, and mineral-based.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 83 of 86

166. Contrary to Defendants' representations, the Products are not organic, natural, and, in the case of the Sunscreens, contain chemical active ingredients.

167. Defendants' misrepresentations were material to Plaintiffs' and Nationwide Class Members' decision to pay a significant premium for the Products.

168. Defendants made their untrue and misleading statements and representations willfully, wantonly, and with reckless disregard for the truth.

169. As a result of Defendants' violations of the aforementioned states' unfair and deceptive practices laws, Plaintiffs and Nationwide Class Members paid a significant premium for the Products as compared to products serving the same purpose.

170. Pursuant to the aforementioned states' unfair and deceptive practices laws, Plaintiffs and Nationwide Class Members are entitled to recover compensatory damages, restitution, punitive, and special damages including but not limited to treble damages, reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, and other injunctive or declaratory relief as deemed appropriate or permitted pursuant to the relevant law.

### <u>TWELFTH CAUSE OF ACTION</u> <u>COMMON LAW UNJUST ENRICHMENT</u> (On Behalf of Plaintiffs and All Class Members in the Alternative)

171. Plaintiffs repeat and reallege each and every allegation contained in the foregoing paragraphs as if fully set forth herein.

172. Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves and consumers nationwide, bring a common law claim for unjust enrichment.

173. Defendants' conduct violated, inter alia, state and federal law by manufacturing, advertising, marketing, and selling their Products while misrepresenting and omitting material facts.

#### Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 84 of 86

174. Defendants' unlawful conduct as described in this Amended Complaint allowed Defendants to knowingly realize substantial revenues from selling their Products at the expense of, and to the detriment or impoverishment of, Plaintiffs and Class Members, and to Defendants' benefit and enrichment. Defendants have thereby violated fundamental principles of justice, equity, and good conscience.

175. Plaintiffs and Class Members conferred significant financial benefits and paid substantial compensation to Defendants for the Products, which was not as Defendants represented them to be.

176. Under New York's common law principles of unjust enrichment, it is inequitable for Defendants to retain the benefits conferred by Plaintiffs' and Class Members' overpayments.

177. Plaintiffs and Class Members seek disgorgement of all profits resulting from such overpayments and establishment of a constructive trust from which Plaintiffs and Class Members may seek restitution.

#### JURY DEMAND

Plaintiffs demand a trial by jury on all issues so properly triable thereby.

#### PRAYER FOR RELIEF

**WHEREFORE**, Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves and the Class, pray for judgment as follows:

A. For an order certifying this case as a class action and appointing Plaintiffs and Plaintiffs' counsel to represent the Class;

B. For an order awarding, as appropriate, damages, restitution, or disgorgement to Plaintiffs and the Class, including all monetary relief to which Plaintiffs and the Class are entitled under applicable law;

## Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 85 of 86

C. For an order requiring Defendants to immediately cease and desist from all fraudulent, deceptive, unlawful, and illegal conduct outlined above;

D. For all equitable remedies available as a result of the fact that the sale of a misbranded product is an illegal contract that is void under applicable law;

- E. For an order awarding attorneys' fees and costs;
- F. For an order awarding punitive damages;
- G. For an order awarding pre-judgment and post-judgment interest; and
- H. For an order providing such further relief as this Court deems just and proper.

Dated: August 7, 2017

# **CUNEO GILBERT & LADUCA, LLP**

By: s/ Charles J. LaDuca

Charles J. LaDuca (Bar ID # 3975927) Katherine Van Dyck 4725 Wisconsin Avenue, NW, Suite 200 Washington, DC 20016 Tel: (202) 789-3960 Fax: (202) 789-1813 <u>charlesl@cuneolaw.com</u> kvandyck@cuneolaw.com

# THE SULTZER LAW GROUP P.C.

Jason P. Sultzer (Bar ID #: JS4546) 85 Civic Center Plaza, Suite 104 Poughkeepsie, NY 12601 Tel: (845) 483-7100 Fax: (888) 749-7747 sultzerj@thesultzerlawgroup.com

# HALUNEN LAW

Melissa W. Wolchansky Amy E. Boyle (*admission forthcoming*) 1650 IDS Center 80 South Eight Street Minneapolis, MN 55402

# Case 7:16-cv-06981-VB Document 45 Filed 08/07/17 Page 86 of 86

Telephone: (612) 605-4098 Facsimile: (612) 605-4099 <u>Wolchansky@halunenlaw.com</u> <u>Boyle@halunenlaw.com</u>

Counsel for Plaintiff and the Class