Civil Action No. 7:12-CV-8187-VB

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ROSEMARY QUINN and ALAN DUCORSKY, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WALGREEN CO.,

Defendant.

DECLARATION OF TODD S. GARBER IN SUPPORT OF UNCONTESTED AMENDED MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

I, Todd S. Garber, declare the following under the penalties of perjury:

1. I am a partner in the law firm of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber,

LLP ("FBFG"), attorneys for Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn and Alan Ducorsky in the above-

captioned action. I respectfully submit this Declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Uncontested

Amended Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement.

2. FBFG was retained by Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn and Alan Ducorsky to

prosecute their claim that Walgreen Co. ("Defendant") unlawfully made misrepresentations to Plaintiffs and other similarly situated consumers when Defendant stated that their joint health dietary supplements ("Covered Products") help "rebuild cartilage," "lubricate joints," and "improve joint comfort."

Background Of The Litigation And Settlement Discussions

3. On November 9, 2012, Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn and Alan Ducorsky filed this action against Walgreen Co. on behalf of New York and Connecticut classes of purchasers of

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95 Filed 07/17/14 Page 2 of 5

Walgreen's Covered Products, entitled *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.) ("*Quinn*"). Prior to filing the action, FBFG spent considerable amount of time identifying and investigating Plaintiffs' claims, including extensive pre-litigation research of the scientific evidence regarding glucosamine/chondroitin by reviewing numerous clinical studies and meta analyses and reviews.

4. On August 7, 2013, this Court denied Defendant Walgreen Co.'s Motion to Dismiss in the *Quinn* action with respect to Plaintiffs' consumer protection and unjust enrichment claims (Dkt. No. 31).

5. On December 12, 2013, the parties engaged in a full-day mediation in San Diego, California before Justice Howard Wiener. While significant progress was made at that mediation, a resolution was not reached. A second mediation was held before Justice Wiener on January 14, 2014, and even then a resolution was not reached. Justice Wiener continued to facilitate settlement discussions by telephone and e-mail, and by March 24, 2014, the counsel for Plaintiffs in the *Quinn, Guilin* and *Eckler* actions and counsel for Defendants reached an agreement in principle to settle all claims arising from all Actions. Thereafter, counsel for Plaintiffs in the *Calvert, Group, Gross, Nunez* and *Nelson* matters joined in further settlement discussions, which were thereafter assisted by Hon. Wayne R. Anderson (retired). Through those additional discussions, counsel for Defendants and Plaintiffs in the *Quinn, Guilin, Eckler, Calvert, Group, Gross, Nunez* and *Nelson* actions reached a global resolution which will settle all claims arising from all Actions.

6. Subsequent to the Court's denial of Defendant's Motion to Dismiss and prior to the Settlement, the parties in the *Quinn* engaged in a 26(f) conference on January 17, 2013 and January 29, 2013. Plaintiffs served their Request for Production and Interrogatories on February

2

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95 Filed 07/17/14 Page 3 of 5

24, 2014. The Court held an Initial Case Management Conference on March 5, 2014 and entered a Civil Case Management Plan.

7. Furthermore, the parties engaged in informal discovery in connection with settlement negotiations, which included the number of Covered Products sold to class members and wholesale price information.

8. Leading up to and including the mediation, Plaintiffs and their counsel considered the uncertainties of trial and the benefits to be obtained under the Settlement, and they have considered the costs, risks, and delays associated with the continued prosecution of this timeconsuming litigation and the likely appeals of any rulings in favor of either Plaintiffs or Defendants. These negotiations culminated in a tentative settlement agreement, which was finalized and signed on July 16, 2014.

Attached as Exhibit 1 hereto is a true and correct copy of the Settlement
Agreement and Release and the accompanying proposed: (1) Claim Form; (2) List of Covered
Products; and (3) Preliminary Approval Order.

10. Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn and Alan Ducorsky have been engaged in the prosecution of this matter since its inception, having consistently conferred with their counsel, reviewed the various complaints and consulted with their counsel regarding the propriety of the settlement.

11. Attached as Exhibit 2 and 3 are the forms of the publication notice and long form notice jointly proposed by the Settling Parties.

FBFG Has Experienced Consumer Class Action Attorneys

12. FBFG will fairly and adequately represent the interests of all class members, and thus satisfies the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 with respect to the

3

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95 Filed 07/17/14 Page 4 of 5

appointment of class counsel. FBFG's attorneys have a proven track record of zealously and successfully advancing the interests of class members in consumer class actions.

13. FBFG's attorneys are highly qualified and have extensive experience in complex civil litigation and consumer class actions. We understand the duties imposed upon class counsel in consumer class actions, and have proven adept at all phases of litigation, from discovery and motion practice to trial and appeal or settlement.

14. FBFG's partners have been recognized as "Super Lawyers" and have been selected by their peers as amongst the New York area's "Best Lawyers." The firm's lawyers have been selected for admission to the Top Trial Lawyers in AmericaTM and to the Litigation Counsel of America's Trial Lawyer Honorary Society, as well as inducted as Fellows in the American Bar Foundation.

15. FBFG attorneys have successfully litigated complex class actions in federal and state courts all across the country, and have obtained successful results for clients against some of the world's largest corporations.

16. A sampling of the Firm's more significant past and present cases can be found in the Firm's Resume attached as Exhibit 4.

17. FBFG is also counsel of record in numerous consumer fraud class actions throughout the country, including cases pending in the United States District Courts for the Southern, Eastern and Western Districts of New York, the Northern and Central Districts of California, the District of New Jersey, the District of Massachusetts, the District of Connecticut, the District of Columbia, the District of Nevada, as well as actions pending in the state courts of New York, Massachusetts and California.

18. FBFG partners have also been named class counsel in numerous state and federal

4

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95 Filed 07/17/14 Page 5 of 5

class actions, as is further detailed in the Firm Resume attached as Exhibit 4.

19. FBFG attorneys have the requisite knowledge of the substantive and procedural law to prosecute this class action. FBFG has committed its resources to the vigorous litigation of this case, has identified appropriate claims, and has aggressively pursued discovery to establish the evidence necessary to obtain class certification and to prevail on the merits.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on July 16, 2014 in White Plains, New York.

> By: <u>/s/ Todd S. Garber</u> Todd S. Garber

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND GENERAL RELEASE

This Settlement Agreement and General Release is entered into between Rosemary Quinn, Alan Ducorsky, Luis Guilin, Kay Eckler, Brian Calvert, Marc Group, John Gross, Christopher Nelson, and Randy Nunez (collectively, "Named Plaintiffs") and Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc. ("Perrigo"). Capitalized terms shall have the meaning ascribed to them in Paragraph 1 of this Settlement Agreement.

RECITALS

A. Perrigo, along with certain affiliated entities, manufactures joint health dietary supplements containing glucosamine and/or chondroitin (the "Covered Products," as more fully defined in Paragraph 1(g) below), which are sold under the various brand names of Retailers not affiliated with Perrigo.

B. On November 1, 2011, a putative class action complaint purporting to assert claims regarding the Covered Products was filed against one such Retailer, Walgreen Co., in the United States District Court for the Northern District of Illinois, namely, *Guilin v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 11-cv-7763 (N.D. Ill.) (Zagel, J.) ("*Guilin*").

C. On March 26, 2012, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against another such Retailer, Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., in the United States District Court for the Southern District of California, namely, *Eckler v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.*, No. 12-cv-727 (S.D. Cal.) (Burns, J.) ("*Eckler*").

D. On November 9, 2012, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against Walgreen Co. in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, namely, *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.) ("*Quinn*").

E. On March 15, 2013, another such putative class action complaint relating to the

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 2 of 47

Covered Products was filed against Supervalu, Inc. in the United States District Court for the Southern District of California, namely, *Nunez v. Supervalu, Inc.*, No. 13cv626 (S.D. Cal. filed March 15, 2013) (Hayes, J.) ("*Nunez*").

F. On August 12, 2013, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against Walgreen Co. in the United States District Court for the Western District of Pennsylvania, namely, *Calvert v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv1161 (W.D. Pa.) (Schwab, J.) ("*Calvert*").

G. On October 28, 2013, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against Walgreen Co. in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida, namely, *Group v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv81105 (S.D. Fla.) (Ryskamp, J.) ("*Group*").

H. On November 1, 2013, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against Walgreen Co. in the United States District Court for the District of New Jersey, namely, *Gross v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv6630 (D.N.J.) (Irenas, J.) ("*Gross*").

I. On November 1, 2013, another such putative class action complaint relating to the Covered Products was filed against Walgreen Co. in the United States District Court for the District of Delaware, namely, *Nelson v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv1871 (D. Del.) (Sleet, J.) ("*Nelson*").

J. The lawsuits referenced in Paragraphs B-I are referred to collectively as "the Litigation."

K. In the Litigation, the plaintiffs allege, *inter alia*, that certain statements made on the labeling and packaging of the Covered Products are false, deceptive and/or misleading. Based upon these and other allegations, the plaintiffs assert violations of consumer protection laws and breaches of warranty under various state laws.

- 2 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 3 of 47

L. Although the Covered Products are not sold under Perrigo's name, but rather under the store brands of the Retailers, Perrigo has assumed the defense of the Litigation on behalf of the Retailers pursuant to certain contractual indemnification provisions.

M. The Defendants deny the allegations in the Litigation and assert defenses and affirmative defenses. The Defendants specifically deny that they have engaged in any wrongdoing whatsoever or that they have any liability in connection with the claims asserted or that could have been asserted in the Litigation.

N. The Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Counsel and the Defendants and Defendants' Counsel have conducted an extensive examination of the facts relating to the Litigation.

O. This Settlement was reached after more than six months of protracted, arms-length negotiations, including multiple full-day mediations before two neutral mediators (Honorable Howard B. Wiener, Justice of the California Court of Appeals (retired) and Honorable Wayne R. Anderson, United States District Judge for the Northern District of Illinois (retired)) and numerous additional telephone conferences with the mediators and negotiating sessions between Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel.

P. The Litigation, if it were to continue, would likely result in expensive and protracted litigation, appeals and continued uncertainty as to outcome.

Q. The Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Counsel have concluded that this Settlement provides substantial benefits to the Settlement Class and the consuming public and resolves all issues that were or could have been raised in the Litigation without prolonged litigation and the risks and uncertainties inherent in litigation.

R. The Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Counsel have concluded that this

- 3 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 4 of 47

Settlement is fair, reasonable, adequate, and in the best interests of the Settlement Class.

S. The Defendants continue to deny each and every allegation of wrongdoing, liability and damages that were or could have been asserted in the Litigation and further continue to deny that the claims in the Litigation would be appropriate for class treatment if the Litigation were to proceed through litigation and trial. Nonetheless, without admitting or conceding any wrongdoing, liability or damages or the appropriateness of the Named Plaintiffs' claims or similar claims for class treatment, the Defendants consent to the Settlement of the Settled Actions solely to avoid the expense, inconvenience and inherent risk of litigation as well as the concomitant disruption of their business operations.

T. Nothing in this Settlement or Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission or concession by the Defendants of the truth of any allegations raised in the Litigation or of any fault, wrongdoing, liability or damages of any kind.

U. This Settlement Agreement, its terms, documents related to it and the negotiations or proceedings connected with it shall not be offered or received into evidence in the Litigation or in any other action or proceeding to establish any liability or admission by the Defendants.

V. **NOW**, **THEREFORE**, in consideration of the foregoing and the mutual covenants, promises and general releases set forth below and subject to preliminary and final approval of the Court pursuant to Rule 23(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Parties hereby agree as follows:

DEFINITIONS

1. As used herein, the following terms (the plural of any of which includes the singular, and vice versa, as made necessary in context) have the meanings set forth below:

(a) "Attorneys' Fee Award" means the Court-approved award to Settlement Class Counsel as defined in Paragraph 22.

- 4 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 5 of 47

(b) "Cash Award" means the cash compensation that Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims shall be entitled to receive as detailed in Paragraph 9.

(c) "Claim Deadline" means sixty (60) Days after the last Class Notice is published or, if such date is not acceptable to the Court, the date set by the Court for Settlement Class members to submit claims, which date will be specified in the Class Notice.

(d) "Claim Form" means the claim form that Settlement Class Members must complete and submit on or before the Claim Deadline in order to be eligible for the benefits described herein, which document shall be substantially in the form of Exhibit A hereto. The Claim Form requires a sworn signature (electronic or written) under penalty of perjury, but does not require a notarization. Additional requirements relating to the completion of Claim Forms are set forth in Paragraphs 17-18. Claim Forms will be processed after the Effective Date.

(e) "Class Notice" means the Court-approved forms of notice to the Settlement Class, which will notify members of the Settlement Class of entry of the Preliminary Approval Order and the scheduling of the Fairness Hearing, among other things.

(f) "Court" means the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York.

(g) "Covered Products" means the joint health dietary supplements manufactured by Perrigo as identified in Exhibit B – List of Covered Products.

(h) "Days" means calendar days, except that when computing any period of time prescribed or allowed by this Settlement Agreement, the day of the act, event or default from which the designated period of time begins to run shall not be included. Furthermore, when computing any period of time prescribed or allowed by this Settlement Agreement, the last day of the period so computed shall be included, unless it is a Saturday, a Sunday or a Federal or State of

- 5 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 6 of 47

New York legal holiday, in which event the period runs until the end of the next day which is not a Saturday, Sunday or Federal or State of New York legal holiday.

(i) "Effective Date" means the date defined in Paragraph 27.

(j) "Fairness Hearing" means the hearing at which the Court orders final approval of the Settlement.

(k) "Final" means final as defined in Paragraph 27(e).

(1) "Final Order and Judgment" means the order defined in Paragraph 26. Any reduction in the Attorneys' Fee Award or Incentive Award shall not be considered a material alteration.

(m) "Incentive Award" means the Court-approved award as defined in Paragraph 23.

(n) "Litigation" means the actions captioned *Guilin v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 11-cv-7763 (N.D. Ill.) (Zagel, J.), *Eckler v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.*, No. 12-cv-727 (S.D. Cal.) (Burns, J.); *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.); *Nunez v. Supervalu, Inc.*, No. 13cv626 (S.D. Cal.) (Hayes, J.); *Calvert v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv1161 (W.D. Pa.) (Schwab, J.); *Group v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv81105 (S.D. Fla.) (Ryskamp, J.), *Gross v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv6630 (D.N.J.) (Irenas, J.); and *Nelson v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv1871 (D. Del.) (Sleet, J.).

(o) "Named Plaintiffs" means Ms. Rosemary Quinn, Mr. Alan Ducorsky, Mr.Luis Guilin, Ms. Kay Eckler, Mr. Brian Calvert, Mr. Marc Group, Mr. John J. Gross, Mr.Christopher Nelson, and Mr. Randy Nunez, each of whom individually is a "Named Plaintiff."

(p) "Net Settlement Fund" means the Settlement Fund <u>less</u> any Notice and Administration Costs, Attorneys' Fee Award, and Incentive Award.

(q) "Notice And Administration Costs" means any and all reasonable and

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 7 of 47

authorized costs and expenses of notice and administration relating to this Settlement, including the fees and costs of an expert to opine on the Settlement Class Notice Program.

(r) "Notice Date" means the first day on which the Settlement Administrator begins disseminating the Class Notice, and shall be no later than ten (10) Days after the Preliminary Approval Date.

(s) "Opt-Out" shall refer to a member of the Settlement Class who properly and timely submits a request for exclusion from the Settlement Class as set forth in Paragraph 21. An Opt-Out may rescind a request for exclusion by submitting a Claim Form to the Settlement Administrator to obtain benefits of the Settlement by the Claim Deadline.

(t) "Opt-Out List" shall refer to the list compiled by the Settlement Administrator pursuant to Paragraph 21(c), identifying those who properly and timely submit a request for exclusion from the Settlement Class and become Opt-Outs.

(u) "Opt-Out and Objection Date" means the date by which a request for exclusion must be filed with the Settlement Administrator in order for a member of the Settlement Class to be excluded from the Settlement Class, and the date by which Settlement Class Members must file objections, if any, to the Settlement. The Opt-Out and Objection Date shall be no later than sixty (60) Days after the last Class Notice is published.

(v) "Parties" means Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Members together with Perrigo. Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Members shall be collectively referred to as one "Party," with Perrigo as the other "Party."

(w) "Perrigo" means Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc. and its parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, predecessors, successors and assigns.

(x) "Person" means an individual, corporation, partnership, limited partnership,

- 7 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 8 of 47

limited liability company, association, member, joint stock company, estate, legal representative, trust, unincorporated association, any business or legal entity, and such individual's or entity's heirs, predecessors, successors, representatives and assignees.

(y) "Preliminary Approval Date" means the date the Preliminary ApprovalOrder has been executed and entered by the Court and received by counsel for the Parties.

(z) "Preliminary Approval Hearing" means the hearing at which the Court considers the Motion for Preliminary Approval.

(aa) "Preliminary Approval Order" means the order defined in Paragraph 25 and attached hereto without material alteration as Exhibit C.

(bb) "Proof of Purchase" means a cash register receipt reflecting the purchase of a Covered Product manufactured by Perrigo and/or its affiliates.

(cc) "Release" means the release and discharge, as of the Effective Date, by the Named Plaintiffs and all Settlement Class Members (and their respective present, former and future administrators, agents, assigns, attorneys, executors, heirs, partners, predecessors-in-interest and successors) who have not excluded themselves from the Settlement Class of the Released Persons and shall include the agreement and commitment by the Named Plaintiffs and all Settlement Class Members to not now or hereafter initiate, maintain or assert against the Released Persons or any of them any and all causes of action, claims, rights, demands, actions, claims for damages, equitable, legal and/or administrative relief, interest, demands or rights, including without limitation, claims for damages of any kind, including those in excess of actual damages, whether based on federal, state or local law, statute, ordinance, regulation, contract, common law or any other sources that have been, could have been, may be or could be alleged or asserted now or in the future by the Named Plaintiffs or any Settlement Class Members against the Released

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 9 of 47

Persons, or any of them, in the Litigation or in any other court action or before any administrative body (including any regulatory entity or organization), tribunal, arbitration panel or other adjudicating body arising out of or related to the Released Claims.

"Released Claims" means any and all claims, actions, causes of action, (dd)rights, demands, suits, debts, liens, contracts, agreements, offsets or liabilities (including but not limited to tort claims, negligence claims, claims for breach of contract, breach of the duty of good faith and fair dealing, breach of statutory duties, actual or constructive fraud, misrepresentations, fraudulent inducement, statutory and consumer fraud, breach of fiduciary duty, unfair business or trade practices, false advertising, restitution, rescission, unjust enrichment, compensatory and punitive damages, injunctive or declaratory relief, attorneys' fees, interests, costs, penalties and any other claims), whether known or unknown, alleged or not alleged, foreseen or unforeseen, suspected or unsuspected, contingent or matured, liquidated or unliquidated, under federal, state or local law, whether by statute, contract, common law, or equity, which the Named Plaintiffs and/or any Settlement Class Member had, now has or may in the future have with respect to any conduct, act, omissions, facts, matters, transactions or oral or written statements or occurrences arising from or relating to the causes of action and allegations made in the Litigation as well as claims and allegations that the Released Persons made false and deceptive representations and warranties and/or omitted material information about the Covered Products (including, without limitation, causes of action for violation of the California Consumers Legal Remedies Act, the California Business & Professions Code, the Illinois Consumer Fraud Act, the Connecticut Unfair Trade Practices Act, the New York General Business Law, the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act, the Pennsylvania Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law, the New Jersey Consumer Fraud Act, the Delaware Consumer Fraud Act and similar claims under the

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 10 of 47

consumer protection and/or deceptive trade practices acts and common law of the other states and the District of Columbia as well as for negligence and breaches of express warranties)). Expressly excluded from the Released Claims are any claims alleging personal physical injury arising from the use of the Covered Products.

(ee) "Released Persons" means: (i) Perrigo; (ii) the Defendants; (iii) any past, present, and future Person in the chain of distribution of the Covered Products, including but not limited to (a) raw material suppliers, (b) distributors, and (c) Retailers; (iv) any Person that manufactured or sold the Covered Products from which Perrigo or its affiliates acquired assets or contracts; (v) the past, present, and future affiliates of any of the foregoing Persons described in (i) – (iv) of this Paragraph; (vi) each of the respective past, present, and future direct and indirect predecessors, successors, heirs, assigns, parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, joint venturers, partnerships, limited liability companies, corporations, unincorporated entities, divisions, or groups, of any of the foregoing Persons described in (i) – (v) of this Paragraph; and (vii) each of the respective past, present, and future directors, officers, shareholders, members, employees, consultants, advisors, insurers, attorneys, executors, partners, agents, personal representatives, spouses and immediate families, of any of the foregoing Persons described in (i) – (vii) of this Paragraph.

(ff) "Releasing Persons" means (i) the Named Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves and all Settlement Class Members, (ii) all Settlement Class Members, and (iii) the respective past, present, and future administrators, agents, assigns, attorneys, executors, heirs, partners, personal representatives, spouses, insurers, immediate families, predecessors-in-interest and successors of each of the Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Members.

(gg) "Retailers" means Persons and their past, present, and future affiliates that

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 11 of 47

sell, have sold, or will sell the Covered Products manufactured by Perrigo and/or its affiliates, including but not limited to: Supervalu, Inc., Wal-Mart Stores Inc.; and Walgreen Co.

(hh) "Settled Actions" means the actions captioned *Guilin v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 11-cv-7763 (N.D. Ill.) (Zagel, J.), *Eckler v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.*, No. 12-cv-727 (S.D. Cal.) (Burns, J.); *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.); *Nunez v. Supervalu, Inc.*, No. 13cv626 (S.D. Cal.) (Hayes, J.); *Calvert v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv1161 (W.D. Pa.) (Schwab, J.); *Group v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv81105 (S.D. Fla.) (Ryskamp, J.), *Gross v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv6630 (D.N.J.) (Irenas, J.); and *Nelson v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv1871 (D. Del.) (Sleet, J.).

(ii) "Settlement" means the settlement set forth in this Settlement Agreement.

(jj) "Settlement Administrator" means both Heffler Claims Group, which will administer the Class Notice, and Garden City Group, which will maintain the Settlement Website, review and process claims and administer the Settlement in accordance with this Settlement Agreement and engage in any other tasks directed by the Court, Settlement Class Counsel or Defendants' Counsel.

(kk) "Settlement Agreement" means this Settlement Agreement and General Release, including all exhibits hereto.

(ll) "Settlement Class" means all Persons who fall within the definition of the class identified in Paragraph 4.

(mm) "Settlement Class Counsel" means Todd S. Garber of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP; Elaine A. Ryan of Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C.; Stewart M. Weltman of Stewart M. Weltman, LLC; R. Bruce Carlson and Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr. of Carlson Lynch, LTD; Todd Carpenter of Carpenter Law Group; and James Patterson

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 12 of 47

of Patterson Law Group, APC.

(nn) "Settlement Class Members" means all Persons in the Settlement Class who do not validly exclude themselves (i.e., become Opt-Outs) pursuant to Paragraph 21.

(oo) "Settlement Class Notice Program" means the notice program as described in the Motion for Preliminary Approval.

(pp) "Settlement Fund" means the amount of two million eight hundred thousand dollars (\$2,800,000). Apart from funding the Settlement Fund (the payment of which is the obligation of Perrigo alone), neither Perrigo, the Defendants, nor the Released Parties shall have any monetary responsibility under the Settlement Agreement. The Settlement Fund will be used to pay any Cash Award, Notice and Administration Costs, Attorneys' Fee Award, and Incentive Award.

(qq) "Settlement Website" means the dedicated website created and maintained by the Settlement Administrator which will contain relevant documents and information about the Settlement, including this Settlement Agreement, the Class Notice and the Claim Form.

(rr) "Defendants" means Perrigo (solely for purposes of this Settlement), Wal-Mart Stores Inc., Walgreen Co, and Supervalu, Inc.

(ss) "Defendants' Counsel" means Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP.

(tt) "Valid Claim" means a timely and fully completed Claim Form submitted by a Settlement Class Member as more fully described in Paragraph 18.

FILING OF AMENDED COMPLAINT FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES ONLY

2. <u>Amended Class Action Complaint</u>. Solely for the purposes of implementing this Settlement Agreement and effectuating the Settlement, Named Plaintiffs will file an Amended Class Action Complaint in *Quinn* on behalf of the Settlement Class naming Perrigo as a defendant along with Wal-Mart Stores Inc., Walgreen Co., and Supervalu, Inc. The filing of this Amended

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 13 of 47

Class Action Complaint is purely for settlement purposes. The Parties agree that Perrigo does not concede that it would be subject to suit in *Quinn* or that Named Plaintiffs or the Settlement Class would have standing to sue Perrigo absent Perrigo's consent, which is provided for settlement purposes only. If the Settlement is terminated for any reason, the Parties agree that the Amended Class Action Complaint will be withdrawn and that the separate complaints in the Settled Actions will again be the operative complaints in those cases.

STAY OF LITIGATION

3. <u>Stay</u>. Upon execution of this Settlement Agreement, the Parties shall immediately and jointly move for a stay or administrative closure of all proceedings in *Guilin, Eckler, Calvert, Group, Gross, Nelson,* and *Nunez* pending approval of the Settlement, unless such a stay or administrative closure is already in place, and a stay of all proceedings in *Quinn* other than proceedings to consider approval of the Settlement. The stays or administrative closures in *Guilin, Eckler, Calvert, Group, Gross, Nelson,* and *Nunez* shall, whether through entry of a new order or modification of a current order, specifically exclude from their scope those actions necessary to effectuate the filing of the Amended Class Action Complaint contemplated by Paragraph 2.

PROPOSED CLASS FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES

4. <u>Settlement Class Definition</u>. Solely for the purposes of implementing this Settlement Agreement and effectuating the Settlement, Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23, the Parties hereto agree to certification of the following Settlement Class:

All residents of the United States who purchased for personal use, and not resale or distribution, a Covered Product between November 1, 2005 and the Preliminary Approval Date.

Specifically excluded from the Settlement Class are the following Persons: (i) Defendants and their respective affiliates, employees, officers, directors, agents, and representatives and their immediate family members; (ii) Settlement Class Counsel; and (iii) the judges who have presided over the Litigation and their immediate family members.

5. <u>Settlement Class Counsel</u>. Solely for the purpose of implementing this Settlement Agreement and effectuating the Settlement, the Parties stipulate to the entering of an order preliminarily certifying the Settlement Class, appointing the Named Plaintiffs as representatives of the Settlement Class and appointing the following four counsel as representatives of the Settlement Class Counsel for the Settlement Class:

Todd S. Garber **Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP** 1311 Mamaroneck Avenue White Plains, New York 10605 <u>tgarber@fbfglaw.com</u> Telephone: (914) 298-3281

Stewart M. Weltman **Stewart M. Weltman, LLC** 53 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 364 Chicago, IL 60604 <u>sweltman@weltmanlawfirm.com</u> Telephone: (602) 274-1100 (Of Counsel Levin Fishbein Sedran & Berman) Elaine A. Ryan Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C. 2325 E. Camelback Road, #300 Phoenix, AZ 5016 eryan@bffb.com Telephone: (602) 274-1100

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr. **Carlson Lynch LTD** PNC Park 115 Federal Street, Suite 210 Pittsburgh, PA 15212 <u>ekilpela@carlsonlynch.com</u>

6. <u>Settlement Administrator</u>. Solely for the purpose of implementing this Settlement Agreement and effectuating the Settlement, the Parties stipulate to the Court entering an order appointing Heffler Claims Group and Garden City Group, jointly, as the Settlement Administrator.

7. <u>Adequacy</u>. Solely for the purpose of implementing this Settlement Agreement and effectuating the Settlement, the Parties stipulate to the Court entering an order preliminarily

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 15 of 47

finding that the Named Plaintiffs and Settlement Class Counsel are adequate representatives of the Settlement Class.

8. <u>Settlement Purposes Only</u>. Defendants do not agree to the certification of any class or to the appointment or adequacy of the Named Plaintiffs or Settlement Class Counsel for any purpose other than to implement the Settlement Agreement and effectuate the Settlement.

BENEFITS TO THE CLASS

9. <u>Payment Of Claims</u>. Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims shall look solely to the Net Settlement Fund for payment of such claims, and shall be entitled to receive Cash Awards from the Net Settlement Fund as follows, to be funded by Perrigo and the obligation of Perrigo alone (rather than the Retailers):

(a) Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims accompanied by Proof of Purchase shall receive the receipt price of each bottle of Covered Product, with no cap or limit on the number of such claims a Settlement Class Member may make.

(b) Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims without Proof of Purchase shall receive \$12.00 per bottle of Covered Product, up to a maximum of eight (8) bottles per household.

(c) Settlement Class Members may submit Valid Claims accompanied by Proof of Purchase for any number of Covered Products and without Proof of Purchase for other Covered Products up to a maximum of eight (8) bottles per household.

(d) If the payments calculated under Paragraphs 9(a) and 9(b) exceed the monies available in the Net Settlement Fund, payments to all Settlement Class Members who submitted a Valid Claim will be reduced pro rata.

(e) If there are leftover monies available in the Net Settlement Fund subsequent to calculating the payments to be made pursuant to Paragraphs 9(a), 9(b), and 9(c), payment shall

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 16 of 47

be tripled for each Valid Claim submitted with Proof of Purchase. If the tripling of the payments calculated pursuant to Paragraph 9(e) exceeds the monies available in the Net Settlement Fund, the payments after tripling for all Valid Claims submitted with Proof of Purchase will be reduced pro rata.

(f) If there are leftover monies available in the Net Settlement Fund subsequent to calculating the payments to be made pursuant to Paragraph 9(e), payment shall be doubled for each Valid Claim submitted without Proof of Purchase. If the doubling of the payments calculated pursuant to Paragraph 9(f) exceeds the monies available in the Net Settlement Fund, the payments after doubling for all Valid Claims submitted without Proof of Purchase will be reduced pro rata.

(g) If there are leftover monies available in the Net Settlement Fund subsequent to calculating the payments to be made pursuant to Paragraph 9(f), the remaining funds will be distributed pro rata to all Settlement Class Members who submitted a Valid Claim.

(h) Except as otherwise provided herein, all payments to Settlement ClassMembers who submit Valid Claims will be made within thirty (30) Days after the Effective Date.

(i) The details, requirements, terms and limits of the claims process are further defined in Paragraphs 17-18.

10. **Labeling Changes**. Without admitting wrongdoing or liability and solely to avoid the cost and disruption of further litigation, Perrigo agrees that for a period of twenty four (24) months commencing nine (9) months after the Effective Date, Perrigo will (i) include the language "individual results may vary" on the labels of the Covered Products and/or any other Perrigomanufactured glucosamine and/or chondroitin products offered for resale, and (ii) will remove references to "rebuilding," "renewing" "regrowing," "growing," "adding" or "regenerating" cartilage on the labels of the Covered Products and any other Perrigo-manufactured glucosamine

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 17 of 47

and/or chondroitin products offered for resale.

(a) The labeling changes described in this Paragraph are not an admission by Defendants regarding the claims in the Litigation or the propriety of statements used or omitted on other versions of the packaging of the Covered Products.

(b) Perrigo shall have nine (9) months from the Effective Date to begin shippingCovered Products with labels and/or packaging that conform to the terms of the Settlement.

(c) Neither Perrigo nor any of the Retailers nor any Person in the chain of distribution of the Covered Products shall be required to recall, remove from shelves or pull from distribution or inventory any Covered Products that have been shipped by Perrigo prior to the date commencing nine (9) months after the Effective Date.

(d) If, after the date of Final Approval, Perrigo becomes aware of additional evidence substantiating that the Covered Products rebuild, renew, regrow, grow, add to or regenerate cartilage, Perrigo may seek the agreement of Settlement Class Counsel to modify Paragraph 10 of the Settlement Agreement. If the Parties are not able to agree, Perrigo may seek relief from the Court.

RELEASE OF CLAIMS

11. <u>Release Provisions</u>. As of the Effective Date, the Releasing Persons are deemed to have fully released and forever discharged the Released Persons of and from all Released Claims by operation of entry of the Final Order and Judgment.

(a) Subject to Court approval, all Settlement Class Members who have not validly excluded themselves from the Settlement Class shall be bound by this Settlement Agreement and the Release and all of their claims shall be dismissed with prejudice and released, irrespective of whether they received actual notice of this Settlement.

(b) Without in any way limiting the scope of the Release, this Release covers

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 18 of 47

any and all claims for attorneys' fees, costs or disbursements incurred by Settlement Class Counsel or any other counsel representing the Named Plaintiffs or Settlement Class Members, or any of them, in connection with or related in any manner to the Litigation, the Settlement, the administration of such Settlement and/or the Released Claims as well as any and all claims for the Incentive Award to the Named Plaintiffs and the Attorneys' Fee Award to Settlement Class Counsel.

(c) Nothing in the Releases shall preclude any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, including participation in any of the processes detailed herein.

12. <u>Release of Unknown Claims</u>. The Releasing Persons and the Released Persons expressly acknowledge that they are familiar with principles of law such as Section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California, which provides:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MIGHT HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

Notwithstanding California or other law, the Releasing Persons and the Released Persons hereby expressly agree that the provisions, rights and benefits of Section 1542 and all similar federal or state laws, rights, rules or legal principles of any other jurisdiction that may be applicable herein are hereby knowingly and voluntarily waived, released and relinquished to the fullest extent permitted by law solely in connection with unknown claims that are the same as, substantially similar to, or overlap the Released Claims, and the Releasing Persons and the Released Persons hereby agree and acknowledge that this is an essential term of the Releases. In connection with the Release, the Releasing Persons and the Released Persons acknowledge that they are aware that they may hereafter discover claims presently unknown and unsuspected or facts in addition to or different from those which they now know or believe to be true with respect to matters released

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 19 of 47

herein, and that such claims, to the extent that they are the same as, substantially similar to, or overlap the Released Claims, are hereby released, relinquished and discharged.

13. <u>Continuation of Labeling Changes.</u> Perrigo may elect, in its sole discretion, to continue the label changes identified in Paragraph 10 beyond the twenty-four (24) month required period. For as long as Perrigo continues to comply with the terms of Paragraph 10 beyond the twenty-four (24) month required period, no Releasing Party may sue any Released Party based on any claim that was or could have been asserted in the Litigation.

14. <u>Additional Releases</u>. Except as to the rights and obligations provided for under this Agreement, Perrigo releases and forever discharges as of the Effective Date the Named Plaintiffs, Settlement Class, and Settlement Class Counsel from any and all claims, actions, causes of action, rights, demands, suits, debts, liens, contracts, agreements, offsets or liabilities, whether known or unknown, alleged or not alleged, foreseen or unforeseen, suspected or unsuspected, contingent or matured, liquidated or unliquidated, under federal, state or local law, whether by statute, contract, common law, or equity, which Perrigo had, now has or may in the future have against the Named Plaintiffs, Settlement Class Members, or Settlement Class Counsel with respect to any conduct, act, omissions, facts, matters, transactions or oral or written statements or occurrences arising out of the Litigation and/or the Settlement.

SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATION

15. <u>Settlement Administrator</u>. The Settlement Administrator will work under the direction of Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel, subject to the directions of the Court, in implementing the Settlement Class Notice Program and advising each member of the Settlement Class of his/her right to submit a Claim Form, object to the Settlement, or opt-out of the Settlement.

16. **Payment of Notice and Administration Costs**. After entry of the Preliminary

- 19 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 20 of 47

Approval Order, Perrigo shall pay reasonable Notice and Administration Costs arising under this Settlement Agreement by making such payments directly to the Settlement Administrator (or to such other party incurring such costs) as those costs are incurred and payment becomes due. Perrigo shall pay Notice and Administration costs of up to \$800,000. Such payments to the Settlement Administrator shall be paid from the Settlement Fund. If Notice and Administration Costs exceed \$800,000, Perrigo may, in its sole discretion, elect to withdraw from the Settlement Agreement pursuant to Paragraph 32.

17. **Submission Of Claims**. The Class Notice shall provide information regarding the filing of Claim Forms. Claim Forms shall be available from the Settlement Administrator and on the Settlement Website. To file a Valid Claim, Settlement Class Members must: (i) complete a Claim Form, providing all of the information and documentation required by the Settlement Agreement and the Claim Form; (ii) sign the Claim Form and state under penalty of perjury that the Settlement Class Member purchased Covered Products and the number of Covered Products purchased; (iii) indicate whether he or she is enclosing Proof of Purchase with his or her Claim Form and, if so, provide the same with the completed Claim Form; and (iv) return the completed and signed Claim Form and Proof of Purchase, if any, to the Settlement Administrator no later than sixty (60) Days after the last Class Notice is published, *i.e.*, the Claim Deadline. Class Members may submit their claims on-line via the Settlement Website. Only Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims shall be entitled to a Cash Award.

18. **Determination Of Validity**. The Settlement Administrator shall be responsible for reviewing all claims to determine their validity.

(a) Any claim that is not substantially in compliance with the instructions on the Claim Form or the terms of this Settlement Agreement or is postmarked or submitted

- 20 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 21 of 47

electronically later than the Claim Deadline, shall be rejected.

(b) Following the Claim Deadline, the Settlement Administrator shall provide a report of any rejected claims to Defendants' Counsel and Settlement Class Counsel. If Settlement Class Counsel do not agree with the rejection of a claim, they shall bring it to the attention of Defendants' Counsel, and the Parties shall meet and confer and attempt, in good faith, to resolve any dispute regarding the rejected claim. Following their meet and confer, the Parties will provide the Settlement Administrator with their positions regarding the disputed, rejected claim. The Settlement Administrator, after considering the positions of the Parties, will make the final decision in its sole discretion.

19. <u>Fraudulent Filings</u>. At any time during the claims process, if the Settlement Administrator has a reasonable suspicion of fraud, the Settlement Administrator shall immediately notify both Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel of that fact and the basis for its suspicion. Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel shall endeavor to reach an agreed appropriate solution to any suspected fraud and, if necessary, Defendants' Counsel may suspend the claims process, and the Parties will promptly seek assistance from the Court.

OBJECTIONS AND OPT-OUT RIGHTS

20. **Objections**. Any Settlement Class Member who intends to object must do so on or before the Opt-Out and Objection Date.

(a) In order to object, the Settlement Class Member must include in the objection submitted to the Court and served on Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel: (i) the name, address and telephone number of the Person objecting and, if represented by counsel, of his/her counsel; (ii) a signed declaration stating that he or she is a member of the Settlement Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products; (iii) a statement of all objections to the Settlement; and (iv) a statement of whether he or she intends to appear at the

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 22 of 47

Fairness Hearing, either with or without counsel, and if with counsel, the name of his or her counsel who will attend.

(b) Any Settlement Class Member who fails to file and serve timely a written objection and notice of his or her intent to appear at the Fairness Hearing pursuant to this Paragraph and as detailed in the Class Notice, shall not be permitted to object to the approval of the Settlement at the Fairness Hearing.

21. **Opt-Outs**. A member of the Settlement Class who wishes to opt-out of the Settlement Class must complete and send to the Settlement Administrator a request for exclusion that is post-marked no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date. The request for exclusion must be personally signed by the member of the Settlement Class requesting exclusion, contain a statement that indicates his or her desire to be excluded from the Settlement Class and contain a statement that he or she is otherwise a member of the Settlement Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products. A member of the Settlement Class may opt-out on an individual basis only; so-called "mass" or "class" opt-outs shall not be allowed.

(a) Except for those members of the Settlement Class who timely and properly file a request for exclusion, all members of the Settlement Class will be deemed to be Settlement Class Members for all purposes under the Settlement Agreement, and upon the Effective Date, will be bound by its terms, regardless of whether they file a Claim Form or receive any monetary relief.

(b) Any member of the Settlement Class who properly opts out of the Settlement Class shall not: (i) be bound by any orders or judgments entered in the Settled Actions relating to the Settlement; (ii) be entitled to relief under, or be affected by, the Settlement Agreement; (iii) gain any rights by virtue of the Settlement Agreement; or (iv) be entitled to object

- 22 -

to any aspect of the Settlement.

(c) The Settlement Administrator shall provide Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel with the Opt-Out List within five (5) Days after the Opt-Out and Objection Date.

ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS AND INCENTIVE AWARDS

22. <u>Attornevs' Fee Award</u>. On or before seven (7) calendar days prior to the Opt-Out and Objection Date, the law firms of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Barber, LLP; Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C.; Stewart M. Weltman, LLC; Carlson Lynch, LTD; Carpenter Law Group; and Patterson Law Group, APC will apply to the Court for an aggregate award of attorneys' fees and actual expenses (including their court costs) in an amount not to exceed one third of the Settlement Fund. Defendants will not oppose application(s) for an Attorneys' Fee Award of up to an aggregate amount of one third of the Settlement Fund. Settlement Class Counsel agree that upon payment by Perrigo of the Attorneys' Fee Award as directed by the Court (which unless directed otherwise by the Court, shall be paid by Perrigo within fourteen (14) Days after the Effective Date), Perrigo's obligations to Settlement Class Counsel shall be fully satisfied and discharged, and Settlement Class Counsel shall have no further or other claim against Defendants, including but not limited to a claim for enforcement of any attorneys' lien.

23. <u>Incentive Awards</u>. The Named Plaintiffs will apply collectively for Incentive Awards not to exceed \$5,000 per Named Plaintiff. Defendants agree not to object to the Named Plaintiffs' application for such Incentive Awards and Perrigo agrees to pay from the Settlement Fund any Incentive Award (not to exceed \$5,000 to each Named Plaintiff) that is awarded by the Court (which unless directed otherwise by the Court, shall be paid by Perrigo within fourteen (14) Days after the Effective Date).

- 23 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 24 of 47

24. <u>No Effect On Finality</u>. Any order or proceedings relating to the applications for the Attorneys' Fee Award and the Incentive Award, or any appeal from any order relating thereto or reversal or modification thereof, will not operate to terminate or cancel this Agreement, or affect or delay the finality of the Final Order and Judgment approving the Settlement Agreement and the Settlement.

SETTLEMENT APPROVAL PROCESS

25. After execution of this Settlement Agreement, the Parties shall promptly move the Court to enter the Preliminary Approval Order that is without material alteration from Exhibit C hereto, which:

(a) Preliminarily approves this Settlement Agreement;

(b) Preliminarily certifies the Settlement Class solely for purposes of effectuating the Settlement;

(c) Finds that the proposed Settlement is sufficiently fair, reasonable and adequate to warrant providing notice to the Settlement Class;

(d) Schedules a Fairness Hearing on final approval of this Settlement and Settlement Agreement to consider the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the proposed Settlement and whether it should be finally approved by the Court, such Fairness Hearing to take place not less than eighty (80) Days after the Preliminary Approval Date, unless a longer period is required under 28 U.S.C. § 1715(b), the Class Action Fairness Act notice requirement;

(e) Appoints the Settlement Administrator in accordance with Paragraph 6 of this Settlement Agreement;

(f) Approves the Class Notice, and directs the Settlement Administrator to disseminate the Class Notice in accordance with the Settlement Class Notice Program;

(g) Finds that the Settlement Class Notice Program: (i) is the best practicable

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 25 of 47

notice, (ii) is reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise the Settlement Class of the pendency of the Litigation and of their right to object to or to exclude themselves from the proposed settlement, (iii) is reasonable and constitutes due, adequate and sufficient notice to all Persons entitled to receive notice, and (iv) meets all requirements of applicable law;

(h) Requires the Settlement Administrator to file proof of compliance with the Settlement Class Notice Program at or before the Fairness Hearing;

(i) Approves the Claim Form, the content of which is without material alteration from Exhibit A to this Settlement Agreement, and sets a Claim Deadline;

(j) Approves the creation of the Settlement Website in accordance with the terms of this Settlement Agreement;

(k) Requires any member of the Settlement Class who wishes to exclude himself or herself from the Settlement Class to submit an appropriate, timely request for exclusion, postmarked no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date, or as the Court may otherwise direct, to the Settlement Administrator at the address on the Class Notice;

(1) Orders that any member of the Settlement Class who does not submit a timely, written request for exclusion from the Settlement Class (i.e., becomes an Opt-Out) will be bound by all proceedings, orders and judgments in *Quinn*, even if such Settlement Class Member has previously initiated or subsequently initiates individual litigation or other proceedings encompassed by the Release;

(m) Requires any Settlement Class Member who does not become an Opt-Out and who wishes to object to the fairness, reasonableness or adequacy of this Settlement or Settlement Agreement to file with the Court and serve on Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date, or as the Court may otherwise

- 25 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 26 of 47

direct, a statement of the objection signed by the Settlement Class Member containing all of the following information: (i) The objector's full name, address, and telephone number; (ii) A signed declaration that he or she is a member of the Settlement Class and purchased the Covered Product(s); (iii) A written statement of all grounds for the objection; (iv) A statement of whether the objector intends to appear at the Fairness Hearing; and (v) If the objector intends to appear at the Fairness Hearing through counsel, the objection must also identify the attorney representing the objector who will appear at the Fairness Hearing;

(n) Any response to an objection shall be filed with the Court no later than three(3) Days prior to the Fairness Hearing;

(o) Specifies that any Settlement Class Member who does not file a timely written objection to the Settlement or who fails to otherwise comply with the requirements of Paragraph 20 of this Settlement Agreement shall be foreclosed from seeking any adjudication or review of this Settlement by appeal or otherwise;

(p) Requires by no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date (or as the Court otherwise may direct) any attorney hired by a Settlement Class Member for the purpose of objecting to the proposed Settlement, the Attorneys' Fee Award or the Incentive Award who intends to make an appearance at the Fairness Hearing to file with the Clerk of the Court a notice of intention to appear and provide a copy of said notice to the Settlement Administrator (who shall forward it to Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel);

(q) Requires that any Settlement Class Member who files and serves a written objection and who intends to make an appearance at the Fairness Hearing shall so state in his or her objection papers;

(r) Directs the Settlement Administrator to establish a post office box in the

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 27 of 47

name of the Settlement Administrator to be used for receiving requests for exclusion and any other communications, and providing that only the Settlement Administrator, Settlement Class Counsel, Defendants' Counsel, the Court, the Clerk of the Court and their designated agents shall have access to this post office box, except as otherwise provided in this Settlement Agreement;

(s) Directs that Settlement Class Counsel shall file their applications for the Attorneys' Fee Award and Named Plaintiffs' Incentive Award in accordance with the terms set forth in Paragraphs 22-23 of this Settlement Agreement;

(t) Orders the Settlement Administrator to provide the Opt-Out List to Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel no later than five (5) Days after the Opt-Out and Objection Date, and then file with the Court the Opt-Out List with an affidavit attesting to the completeness and accuracy thereof no later than three (3) Days thereafter;

(u) **Preliminary Injunction.** In further aid of the Court's jurisdiction to implement and enforce the Settlement, provides that Named Plaintiffs and members of the Settlement Class and their counsel are preliminarily enjoined and barred (solely during the period from entry of the Preliminary Approval Order until the decision whether to grant a Final Order and Judgment after the Fairness Hearing) from (i) filing, commencing, prosecuting, intervening in or participating (as a plaintiff, claimant, class member, or otherwise) in any other lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding in any jurisdiction based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims (unless and until they have timely excluded themselves from the Settlement Class); (ii) filing, commencing, participating in or prosecuting (including by seeking to amend a pending complaint to include class allegations or seeking class certification in a pending action) a lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding as a class

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 28 of 47

action based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims where the purported class would include any member of the Settlement Class; and (iii) attempting to effect Opt-Outs of a class of individuals in any lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims. Any Person who knowingly violates such injunction shall pay the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Defendants and/or any other Released Person and Settlement Class Counsel as a result of the violation. This Settlement Agreement is not intended to prevent members of the Settlement Class from participating in any action or investigation initiated by a state or federal agency; and

(v) Contains any additional provisions agreeable to the Parties that might be necessary or advisable to implement the terms of this Settlement Agreement and the proposed settlement.

FINAL ORDER AND JUDGMENT AND RELEASES

26. If this Settlement Agreement (including any modification thereto made with the consent of the Parties as provided for herein) is approved by the Court following the Fairness Hearing scheduled by the Court in its Preliminary Approval Order, the Parties shall request the Court to enter a Final Order and Judgment pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and all applicable laws that, among other things:

 (a) Finds that the Court has personal jurisdiction over the Named Plaintiffs and all Settlement Class Members and that the Court has subject matter jurisdiction to approve this Settlement and Settlement Agreement and all exhibits thereto;

(b) Certifies the Settlement Class solely for purposes of effectuating this Settlement;

- 28 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 29 of 47

(c) Grants final approval to this Settlement Agreement as being fair, reasonable and adequate as to all Parties and consistent and in compliance with all requirements of due process and applicable law, as to and in the best interests of all Parties and directs the Parties and their counsel to implement and consummate this Settlement Agreement in accordance with its terms and provisions;

(d) Declares this Settlement Agreement and the Final Order and Judgment to be binding on and have *res judicata* and preclusive effect in all pending and future lawsuits or other proceedings encompassed by the Release and maintained by or on behalf of the Named Plaintiffs and all Settlement Class Members, as well as their respective present, former and future administrators, agents, assigns, attorneys, executors, heirs, partners, predecessors-in-interest and successors;

(e) Finds that the Settlement Class Notice Program: (i) constituted the best practicable notice; (ii) constituted notice that was reasonably calculated under the circumstances to apprise the Settlement Class of the pendency of the Litigation, of their right to object to or exclude themselves from the proposed Settlement, of their right to appear at the Fairness Hearing and of their right to seek monetary and other relief; (iii) constituted reasonable, due, adequate and sufficient notice to all Persons entitled to receive notice; and (iv) met all requirements of due process and any other applicable law;

(f) Approves the Claim Form that was distributed to the Settlement Class, the content of which was without material alteration from Exhibit A to this Settlement Agreement;

(g) Finds that Settlement Class Counsel and the Named Plaintiffs adequately represented the Settlement Class for purposes of entering into and implementing the Settlement and Settlement Agreement;

- 29 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 30 of 47

(h) Dismisses the Amended Class Action Complaint in *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*,
No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.) on the merits and with prejudice and without fees or
costs except as provided herein, in accordance with the terms of the Final Order and Judgment;

 (i) Adjudges that the Named Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class have conclusively compromised, settled, dismissed and released any and all Released Claims against Defendants and the Released Persons;

(j) Approves payment of the Attorneys' Fee Award and the Named Plaintiffs'Incentive Award;

(k) Without affecting the finality of the Final Order and Judgment for purposes of appeal, reserves jurisdiction over the Settlement Administrator, Defendants, the Named Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class Members as to all matters relating to the administration, consummation, enforcement and interpretation of the terms of the Settlement, the Settlement Agreement and Final Order and Judgment and for any other necessary purposes;

(1) Provides that upon the Effective Date, the Named Plaintiffs and all Settlement Class Members, whether or not they return a Claim Form within the time and in the manner provided for, shall be barred from asserting any Released Claims against Defendants and/or any Released Persons, and any such Settlement Class Members shall have released any and all Released Claims as against Defendants and all Released Persons;

(m) Determines that the Settlement Agreement and the Settlement provided for therein and any proceedings taken pursuant thereto are not and should not in any event be offered or received as evidence of, a presumption, concession or an admission of liability or of any misrepresentation or omission in any statement or written document approved or made by Defendants or any Released Persons or of the suitability of these or similar claims to class

- 30 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 31 of 47

treatment in active litigation and trial; provided, however, that reference may be made to this Settlement Agreement and the Settlement provided for therein in such proceedings solely as may be necessary to effectuate the Settlement Agreement;

(n) Bars and permanently enjoins all Settlement Class Members and their counsel from (i) filing, commencing, prosecuting, intervening in or participating (as a plaintiff, claimant, class member, or otherwise) in any other lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding in any jurisdiction based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims; (ii) organizing Settlement Class Members who have not excluded themselves from the Settlement Class into a separate class for purposes of pursuing as a purported class action any lawsuit or arbitration or other proceeding (including by seeking to amend a pending complaint to include class allegations or seeking class certification in a pending action) based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims, except that Settlement Class Members are not precluded from participating in any investigation or suit initiated by a state or federal agency;

(o) States that any Person who knowingly violates such injunction shall pay the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Defendants and/or any other Released Persons and Settlement Class Counsel as a result of the violation;

(p) Approves the Opt-Out List and determines that the Opt-Out List is a complete list of all members of the Settlement Class who have timely requested exclusion from the Settlement Class and, accordingly, shall neither share in nor be bound by the Final Order and Judgment, except for Opt-Outs who subsequently elect to submit Claim Forms during the Claim Period; and

- 31 -
(q) Authorizes the Parties, without further approval from the Court, to agree to and adopt such amendments, modifications and expansions of this Settlement Agreement and all exhibits hereto as (i) shall be consistent in all material respects with the Final Order and Judgment and (ii) do not limit the rights of the Parties or Settlement Class Members.

EFFECTIVE DATE

27. The Effective Date of this Settlement Agreement shall be the date when each and all of the following conditions have occurred:

(a) This Settlement Agreement has been fully executed by all Parties and their counsel;

(b) Orders have been entered by the Court certifying the Settlement Class for settlement purposes, granting preliminary approval of this Settlement and approving the forms of Class Notice and Claim Form, all as provided above;

(c) The Settlement Class Notice Program has been executed in accordance with the Preliminary Approval Order;

(d) The Court has entered a Final Order and Judgment finally approving this Settlement Agreement, as provided above; and

(e) The Final Order and Judgment has become Final. "Final," when referring to a judgment or order means that (i) the judgment is a final, appealable judgment; and (ii) either (a) no appeal has been taken from the judgment as of the date on which all times to appeal therefrom have expired, or (b) an appeal or other review proceeding of the judgment having been commenced, the date by which such appeal or other review is finally concluded and no longer is subject to review by any court, whether by appeal, petitions or rehearing or re-argument, petitions for rehearing en banc, petitions for writ of certiorari, or otherwise, and such appeal or other review has been finally resolved in a manner that affirms the Final Order and Judgment in all material respects.

TIMING OF PAYMENT OBLIGATIONS

28. <u>In General</u>. Perrigo shall have no obligation to make any payments under this Settlement Agreement until the Court enters the Preliminary Approval Order, nor shall Perrigo have any obligation to make any payments, at any time, under this Settlement Agreement which, in the aggregate, would exceed the \$2.8 million amount of the Settlement Fund.

29. <u>Payments After Preliminary Approval</u>. After entry of the Preliminary Approval Order and pursuant to Paragraph 16, Perrigo shall pay the Notice and Administration Costs from the Settlement Fund as those costs are incurred and payment becomes due.

30. <u>Payments After The Effective Date</u>. Perrigo shall have no obligation to make any payments under this Paragraph until after the Effective Date.

(a) Within thirty (30) Days after the Effective Date and pursuant to Paragraphs9, 17 and 18, Perrigo shall pay from the Net Settlement Fund those Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims.

(b) Within fourteen (14) Days after the Effective Date (unless directed otherwise by the Court), and pursuant to Paragraph 22, Perrigo shall pay the Attorneys' Fee Award from the Settlement Fund.

(c) Within fourteen (14) Days after the Effective Date (unless directed otherwise by the Court), and pursuant to Paragraph 23, Perrigo shall pay the Incentive Award from the Settlement Fund.

WITHDRAWAL FROM OR TERMINATION OF SETTLEMENT

31. <u>Termination By Any Party</u>. Each of the Parties shall have the right to terminate his, her or its participation in the Settlement and terminate the Settlement Agreement by providing written notice of its election to do so to counsel for the all other Parties hereto within fourteen (14)

Days of the occurrence of any of the following:

(a) The Court fails to approve the Settlement Agreement in any material respect or the Court's approval is reversed or modified on appeal (except that an Attorneys' Fee Award or Incentive Award less than that to which Defendants have agreed not to object shall not be deemed to be a material alteration);

(b) The Court fails to approve and enter the Preliminary Approval Order or the Final Order and Judgment, as described in Paragraphs 25-26, in any material respect or the Court's approval is reversed or modified on appeal; or

(c) The Final Order and Judgment fails to become Final for any reason.

32. <u>Termination At The Discretion of Perrigo</u>. Perrigo shall have the right, at its sole discretion, to terminate its participation in the Settlement and terminate the Settlement Agreement by providing written notice of its election to do so to Settlement Class Counsel within fourteen (14) Days of the occurrence of any of the following:

(a) Notice and Administration Costs exceed \$800,000; or

(b) The Opt-Out List has been served on the Parties, and the number of Opt-Outs is more than the confidential number agreed to by the Parties, by and through their respective counsel, as set forth in a "Supplemental Agreement." The Supplemental Agreement shall not be filed with the Court, except that the substantive contents of the Supplemental Agreement may be brought to the attention of the Court, *in camera*, in the event of a dispute between the Parties or if so requested or as otherwise ordered by the Court. The Parties will otherwise keep the terms of the Supplemental Agreement confidential, except if compelled by judicial process to disclose the Supplemental Agreement. In the event that Perrigo exercises such right, Settlement Class Counsel shall have fourteen (14) Days or such longer period as agreed to by the Parties to address the

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 35 of 47

concerns of the Opt-Outs. If through such efforts the total number on the Opt-Out List subsequently becomes and remains fewer than the number set forth in the Supplemental Agreement, Perrigo shall withdraw its election to withdraw from the Settlement and terminate the Settlement Agreement. In no event, however, shall Defendants have any further obligation under this Agreement to any Opt-Out unless he or she withdraws his or her request for exclusion.

33. <u>Effect of Withdrawal or Termination</u>. In the event that the Settlement Agreement is terminated pursuant to its terms or is not approved in any material respect by the Court, or such approval is reversed, vacated, or modified in any material respect by the Court or by any other court, or otherwise fails to become Final:

(a) The Settlement Agreement shall become null and void and of no further force and effect (except for Paragraphs 31, 32, 34, 35, 49, and 54, which shall survive the termination);

(b) The Amended Class Action Complaint filed pursuant to Paragraph 2 shall be withdrawn and the separate complaints predating the Settlement in the Settled Actions shall again be the operative complaints in those cases;

(c) The certification of the Settlement Class shall be deemed vacated;

(d) The Parties shall be restored to their litigation position existing before the execution of this Settlement Agreement; and,

(e) The Settled Actions shall proceed as if the Settlement Class had never been certified and no reference to the Settlement Class, this Settlement Agreement or any documents, communications or negotiations related in any way thereto shall be made for any purpose in the Litigation or in any other action or proceeding.

NO ADMISSION OF WRONGDOING OR LIABILITY AND NON-ADMISSIBILITY

34. No Admission of Wrongdoing or Liability. Defendants have denied, and

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 36 of 47

continue to deny, all allegations and claims asserted in the Litigation. This Settlement is made solely in order to eliminate the burden, expense, and uncertainties of further litigation.

35. <u>Non-admissibility</u>. This Settlement Agreement, whether or not consummated, and any of its provisions, its exhibits or related documents (including but not limited to drafts of the Settlement Agreement, the Preliminary Approval Order or the Final Order and Judgment), its negotiation or any proceedings relating in any way to the Settlement shall not be construed as or deemed to be evidence of an admission or concession by any person, including Defendants, and shall not be offered or received in evidence, or subject to discovery, or used for any purpose (including the existence, certification or maintenance of any proposed or existing class or the amenability of these or similar claims to class treatment in this or any other action or proceeding) except in an action brought to enforce its terms or except as may be required by law or Court order.

NOTICES

36. All Notices (other than the Class Notice and CAFA Notices) required by the Settlement Agreement shall be made in writing and communicated by mail to the following addresses:

37. All Notices to Settlement Class Counsel shall be sent to:

Todd S. Garber **Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP** 1311 Mamaroneck Avenue White Plains, New York 10605 <u>gblankinship@fbfglaw.com</u> Telephone: (914) 293-3281

Stewart M. Weltman Stewart M. Weltman, LLC 53 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 364 Chicago, IL 60604 <u>sweltman@weltmanlawfirm.com</u> Telephone: (602) 274-1100 Elaine A. Ryan Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C. 2325 E. Camelback Road, #300 Phoenix, AZ 5016 eryan@bffb.com Telephone: (602) 274-1100

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr. **Carlson Lynch LTD** PNC Park 115 Federal Street, Suite 210 Pittsburgh, PA 15212 <u>ekilpela@carlsonlynch.com</u>

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 37 of 47

(Of Counsel Levin Fishbein Sedran & Berman)

38. All Notices to Defendants' Counsel shall be sent to:

Bradley J. Andreozzi Justin O. Kay **Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP** 191 N. Wacker Dr. Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606 <u>bradley.andreozzi@dbr.com</u> <u>justin.kay@dbr.com</u> Telephone: (312) 569-1000

39. The notice recipients and addresses designated above may be changed by written notice.

40. Upon the request of any of the Parties, the Parties agree to promptly provide each other with copies of comments, objections, requests for exclusion, or other documents or filings received as a result of the Class Notice.

MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

41. <u>Interpretation</u>. This Settlement Agreement contains the entire agreement among the Parties hereto and supersedes any prior or contemporaneous discussions, agreements or understandings among them as well as any and all prior drafts of this Settlement Agreement. All terms are contractual. For the purpose of construing or interpreting this Settlement Agreement, the Parties agree that the Settlement Agreement is to be deemed to have been drafted equally by all Parties hereto and shall not be construed strictly for or against any Party, and the Parties further agree that any prior drafts may not be used to construe or interpret this Settlement Agreement.

42. <u>**Binding Effect**</u>. The terms are and shall be binding upon each of the Parties hereto, their administrators, agents, assigns, attorneys, executors, heirs, partners, representatives, predecessors-in-interest and successors as well as upon all other Persons claiming any interest in

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 38 of 47

the subject matter hereto through any of the Parties hereto including any Settlement Class Members.

43. <u>Headings</u>. The headings contained in this Settlement Agreement are for reference purposes only and shall not affect in any way the meaning or interpretation of this Settlement Agreement.

44. <u>No Rescission on Grounds of Mistake</u>. The Parties acknowledge that they have made their own investigations of the matters covered by this Settlement Agreement to the extent they have deemed it necessary to do so. Therefore, the Parties agree that they will not seek to set aside any part of the Settlement Agreement on the grounds of mistake. Moreover, the Parties understand, agree, and expressly assume the risk that any fact not recited, contained, or embodied in the Settlement Agreement may turn out hereinafter to be other than, different from, or contrary to the facts now known to them or believed by them to be true, and further agree that the Settlement Agreement shall be effective in all respects notwithstanding and shall not be subject to termination, modification, or rescission by reason of any such difference in facts.

45. <u>Amendment</u>. This Settlement Agreement may be amended or modified only by a written instrument signed by all signatories hereto (or their successors-in-interest) or their counsel, nor may a party be deemed to have waived any provision (including this provision) except by a writing signed by that Party (or its successor-in-interest) or its counsel. Amendments and modifications may be made without notice to the Settlement Class unless notice is required by law or by the Court. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Defendants may modify the names of products in the List of Covered Products (Exhibit B hereto) prior to the Preliminary Approval Hearing, and such modifications shall not be considered an amendment.

46. <u>No Waiver</u>. The waiver by one Party of any breach of this Settlement Agreement

- 38 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 39 of 47

by any other Party shall not be deemed a waiver by the waiving party of any other prior or subsequent breach of this Settlement Agreement or a waiver by any other Party of any breach of this Settlement Agreement.

47. <u>Integration</u>. Other than the Supplemental Agreement referenced in Paragraph 32(b) hereof, this Settlement Agreement and its exhibits (which are an integral and material part of the Settlement and are hereby specifically incorporated and made a part of the Settlement Agreement) constitute the entire agreement among the Parties concerning this Settlement, and no representations, warranties, or inducements have been made by any Party concerning this Settlement and its exhibits other than those contained, memorialized, or referenced in such documents.

48. **Jurisdiction**. The United States District Court for the Southern District of New York has jurisdiction over the Parties to this Settlement Agreement and the Settlement Class.

49. <u>**Governing Law**</u>. The construction, interpretation, operation, effect, and validity of this Settlement Agreement, and all documents necessary to effectuate it, shall be governed by the internal laws of the State of New York without regard to conflicts of laws, except to the extent that federal law requires that federal law govern.

50. <u>Counterparts</u>. This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and may be executed by facsimile or electronic signature, and as so executed shall constitute one agreement.

51. <u>Cooperation</u>. The Parties agree to cooperate fully with one another in seeking Court approval of the Preliminary Approval Order, and this Settlement, and to use best efforts to promptly agree upon and execute all such other documentation as may be reasonably required to obtain final approval by the Court of the Settlement.

- 39 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 40 of 47

52. <u>Authority to Sign</u>. All counsel and all other persons executing this Settlement Agreement or any of the exhibits hereto, or any incorporated Settlement documents, warrant and represent that they have the full authority to do so and that they have the authority to take appropriate action required or permitted to be taken pursuant to the Settlement Agreement to effectuate its terms

53. <u>No Media Statements</u>. Subject to the Preliminary Approval Order issued by the Court, neither the Named Plaintiffs nor Settlement Class Counsel or any other counsel acting on behalf of the Named Plaintiffs shall issue any press release, or make any statement to any media or press of any sort, regarding this Settlement, including any references on websites maintained by the Named Plaintiffs or Settlement Class Counsel, other than to state that the Litigation has been resolved on terms satisfactory to the Parties and contained in this Settlement Agreement. Settlement Class Counsel will be permitted to provide a link to the Settlement Website on their website with accompanying language to be reviewed and approved by Defendants and Defendants' Counsel, such approval not to be unreasonably withheld, before posting of the same. Nothing in this paragraph prevents Settlement Class Counsel from including statements factually recounting the Settlement and their respective roles as class counsel on their websites or in resumes and attorney biographies.

54. <u>Confidentiality</u>. All agreements made and orders entered during the course of the Litigation relating to the confidentiality of information shared during the Litigation shall survive this Settlement.

55. <u>No Assignment</u>. The Named Plaintiffs represent and warrant that no portion of any claim, right, demand, action, or cause of action against the Released Persons that the Named Plaintiffs, or any of them, have or may have arising out of any allegations made in any of the

- 40 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 41 of 47

actions comprising the Litigation or pertaining to any of the Released Claims, and no portion of any recovery or settlement to which the Named Plaintiffs, or any of them, may be entitled, has been assigned, transferred, or conveyed by or for the Named Plaintiffs, or any of them, in any manner; and no Person other than the Named Plaintiffs has any legal or equitable interest in the claims, demands, actions, or causes of action referred to in this Agreement as those of the Named Plaintiffs.

56. <u>Dismissal of Guilin, Eckler, Calvert, Group, Gross, Nelson, and Nunez</u>. Within five (5) days of the Effective Date, Named Plaintiffs will seek a dismissal with prejudice of *Guilin, Eckler, Calvert, Group, Gross, Nelson*, and *Nunez*.

07/16/2014 Case 7:12-tv=08187-VB Document 95 Line 07/17/14 Page 42 of 47 PAGE 01

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the Parties have executed and caused this Agreement to be executed by their duly authorized representatives below.

Dated:

Dated:

Plaintiffs

Rosemary Quinn

Resembly Lun By:_

.

715-14 Dated:

Alan Ducorsky

By:
Kay Eckler
Ву:
Brian Calvert
Ву:
Marc Group
By:

John J. Gross

Christopher Nelson

By:___

By:_

Dated:	
Dated:	
Dated:	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Dated:	

[*]

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the Parties have executed and caused this Agreement to be executed by their duly authorized representatives below.

Plaintiffs

Rosemary Quinn

By:	Dated:
Alan Ducorsky By: <u>Clain Priorphy</u>	Dated: 7/15/2014
Kay Eckler	/
By:	Dated:
Brian Calvert	
By:	Dated:
Marc Group	
By:	Dated:
John J. Gross	
By:	Dated:
Christopher Nelson	
By:	Dated:
Randy Nunez	
By:	Dated:
Luis Guilin	
Ву:	Dated:
•	

Approved as to form

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the Parties have executed and caused this Agreement to be executed by their duly authorized representatives below.

Plaintifjs	
Rosemary Quinn	
By:	Dated:
Alan Ducorsky	
By:	Dated:
Kay Eckler	1 1
By: Dog Tollo	Dated: -1/10/14
Brian Calvert	
By:	Dated:
Marc Group	
By:	Dated:
John J. Gross	
Ву:	Dated:
Christopher Nelson	
By:	Dated:
Randy Nunez	
Ву:	Dated:
Luis Guilin	
Ву:	Dated:

Approved as to form

FINKELSTEIN, BLANKINSHIP, FREI-PEARSON & GARBER, LLP

Dated: July 16, 2014	By: /s/ Todd S. Garber
	Todd S. Garber 1311 Mamaroneck Avenue White Plains, New York 10605 <u>gblankinship@fbfglaw.com</u> Telephone: (914) 298-3281
	BONNETT, FAIRBOURN, FRIEDMAN & BALINT, P.C.
Dated: July 16, 2014	By: /s/ Elaine A. Ryan
	Elaine A. Ryan 2325 E. Camelback Road, #300 Phoenix, AZ 5016 eryan@bffb.com Telephone: (602) 274-1100
	STEWART WELTMAN LLC
Dated: July 16, 2014	By: /s/ Stewart M. Weltman
	Stewart M. Weltman 53 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 364 Chicago, IL 60604 <u>sweltman@weltmanlawfirm.com</u> Telephone: (312) 588-5033 (Of Counsel Levin Fishbein Sedran & Berman)
	CARLSON LYNCH, LTD
Dated: July 16, 2014	By: <u>/s/ Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.</u>
	Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr. R. Bruce Carlson PNC Park 115 Federal Street, Suite 210 Pittsburgh, PA 15212 <u>ekilpela@carlsonlynch.com</u> <u>bcarlson@carlsonlynch.com</u> Telephone: (412) 322-9243

CARPENTER LAW GROUP

Dated: July 16, 2014

By: <u>/s</u>/ Todd Carpenter

402 West Broadway, 29th Floor San Diego, CA 92101 todd@carpenterlawyers.com Telephone: (619) 756-6994

PATTERSON LAW GROUP, APC

By: /s/ James Patterson

402 West Broadway, 29th Floor San Diego, CA 92101 jim@pattersonlawgroup.com Telephone: (619) 756-6990

Dated: July 16, 2014

Settlement Class Counsel

Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc.

By:_____

Dated:_____

Approved as to form

Dated: July 16, 2014

DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP

By: /s/ Bradley J. Andreozzi

Bradley J. Andreozzi Justin O. Kay 191 N. Wacker Dr. Chicago, IL 60606 <u>bradley.andreozzi@dbr.com</u> <u>justin.kay@dbr.com</u> Telephone: (312) 569-1000

Defendants' Counsel

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-1 Filed 07/17/14 Page 47 of 47

CARPENTER LAW GROUP

Dated:_____

Dated:

402 West Broadway, 29th Floor San Diego, CA 92101 todd@carpenterlawyers.com Telephone: (619) 756-6994

By: <u>/s/ Todd Carpenter</u>

PATTERSON LAW GROUP, APC

By: <u>/s/</u> James Patterson

402 West Broadway, 29th Floor San Diego, CA 92101 jim@pattersonlawgroup.com Telephone: (619) 756-6990

Settlement Class Counsel

Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc.

DAA Floring By:

Dated: 7/15/14

Approved as to form

DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP

Dated:_____

By:

Bradley J. Andreozzi Justin O. Kay 191 N. Wacker Dr. Chicago, IL 60606 <u>bradley.andreozzi@dbr.com</u> <u>justin.kay@dbr.com</u> Telephone: (312) 569-1000

Defendants' Counsel

EXHIBIT 1A

- .

CLAIM FORM

Rosemary Quinn, et al, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated v. Walgreen Co., Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., Supervalu, Inc., and Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc., Case No. 12-cv-8187 VB, United States District Court, Southern District of New York

IN ORDER FOR YOU TO RECEIVE A CASH AWARD AS PART OF THE SETTLEMENT IN THIS LAWSUIT, YOU MUST SUBMIT BY [DATE] A COMPLETED FORM EITHER ON LINE AT [ADD ADDRESS] OR BY MAILING IT TO THE FOLLOWING ADDRESS:

[ADD GCG MAILING ADDRESS]

Class Members who submit a valid Claim Form accompanied by a cash register receipt that identifies the Covered Product manufactured by Perrigo and/or its affiliates will receive the actual receipt value per bottle of Covered Product. Class Members who submit a valid Claim Form without a cash register receipt will receive \$12.50 per bottle of Covered Product. Class members may submit claims for any number of Covered Products for which they have cash register receipts and also claims for up to a maximum of eight (8) bottles per household for Covered Products for which they no longer have such proof of purchase.

<u>CONTACT INFORMATION</u>. Please legibly print the following information:

Name (first, middle, and last):	
Street Address:	
City, State, Zip Code:	
Telephone Number:	

CLAIM INFORMATION (Check All That Apply)

- □ I am a resident of the United States.
- □ I purchased one or more of the Covered Products between November 1, 2005 and [Preliminary Approval Order Date].
- □ These Covered Products were purchased for personal use and not for purposes of resale or distribution.

Class Members With Receipts

Do you have receipts proving that you purchased one of the Covered Products between November 1, 2005 and [Preliminary Approval Date]? If so, how many Covered Products did you buy for which you have a receipt? _____

If you have receipts, you can either submit those receipts by filling out this form and mailing it to the address above or you can attach an image of those receipts and make a claim by clicking here [ADD LINK].

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-2 Filed 07/17/14 Page 3 of 3

Class Members Without Receipts

If you do not have receipts, you can still make a claim for up to eight (8) Covered Products you purchased from November 1, 2005 to [Preliminary Approval Date] by completing the statement below:

I have reviewed the list of Covered Products and have identified one or more products that I purchased between November 1, 2005 and [Preliminary Approval Date].

I purchased:

Number of Bottles (Fill in the number purchased) of Covered Product between November 1, 2005 and [Preliminary Approval Date].

Optional: To the extent you are able to do so, please identify the Covered Products you purchased and the approximate date of purchase (*you do <u>not</u> need to fill out this section to submit a claim*):

CERTIFICATION

By my signature below, I state **<u>under penalty of perjury</u>** under the laws of the State in which this Certification is executed and the United States of America that the information provided herein and any documentation that I may submit in support of my claim is true and correct.

Date _____

Signature _____

Printed Name

If you provide incomplete, incorrect or inaccurate information, your claim may be denied.

If you have any questions, additional information can be found on [ADD WEBSITE ADDRESS] and inquiries can be made through the website or by phone by calling [ADD PHONE NUMBER].

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 1 of 7

EXHIBIT 1B

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 2 of 7 Exhibit B List of Covered Products

To qualify as a "Covered Product," the products identified below must have been purchased (i) for personal use, and not resale or distribution; (ii) by a resident of the United States; (iii) between November 1, 2005 and the Preliminary Approval Date.

Store Brand	Product Description
ALBERTSONS/EQUALINE	Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced with MSM
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
ALDI FOODS/WELBY	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength glucosamine chondroitin complex
AMAZON/4X	Comfort Flex
AMAZON/GOOD SENSE	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
AMERICAN SALES COMPANY/ CARE ONE	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Comfort Flex
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrate Extract
	Glucosamine HCl
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	MSM and Glucosamine Complex
	Natural Glucosamine Complex USP
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Sodium Free Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Sodium Free Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex-MSM Vitamin D
AMERICAN SALES COMPANY/HEALTHY IDEAS	CHEWABLE Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Orange Flavor
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	Natural Glucosamine Complex USP
	Natural MSM and Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
ARMY/AIR FORCE/NAVY	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
EXCHANGE SERVICE/EXCHANGE SELECT	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine HCl 2000 mg
	MSM with Glucosamine Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
BEST YET	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
B J'S WHOLESALE/BERKLEY & JENSON	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine & Vitamin D3
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Triple Strength with Vitamin D
	Glucosamine HCl Chondroitin Sulfate Sodium MSM
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
B J'S WHOLESALE/GENERATION EARTH	natural glucosamine chondroitin complex
BIG LOTS STORES	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Joint Health Triple Strength
BRITE-LIFE	Glucosamine Sulfate

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 3 of 7

Exhibit B

Store Brand	Product Description
BROOKS	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Sodium Free
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	MSM and Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
CVS	All day Glucosamine Chondroitin Extended Release
DOLLAR GENERAL	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex with MSM
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
DOLLAR GENERAL/HEALTH SENSE	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex with MSM
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
DOLLAR GENERAL/GOOD HEALTH	Glucosamine Sulfate
DOLLAR GENERAL/DG HEALTH	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
FACTORYOTC/GOOD SENSE	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
FAMILY PHARMACY	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine
	MSM with Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
FOOD LION	
FOOD LION	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Triple Strength
FOOD LION/HEALTHY ACCENTS	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
CNC/Concert Nutrition Conter) (DITE ALD	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
GNC(General Nutrition Center)/RITE AID	Advanced Glucosamine/Chondroitin + MSM Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Advanced Complex
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Advanced Complex with HA
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin with MSM
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D-3 One Per Day
GOOD NEIGHBOR PHARMACY	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	MSM Glucosamine Complex
	Natural Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
GOOD SENSE	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine HCl & VitaminD3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	Glucosamine HCI Tablets
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Triple Strength with Vitamin D Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
GOOD SENSE/NATURALS	Glucosamine Complex
HEALTH MART	glucosamine & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	glucosamine chondroitin complex triple strength

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 4 of 7

Exhibit B

Store Brand	Product Description
H-E-B	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Navancea riple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex MSM Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength with Vitamin D3
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Regular Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Triple Strength
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	Glucosamine Sulfate Complex
	MSM and Glucosamine Complex
KMART/VITASMART	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine HCl Chondroitin Sulfate Sodium
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin complex
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine HCl
	MSM Glucosamine Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Sulfate
	Triple Strength with Vitamin D Glucosamine & Chondroitin complex
KMART/SMART SENSE	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Comfort Flex
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength with Vitamin D
	Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM Complex Hyaluronic Acid
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	Glucosamine HCl 2000 mg Glucosamine HCl with 3.3 mg Hyaluronic Acid
KMART/VITASMART ESSENTIALS	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
KROGER	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
KNOGEN	Glucosamine
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	Glucosamine with Calcium + D
	MSM and Glucosamine Complex
LEADER DRUG	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Sulfate

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 5 of 7

Exhibit B

Store Brand	Product Description
LONGS	12 Hour Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	12 Hour Extended Release Glucosamine Sulfate
	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin & MSM
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced Hyaluronic Acid
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Sodium Free
MEDICINE SHOPPE	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	Regular Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
MEIJER	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
WEIJER	advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin double strength
	Advanced Hyaluronic Acid Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM Complex
	all day extended release Glucosamine Chondroitin double strength
	Glucosamine & Vitamin D3
	Glucosamine Chondroitin double strength Glucosamine HCl
	Glucosamine MSM & Vitamin D3 triple strength
	Glucosamine Sulfate Triple Strength
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Sodium Free Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength with Vitamin D Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
MEIJER/NATURALS	Glucosamine Complex
	MSM Glucosamine Complex
MEIJER/TRUE BASICS	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
PUBLIX	Double Strength glucosamine & chondroitin
	glucosamine complex
	MSM and Glucosamine Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
QVC/NATURE'S CODE	all day extended release Glucosamine Chondroitin
SAFEWAY	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine HCl Chondroitin Sulfate Sodium
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength with Vitamin D
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
SAM'S/MEMBERS MARK	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Triple Strength Glucosamine MSM & Vitamin D3
SAVEMART/TODAY'S HEALTH	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced Glucosamine Sulfate
	Natural Glucosamine Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 6 of 7

Exhibit B

Store Brand	Product Description
SUPERVALU/DAILY SOURCE	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine HCl Chondroitin Sulfate Sodium
	Double Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Natural MSM with Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	Triple Strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
SUPERVALU/EQUALINE	Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced with MSM
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced with MSM & Vitamin D
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength with Vitamin D
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
SUN MARK	glucosamine chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine HCl & Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
TARGET	advanced glucosamine chondroitin complex
	double strength glucosamine chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	glucosamine chondroitin MSM complex
	triple strength glucosamine chondroitin complex
TARGET/ORIGIN	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
TARGET UP & UP	advanced glucosamine chondroitin complex
	glucosamine chondroitin complex plus MSM
	glucosamine chondroitin MSM and hyaluronic acid
	glucosamine HCl
	glucosamine HCl and Vitamin D3
	triple strength glucosamine chondroitin complex
TOPCARE	Advanced Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	double strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	glucosamine HCl and Vitamin D3 Boswellia serrata Extract
	Natural Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
	triple strength Glucosamine & Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength with Vitamin D Glucosamine Chondroitin
WALGREENS	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced plus MSM
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM Complex Hyaluronic Acid
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength with Vitamin D
WALGREENS/FLEX-DS	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex
WALGREENS/FLEX-ER	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
WALGREENS/FLEX-TS	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin complex

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-3 Filed 07/17/14 Page 7 of 7

Exhibit B

Store Brand	Product Description
WALMART/EQUATE	Advanced Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM with Joint Lubricant
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM with Vitamin D
WALMART/SPRING VALLEY	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Double Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Sodium Free Glucosamine Chondroitin
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM & Vitamin D3
WALMART/FLEX FREE	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin
	All Day Extended Release Glucosamine Chondroitin MSM
WESTERN FAMILY	Glucosamine & Chondroitin All Day Extended Release
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Advanced
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Double Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin Complex Advanced Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Sulfate
	MSM Glucosamine Complex
	Regular Strength Glucosamine Chondroitin
WINN DIXIE	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Double Strength
	Glucosamine & Chondroitin Complex Triple Strength
	Glucosamine Chondroitin & MSM
	Triple Strength Glucosamine Sulfate

EXHIBIT 1C

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ROSEMARY QUINN, ALAN DUCORSKY, LUIS GUILIN, KAY ECKLER, BRIAN CALVERT, MARC GROUP, JOHN J. GROSS, CHRISTOPHER NELSON, and RANDY NUNEZ, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WALGREEN CO., WAL-MART STORES, INC., SUPERVALU, INC., and PERRIGO COMPANY OF SOUTH CAROLINA, INC.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 7:12-CV-8187-VB

[PROPOSED] ORDER APPROVING PLAINTIFFS' UNCONTESTED MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

THIS CAUSE is before the Court on Plaintiffs' Uncontested Motion for Preliminary

Approval of Class Action Settlement. Having reviewed the Motion; the Settlement Agreement;

the Declarations of Todd S. Garber, Elaine A. Ryan, Stewart M. Weltman, Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.,

Todd Carpenter and Jeanne C. Finegan; the record in this case; and for good cause shown:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AND ADJUDGED THAT:

Preliminary Approval of Settlement Agreement

1. The Court finds for the purposes of preliminary approval that the proposed

settlement, as set forth in the Parties' Settlement Agreement, is fair, reasonable, adequate, and in the best interests of the Class. The Court further finds that the Settlement was entered into at arm's length by highly experienced counsel and with the assistance of a highly experienced and

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 3 of 10

respected mediator. The Court therefore preliminarily approves the proposed Settlement.

Class Certification

2. The Court preliminarily certifies, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(a) and 23(b)(3), a Settlement Class, solely for the purposes of effectuating the Settlement, defined as:

All residents of the United States who purchased for personal use, and not resale or distribution, a Covered Product between November 1, 2005 and the present date.

The Covered Products include all products identified in Exhibit B of the Settlement Agreement. Excluded from the Settlement Class are the following Persons: (i) Defendants and their respective affiliates, employees, officers, directors, agents and representatives and their immediate family members; (ii) Settlement Class Counsel; and (iii) the judges who have presided over the Litigation and their immediate family members.

3. Pursuant to the Settlement Agreement, and for Settlement purposes only, the

Court finds as to the Settlement Class that:

- (a) the Class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable;
- (b) there are questions of law or fact common to the Class;
- (c) the claims of the named Plaintiffs are typical of the claims of the Class;
- (d) the named Plaintiffs will fairly and adequately protect the interests of the Class;
- (e) questions of law and fact common to class members predominate over any questions affecting only individual Class members; and,

(f) a class action is superior to other available methods for fairly and efficiently adjudicating the controversy.

4. The Court appoints Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn, Alan Ducorsky, Luis Guilin, Kay

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 4 of 10

Eckler, Brian Calvert, Marc Group, John J. Gross, Christopher Nelson, and Randy Nunez as the Representatives of the Settlement Class.

5. The Court appoints Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP ("FBFG"), Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C. ("Bonnett Fairbourn"), Stewart Weltman LLC; Carlson Lynch, LTD; Carpenter Law Group; and Patterson Law Group, APC as Class Counsel, with Todd S. Garber and the law firm of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP; Elaine A. Ryan and the law firm of Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C.; Stewart M. Weltman and the law firm of Stewart M. Weltman, LLC; and Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr. of the law firm of Carlson Lynch, LTD as representatives of the Class Counsel.

Settlement Administration

6. The Court appoints both Heffler Claims Group (which will implement the Class Notice plan proposed by the parties) and Garden City Group (which will maintain the Settlement Website, review and process plains and administer the Settlement in accordance with the Settlement Agreement) as Settlement Administrator, with the responsibilities set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

7. The Settlement Administrator shall establish a post office box in the name of the Settlement Administrator to be used for receiving requests for exclusion and any other communications, and providing that only the Settlement Administrator, Settlement Class Counsel, Defendants' Counsel, the Court, the Clerk of the Court and their designated agents shall have access to this post office box, except as otherwise provided in the Settlement Agreement.

Notice To Potential Class Members

8. The Court approves the form and content of the proposed Claim Form (Exhibit A to the Settlement Agreement) (which shall be submitted online or submitted in hardcopy and

- 3 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 5 of 10

post-marked no later than sixty (60) days after the last Notice is published); Publication Notice (Exhibit 2 to the Declaration of Todd S. Garber); and Long Form Notice (Exhibit 3 to the Declaration of Todd S. Garber) (the "Notices"), and approves the Parties' proposal to distribute the Long Form Notice via the Internet, and the Publication Notice via publication, as set forth in the Settlement Agreement and the Declaration of Jeanne C. Finegan on behalf of Heffler Claims Group. The Court finds that the Notices fairly and adequately (i) describe the nature of the Action and the Class's claims, issues, and defenses involved therein; (ii) set forth the definition of the proposed Class; (iii) describe the terms and effect of the Settlement Agreement and of the Settlement; (iv) inform the Class of the binding effect of the proposed Settlement on members of the Class; (v) give notice to the Class of the time and place of the Fairness Hearing; and (vi) notify the members of the Class of their right to object, appear through an attorney and/or to request exclusion from the Class, including a description of the time and manner of requesting exclusion or objecting to any of the relief requested. The Court further finds that the Parties' proposal regarding class notice to potential class members constitutes the best notice practicable under the circumstances, is reasonable and constitutes due and adequate and sufficient notice to all Persons entitled to receive Class Notice, and complies fully with the notice requirements of due process and Fed. R. Civ. P. 23.

9. The Heffler Claims Group will commence publishing the Notices no later than ten (10) days after the entry of this Order and shall complete the notice process within forty five (45) days thereafter.

10. At or before the Fairness Hearing, the Settlement Administrator will file with the Court and serve upon Class Counsel a proof of compliance confirming that the Notices have been provided in accordance with this Order.

- 4 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 6 of 10

11. The Court approves the creation of the Settlement Website in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement.

Exclusion from the Class

12. Class members shall be bound by all determinations and judgments in this Action unless such persons request exclusion from the Class in a timely and proper manner, as hereinafter provided. To be excluded from the proposed settlement, Class members must mail a request for exclusion from the Class to the Settlement Administrator at the address in the Notices, post-marked no later than sixty (60) Days after the last Class Notice is published ("Opt-Out and Objection Date"). The request for exclusion must be personally signed by the Class member requesting exclusion. So-called "mass" or "class" opt outs shall not be permitted. The request must include the Class member's full name, statement that the Class member desires to be excluded from the Settlement Class and contain a statement that the Class member is otherwise a member of the Settlement Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products. To be considered valid, a request for exclusion must set forth all of this information and must be timely received.

13. Any member of the Class who does not submit a timely, written request for exclusion from the Settlement Class (i.e., does not become an Opt-Out) will be bound by all proceedings, order and judgments in this Action, even if such Settlement Class Member has previously initiated or subsequently initiates individual litigation or other proceedings encompassed by the Release as set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

14. The Settlement Administrator shall provide the Opt-Out List to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel no later than five (5) Days after the Opt-Out and Objection Date, and the parties shall file with the Court the Opt-Out List with an affidavit attesting to the completeness

- 5 -

and accuracy thereof no later than three (3) Days thereafter.

Appearance and Objections at Fairness Hearing

Any member of the Class who wishes to object to the fairness, reasonableness or 15. adequacy of the Settlement or to any term of the Settlement Agreement, must file an objection no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date. To object, a Class member must file a written objection with the Court and serve such objection on Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel at the addresses set forth in the Notices. To be considered a valid objection, the objection must include the following: (i) the objector's name, address and telephone number and, if represented by counsel, of his/her counsel; (ii) a signed declaration stating that the objector is a member of the Settlement Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products; (iii) a statement of all grounds for the objections to the Settlement; and (iv) a statement of whether the Class member intends to appear at the Fairness Hearing, either with or without counsel, and if with counsel, the name of his or her counsel who will attend. Any response to an objection shall be filed with the Court no later than three (3) Days prior to the Fairness Hearing. Any member of the Class who fails to file and serve timely a written objection and notice of his or her intent to appear at the Fairness Hearing pursuant to this paragraph shall not be permitted to object to the approval of the Settlement at the Fairness Hearing.

16. By no later than the Opt-Out and Objection Date, any attorney hired by a Settlement Class Member for the purpose of objecting to the proposed Settlement, the Attorneys' Fee Award or the Incentive Award who intends to make an appearance at the Fairness Hearing shall file with the Clerk of the Court a notice of intention to appear and provide a copy of said notice to the Settlement Administrator (who shall forward it to Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel).

- 6 -

Stay of Proceedings

17. All discovery and pretrial proceedings in this Action are stayed and suspended until further order of this Court.

Preliminary Injunction

18. In further aid of the Court's jurisdiction to implement and enforce the Settlement, the Named Plaintiffs and members of the Settlement Class and their counsel are preliminarily enjoined and barred (solely during the period from entry of this Order until the decision whether to grant a Final Order and Judgment after the Fairness Hearing) from (i) filing, commencing, prosecuting, intervening in or participating (as a plaintiff, claimant, class member, or otherwise) in any other lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding in any jurisdiction based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims as set forth in the Settlement Agreement (unless and until they have timely excluded themselves from the Settlement Class); (ii) filing, commencing, participating in or prosecuting (including by seeking to amend a pending complaint to include class allegations or seeking class certification in a pending action) a lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding as a class action based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims as set forth in the Settlement Agreement where the purported class would include any member of the Settlement Class; and (iii) attempting to effect Opt-Outs of a class of individuals in any lawsuit or administrative, regulatory, arbitration or other proceeding based on, relating to or arising out of the claims and causes of action or the facts and circumstances giving rise to the Litigation and/or the Released Claims as set forth in the Settlement Agreement. Any Person who knowingly

- 7 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 9 of 10

violates such injunction shall pay the attorneys' fees and costs incurred by Defendants and/or any other Released Person (as defined in the Settlement Agreement) and Class Counsel as a result of the violation. This injunction does not prevent members of the Settlement Class from participating in any action or investigation initiated by a state or federal agency.

Attorneys' Fee Award and Named Plaintiffs' Incentive Award

19. Class Counsel shall file their applications for the Attorneys' Fee Award and Named Plaintiffs' Incentive Award in accordance with the terms set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

Fairness Hearing

20. Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement Agreement that a Fairness Hearing take place not less than eighty (80) Days after the entry of this Order (unless a longer period is required under 28 U.S.C. § 1715(b)), the Court will hold a Final Approval Hearing (also known as a "Fairness Hearing") at _____ a.m./p.m. on ______, 2014 in Courtroom 620, United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, 300 Quarropas St., White Plains, New York 10601 to consider the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the proposed Settlement, whether it should be finally approved by the Court, any petition for attorneys' fees, costs and reimbursement of expenses made by Class Counsel, Incentive Awards to Named Plaintiffs, and any other related matters that are brought to the attention of the Court in a timely fashion.

21. Any member of the Class that has not filed a Request for Exclusion may appear at the Fairness Hearing in person or by counsel and may be heard, to the extent allowed by the Court, either in support of or in opposition to the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the Settlement Agreement; provided, however, that no person shall be heard in opposition to the Settlement Agreement, and no papers or briefs submitted by or on behalf of any such person

- 8 -

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-4 Filed 07/17/14 Page 10 of 10

shall be accepted or considered by the Court, unless that person files an objection in accordance with the requirements above.

22. The date and time of the Fairness Hearing shall be set forth in the Notice but shall be subject to adjournment by the Court without further notice to the members of the Class other than notice which may be posted on the Court's Electronic Case Filing (ECF) system or the website created pursuant to the Settlement Agreement.

23. If Final Approval of the Settlement is not granted, or if the Settlement is terminated for any reason, the Settlement and all proceedings had in connection therewith shall be without prejudice to the parties' rights and the parties shall return to the *status quo ante*, and all Orders issued pursuant to the Settlement and Preliminary and Final Approval process shall be vacated. In such event, the Settlement Agreement and all negotiations concerning it shall not be used or referred to in this Action or any other action for any purpose whatsoever.

Dated: _____, 2014

SO ORDERED:

Honorable Vincent L. Briccetti United States District Court Judge
EXHIBIT 2

.

•

IF YOU PURCHASED CERTAIN GLUCOSAMINE AND CHONDROITON PRODUCTS YOU COULD RECEIVE MONEY FROM A CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

The detailed list of affected products and retailers are found on the website below, or by calling [ADD PHONE NUMBER].

A class action settlement has been preliminarily approved by the Court in *Quinn et al. v. Walgreen Co., Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., Supervalu, Inc., and Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc., Case No.* 7:12-cv-8187 VB (U.S. District Court, Southern District of New York) (the "Action"). Your rights may be affected by this proposed settlement.

WHAT THE ACTION IS ABOUT

Plaintiffs claim retailers including Walgreen's and Wal-Mart sold Perrigo-manufactured products containing **glucosamine and/or chondroitin** (the "Covered Products") using labels that had misleadingly stated that the products would help "rebuild cartilage," "lubricate joints," and "improve joint comfort" when they do not. Defendants deny that they violated the law and believe that the products provide the benefits stated on the labels, but have agreed to a settlement to avoid the cost, disruption and risk of continued litigation. The Class is comprised of residents in the United States who purchased for personal use, and not resale or distribution, a Covered Product between November 1, 2005 and [ADD PRELIMINARY APPROVAL DATE]. This is only a summary. Visit the website below, or call [ADD PHONE NUMBER] for a complete list of Covered Products.

THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT

Under the proposed settlement, Perrigo has agreed to provide a total Settlement Fund of \$2.8 million in full settlement of the claims of the Settlement Class. The Settlement Fund will be used to pay eligible claims, notice and claim administration expenses, as well as Class Counsel's attorneys' fees and expenses and any incentive awards to the Plaintiffs (as defined in the Settlement Agreement and as discussed below). Perrigo has agreed to pay out of the Settlement Fund the actual receipt price per bottle to Class Members who submit valid claims accompanied by cash register receipts reflecting the purchase of one or more Covered Products. Perrigo has also agreed to pay out of the Settlement Fund \$12.00 per bottle of Covered Product, up to maximum of eight (8) bottles to Class Members who submit valid claims without cash register receipts. The actual amount each class members receives will depend on the total number of claims received, and will be adjusted up or down in order to fully distribute the Net Settlement Fund to Settlement, the Class Member's rights with respect to the claims alleged in the Action will be forever discharged once the settlement is approved by the Court.

WHAT YOU CAN DO

1. **To Receive A Cash Award,** you must submit a Claim Form by [ADD DATE]. Claim Forms are available from the Settlement Administrator and on the Settlement Website.

2. **To Exclude Yourself From The Settlement,** you must submit to the Settlement Administrator a request for exclusion that is post-marked no later than ______. The request for exclusion must be personally signed by you, contain a statement that indicates your desire to be excluded from the Settlement Class and contain a statement that you are otherwise a member of the Settlement Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products. If you do not exclude yourself, you will be bound by the decisions of the Court.

3. **To Object To The Settlement**. If you wish to object to the settlement, you must file an objection with the Court, Class Counsel and Perrigo's Counsel no later than [ADD DATE]. Complete details on how to Object are found on the website below.

A final hearing will be held on _______ at _____, to determine the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the proposed settlement and to award attorneys' fees and costs. The motions for attorneys' fees and costs and plaintiff incentive awards will be posted on [ADD ADDRESS] after they are filed. The final hearing will take place before the Honorable Vincent L. Briccetti in Courtroom 620, of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, 300 Quarropas St., White Plains, New York 10601, You may ask to appear at the hearing, but are not required to do so.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

For detailed information about the settlement and your rights, including a complete description of the Covered Products, the full text of the Notice, a Claim Form, and a full copy of the Settlement Agreement, visit [ADD WEBSITE] or you may write to the Settlement Administrator at [ADD ADDRESS] or call [ADD PHONE NUMBER].

PLEASE DO NOT CONTACT THE COURT OR THE CLERK'S OFFICE.

۰.

EXHIBIT 3

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ROSEMARY QUINN, ALAN DUCORSKY, LUIS GUILIN, KAY ECKLER, BRIAN CALVERT, MARC GROUP, JOHN J. GROSS, CHRISTOPHER NELSON, and RANDY NUNEZ, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WALGREEN CO., WAL-MART STORES, INC., SUPERVALU, INC., and PERRIGO COMPANY OF SOUTH CAROLINA, INC., Civil Action No. 7:12-CV-8187-VB

Defendants.

NOTICE OF PROPOSED CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND SETTLEMENT HEARING

TO: ALL RESIDENTS OF THE UNITED STATES who purchased for personal use, and not resale or distribution, a Covered Product between November 1, 2005 and the [ADD PRELIMINARY APPROVAL DATE] ("Class Members").

IF YOU ARE A MEMBER OF THIS CLASS OF PERSONS, YOU SHOULD READ THIS NOTICE CAREFULLY BECAUSE IT WILL AFFECT YOUR RIGHTS.

PURPOSE OF THIS NOTICE

This notice informs you about a pending class action lawsuit entitled *ROSEMARY QUINN ET AL.,* on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated v. WALGREEN CO., WAL-MART STORES, INC., SUPERVALU, INC., and PERRIGO COMPANY OF SOUTH CAROLINA, INC., Case Number 7:12-cv-8187 VB, in the United States District Court, District of Southern District of New York (the "Action"), and a proposed settlement on behalf of a certain class of persons.

This notice advises you that Class Members who submit valid Claim Forms and who do not opt out of the settlement can receive a cash award for purchases of a Covered Product and notifies you that a hearing will be held to approve the settlement. The actual cash award amount depends upon the number of bottles of the Covered Product you purchased. Visit [ADD WEBSITE ADDRESS] or call [ADD PHONE NUMBER] for a complete list of Covered Products.

WHAT THE ACTION IS ABOUT

Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn, Alan Ducorsky, Luis Guilin, Kay Eckler, Brian Calvert, Marc Group, John J. Gross, Christopher Nelson, and Randy Nunez (the **"Plaintiffs"**) filed a lawsuit against Walgreen Co., Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., Supervalu, Inc., and Perrigo Company of South Carolina, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as **"Perrigo"**) on behalf of themselves and all Class Members.

The lawsuit alleges that certain statements on the labeling and packaging of the Covered Products are false, deceptive and/or misleading. Specifically, Plaintiffs allege that the Covered Products, which contained glucosamine and/or chondroitin, were represented as formulated to help "rebuild cartilage," "lubricate joints," and "improve joint comfort" when they do not provide these benefits. The lawsuit alleges that these representations are unlawful under various states' consumer protection laws and that Plaintiffs and Class Members are entitled to monetary compensation.

Defendants deny the allegations of unlawful conduct and further deny that any Class Member is entitled to any relief and, other than for settlement purposes, that this Action is appropriate for certification as a class action.

No court or other entity has made any judgment or determination of liability. Nevertheless, the Parties have concluded that it is in their best interests to settle the Action to avoid the risk, expense and distraction of continued litigation. This Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement and Settlement Hearing (**"Class Notice"**) is qualified in its entirety by the proposed Settlement Agreement on file with the Court. The Settlement was reached through lengthy arms-length negotiations between the Parties and with the assistance of two neutral mediators, the Hon. Howard B. Wiener, Justice of the California Court of Appeals (retired), and Hon. Wayne R. Anderson, United States District Judge for the Northern District of Illinois (retired).

The Hon. Vincent L. Briccetti, United States District Court Judge, has determined that the Action should proceed as a class action for purposes of settlement only, with Plaintiffs as the representatives of the Class, and has granted preliminary approval of the settlement, subject to a final fairness hearing discussed below.

THE PROPOSED SETTLEMENT

THE PARTIES HAVE AGREED TO THE SETTLEMENT GENERALLY DESCRIBED BELOW:

Perrigo has agreed to provide a total Settlement Fund of \$2.8 million in full settlement of the claims of the Settlement Class. The Settlement Fund will be used to pay eligible claims, notice and claim administration expenses, as well as Class Counsel's attorneys' fees and expenses and any incentive award to the Plaintiffs (as defined in the Settlement Agreement and as discussed below).

Perrigo has agreed to pay out of the Settlement Fund the actual receipt price per bottle of Covered Product to Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claim Forms accompanied by a cash register receipt evidencing their purchase of a Covered Product manufactured by Perrigo and/or its affiliates. Perrigo has also agreed to pay out of the Settlement Fund \$12.00 per bottle of Covered Product, up to a maximum of eight (8) bottles per household, to Class Members who submit valid Claim Forms without any cash register receipts. The actual amount received by each Class Member will depend on the total number of Valid Claims received, and will be adjusted up or down (as more fully explained in Paragraph 9 of the Settlement Agreement) in order to fully distribute the Net Settlement Fund to Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims. All payments to Settlement Class members who submit Valid Claims will be made within thirty (30) Days after the Final Order and Judgment has become final ("Effective Date"). All Class Members who do not opt out of the Class Settlement and who submit a Valid Claim shall receive a cash award.

After the Effective Date, cash awards of the appropriate amount will be sent to Settlement Class Members who submitted Valid Claims to the Settlement Administrator. You can make a Claim by filling in the Claim Form on the settlement website, [ADD WEBSITE ADDRESS], or you can obtain a Claim Form by requesting one in writing from the Settlement Administrator. You must fill out the Claim Form completely and timely submit it to the Settlement Administrator in order to receive the cash award.

The Parties have agreed, subject to the Court's final approval, that the class representatives— Plaintiffs Rosemary Quinn, Alan Ducorsky, Luis Guilin, Kay Eckler, Brian Calvert, Marc Group, John J. Gross, Christopher Nelson, and Randy Nunez (**"Class Representatives"**)—will receive an Incentive Award of up to \$5,000 per Class Representative out of the Settlement Fund. Perrigo also agrees not to oppose Class Counsel's request for an award of attorneys' fees and costs of up one third of the \$2.8 million Settlement Fund.

JUDGMENT AND RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS

If the settlement is granted final approval, the Court will enter a judgment as to all Settlement Class Members who do not opt out of the Action. Upon this settlement becoming final, the "Released Parties" (which is defined in the Settlement Agreement and includes Perrigo, the retailer Defendants in the Action, and any other retailer that sold Covered Products from November 1, 2005 to [ADD PRELIMINARY APPROVAL DATE]) will be released and forever discharged by Plaintiffs and all Class Members from any and all claims, actions, causes of action, rights, demands, suits, debts, liens, contracts, agreements, offsets or liabilities (including but not limited to tort claims, negligence claims, claims for breach of contract, breach of the duty of good faith and fair dealing, breach of statutory duties, actual or constructive fraud, misrepresentations, fraudulent inducement, statutory and consumer fraud, breach of fiduciary duty, unfair business or trade practices, false advertising, restitution, rescission, unjust enrichment, compensatory and punitive damages, injunctive or declaratory relief, attorneys' fees, interests, costs, penalties and any other claims), whether known or unknown, alleged or not alleged, foreseen or unforeseen, suspected or unsuspected, contingent or matured, liquidated or unliquidated, under federal, state or local law, whether by statute, contract, common law, or equity, which the Named Plaintiffs and/or any Settlement Class Member had, now has or may in the future have with respect to any conduct, act, omissions, facts, matters, transactions or oral or written statements or occurrences arising from or relating to the Covered Products (including, without limitation, the causes of action and allegations made in the Litigation¹ as well as claims and allegations that the Released Persons

¹ "Litigation" refers to Guilin v. Walgreen Co., No. 11-cv-7763 (N.D. Ill.) (Zagel, J.), Eckler v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.,

made false and deceptive representations and warranties and/or omitted material information about the Covered Products, (including, without limitation, causes of action for violation of the California Consumers Legal Remedies Act, the California Business & Professions Code, the Illinois Consumer Fraud Act, the Connecticut Unfair Trade Practices Act, the New York General Business Law, the Florida Deceptive and Unfair Trade Practices Act, the Pennsylvania Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law, the New Jersey Consumer Fraud Act, the Delaware Consumer Fraud Act and similar claims under the consumer protection and/or deceptive trade practices acts and common law of the other states and the District of Columbia as well as for negligence and breaches of express warranties)). Expressly excluded from the Released Claims are any claims alleging personal physical injury arising from the use of the Covered Products.

FINAL FAIRNESS HEARING

On _______ at _____, a final hearing will be held on the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the proposed settlement, and to determine whether the proposed settlement should be finally approved. At the hearing, the Court will be available to hear any objections and arguments concerning the fairness of the proposed settlement. The hearing will take place before the Honorable Vincent L. Briccetti in Courtroom 620, of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, located at 300 Quarropas St., White Plains, New York 10601. **You are not required to attend the hearing in order to participate in the settlement.**

WHAT YOU CAN DO

1. To Receive A Cash Award. To receive a cash award you must complete a Claim Form online by _____ [date] or mail a paper claim form postmarked no later than _____ [date] to the Settlement Administrator at the following address:

[ADD GCG ADDRESS]

If you do not timely submit a complete and accurate Claim Form, you will receive no benefits under the settlement but will still be bound by the settlement and release of claims.

If you have receipts evidencing purchase of a Covered Product, to file a Valid Claim, you must: (i) complete a Claim Form; (ii) sign the Claim Form and state under penalty of perjury the number of bottles of Covered Products purchased, the names of the Covered Products purchased and the approximate dates and locations of the purchases; (iii) submit the receipt(s) by filling out the Claim Form and mailing them to the address above, or attach an image of the receipt with your online Claim Form; and (iv) return the completed and signed Claim Form and cash register receipt(s) to the Settlement Administrator no later than [60 Days after the last Class Notice is published].

No. 12-cv-727 (S.D. Cal.) (Burns, J.); *Quinn v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 12-cv-8187 (S.D.N.Y.) (Briccetti, J.); *Nunez v. Supervalu, Inc.*, No. 13cv626 (S.D. Cal.) (Hayes, J.); *Calvert v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv1161 (W.D. Pa.) (Schwab, J.); *Group v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv81105 (S.D. Fla.) (Ryskamp, J.), *Gross v. Walgreen Co.*, No. 13cv6630 (D.N.J.) (Irenas, J.); and *Nelson v. Walgreen Co.*, 13cv1871 (D. Del.) (Sleet, J.).

If you do not have receipts, you can still make a claim for up to eight Covered Products. To file a Valid Claim, you must: (i) complete a Claim Form; (ii) sign the Claim Form and state under penalty of perjury the number of bottles of Covered Products purchased, the names of the Covered Products purchased and the approximate dates and locations of the purchases; and (iii) return the completed and signed Claim Form to the Settlement Administrator no later than [60 Days after the last Class Notice is published]

Only Settlement Class Members who submit Valid Claims shall be entitled to a cash award. You can find a Claim Form and additional information about the proposed settlement at the following website: [ADD WEBSITE ADDRESS]. You also may request a Claim Form from the Settlement Administrator at the address above. If you request a Claim Form in writing, please make sure to include your name and address with your request. You may submit Claim Forms either by mail or on the settlement website.

2. To Exclude Yourself From The Settlement. If you are a member of the Class, you have the right to exclude yourself from the settlement. If you wish to be excluded, you must deliver a request for exclusion from the settlement to the Settlement Administrator at the above address postmarked no later than [60 Days after the last Class Notice is published]. TO BE CONSIDERED VALID, A REQUEST FOR EXCLUSION MUST BE SIGNED BY YOU PERSONALLY, CONTAIN A STATEMENT THAT YOU ARE A MEMBER OF THE CLASS AND PURCHASED ONE OR MORE OF THE COVERED PRODUCTS, AND MUST BE TIMELY RECEIVED. You may opt-out on an individual basis only; so-called "mass" or "class" opt-outs shall not be allowed. If you timely and validly request exclusion, you will not be bound by any orders or judgments entered in the Action relating to the settlement, will not be entitled to relief under, or be affected by, the Settlement Agreement, will not gain any rights by virtue of the Settlement Agreement, or be entitled to object to any aspect of the settlement. If you do not wish to exclude yourself, and have no objection to the settlement, you will be afforded the benefits of the settlement if it is approved and you submit a Valid Claim Form.

3. To Object To The Settlement. If you wish to object to the terms of the settlement, you may do so under the procedures set forth below. If your objection is rejected you will be bound by the final judgment just as if you had not objected.

If you decide to object, you must file a written objection with the Court, Class Counsel, and Defendants' Counsel at the addresses set forth below, no later than [60 days after the last Class Notice is Published]. Such a request shall contain the following information: (i) Your name, address and telephone number, and if represented by counsel, the name of your counsel; (ii) a signed declaration stating that you are a member of the Class and purchased one or more of the Covered Products; (iii) a statement of all objections to the Settlement; and (iv) a statement of whether you intend to appear at the Fairness Hearing, either with or without counsel, and if with counsel, the name of your counsel who will attend.

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-6 Filed 07/17/14 Page 7 of 8

REPRESENTATIVES OF CLASS COUNSEL

Todd S. Garber, Esq. Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber LLP 1311 Mamaroneck Avenue White Plains, NY 10605 tgarber@fbfglaw.com

Elaine A. Ryan, Esq. Bonnett, Fairbourn, Friedman & Balint, P.C. 2325 E. Camelback Rd., Suite 300 Phoenix, Arizona 85016 eryan@bffb.com

Stewart M. Weltman, Esq. Stewart M. Weltman LLC 53 W. Jackson Blvd. Suite 364 Chicago, Illinois 60604 <u>sweltman@weltmanlawfirm.com</u> (Of Counsel Levin Fishbein Sedran & Berman)

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr., Esq. Carlson Lynch LTD PNC Park 115 Federal Street, Suite 210 Pittsburgh, PA 15212 ekilpela@carlsonlynch.com

DEFENDANTS' COUNSEL

Bradley J. Andreozzi, Esq. Justin O. Kay, Esq, Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP 191 N. Wacker Dr. Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606 <u>bradley.andreozzi@dbr.com</u> justin.kay@dbr.com

To be considered, the objection papers must be received by the Court and delivered or postmarked to the representatives of Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel no later than [60 days after the last Class Notice is published]. Class Members do not have to appear at the Fairness Hearing in order to object to the Settlement. Class Members who fail to timely file and serve a written objection and notice of their intent to appear at the Fairness Hearing, as detailed above, will not be permitted to object to the approval of the Settlement or appear at the Fairness Hearing. You may, but need not, enter an appearance through counsel of your choice. If you do, you will be responsible for your personal attorneys' fees and costs.

4. **Disputed Claims.** The Settlement Administrator shall have the responsibility to review submitted Claim Forms (for completeness, accuracy and timeliness) and approve Claims. Following the deadline to submit Claim Forms, the Settlement Administrator shall provide a report of any rejected claims to Defendants' Counsel and Class Counsel. After review of any rejected claims, if there is any dispute, the Parties will provide the Settlement Administrator with their

positions regarding those claims. The Settlement Administrator, after consideration of the positions of the parties, will make the final decision in its sole discretion.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

This description of this Action is general and does not cover all of the issues and proceedings thus far. For more information about the settlement and your rights, including a Claim Form, and a full copy of the Settlement Agreement, you may visit [ADD WEBSITE ADDRESS], call [ADD PHONE NUMBER], or you may write to the Settlement Administrator at [ADD GCG ADDRESS].

PLEASE DO NOT CONTACT THE COURT OR THE CLERK'S OFFICE.

EXHIBIT 4

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-7 Filed 07/17/14 Page 2 of 9

FBFG Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP

FIRM RESUME

Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP

The lawyers of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP ("FBFG")¹ have successfully litigated complex class actions in federal and state courts all across the country, and have obtained successful results for clients against some of the world's largest corporations. A sampling of the Firm's more significant cases includes:

- Wise v. Energy Plus Holdings, LLC, No. 1:11-cv-07345 (S.D.N.Y.). Nationwide class action alleging that Energy Plus falsely claimed to offer competitive electricity rates when its prices are substantially higher than market rates in violation of New York Gen. Bus. L. § 349 and other consumer protection laws. On September 17, 2013, the Court certified the class, appointed the lawyers of FBFG as lead class counsel, and approved the settlement valued at over \$11 million.
- *Hanna v. CFL Pizza, LLC*, No. 05-2011-CA-52949m (Fl. Cir. Court). State-wide class action alleging that CFL under-reimbursed its delivery drivers for their driving expenses, resulting in wages below the minimum. On September 3, 3013, the Court granted final approval of a settlement that created a substantial settlement fund. The Court also appointed the lawyers of FBFG as Class Counsel to the Settlement Class.
- In Re Michaels Stores, Inc. Zip Code Litigation, No. 11-cv-10920 (D. Mass.). State-wide class action alleging that Michaels Stores unlawfully collected consumers' personal identification information. After securing a groundbreaking decision by the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court, establishing that consumers whose privacy has been violated may bring consumer protection claims against companies that unlawfully collect personal identification information, the lawyers of FBFG were appointed as co-lead class counsel.
- *Brenner v. J.C. Penney Company, Inc.*, No. 13-cv-11212 (D. Mass.). State-wide class action alleging that J.C. Penney unlawfully collected consumers' personal identification information. On October 10, 2013, the Court granted final approval to a settlement valued at \$3.56 million and appointed the lawyers of FBFG class counsel.
- *Brenner v. Kohl's Corporation*, No. 13-cv-10935 (D. Mass). State-wide class action alleging that Kohl's unlawfully collected consumers' personal identification information. On December 5, 2013, the Court granted preliminary approval to a settlement valued at \$435,000 and appointed the lawyers of FBFG class counsel.
- Saint Joseph Health System Medical Information Cases, JCCP No. 4716 (Cal. Sup. Ct.). Complex class action on behalf of approximately 31,800 patients who were victimized by Saint Joseph's violation of the California Confidentiality of

¹ Three of the founding partners of FBFG were formerly partners in the firm of Meiselman, Packman, Nealon, Scialabba & Baker, P.C. ("MPNSB"). References in this resume to "lawyers of FBFG" includes instances involving current FBFG lawyers while they were at MPNSB.

Medical Information. The lawyers of FBFG have been appointed interim co-lead class counsel. The Court denied Saint Joseph's demurrer and the Court of Appeals upheld that ruling. The Court has ordered discovery to go forward.

- *Tyler v. Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.*, No. 13-10639 (D. Mass.). State-wide class action alleging that Bed Bath & Beyond unlawfully collected Plaintiffs' personal identification information. The lawyers of FBFG have been appointed as co-lead class counsel.
- *Bellaspica v. PJPA, LLC*, No. 13-3014 (E.D. Pa.). FLSA and state-wide class action on behalf of delivery drivers who are under-reimbursed for driving expenses. The Court granted conditional certification of the FLSA class, and the lawyers of FBFG were named co-lead counsel.
- In re Zappos.Com, Inc. Customer Data Security Breach Litig., MDL No. 2357 (D. Nev.). MDL class action on behalf of 24 million victims of a data breach. Plaintiffs successfully defeated Zappos' motions to compel arbitration and to dismiss. Litigation is ongoing.
- Goldemberg v. Johnson & Johnson Consumer Companies, Inc., No. 13-3073 (S.D.N.Y.). Class action alleging deceptive labeling in connection with Defendant's Aveeno Naturals brand of personal care products. Plaintiff defeated Defendant's motion to dismiss, and discovery will begin shortly.

FBFG is also counsel of record in numerous consumer fraud class actions throughout the country, including cases pending in United States District Courts in New York, Massachusetts, California, Florida, Pennsylvania, Nevada, and the District of Columbia, as well as actions pending in the state courts of New York, California, and Massachusetts.

Attorney Profiles

Andrew Finkelstein

Andrew Finkelstein is the Managing Partner of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber, LLP. He has become a noted consumer activist through his representation of injured individuals against corporate wrong doers and other irresponsible parties.

Mr. Finkelstein served as Captain of the 9/11 Victim Compensation Fund in a pro bono capacity, where he helped obtain over \$10 million for victims and waived all legal fees associated with this representation. Mr. Finkelstein is also the Chairman of the Plaintiff Personal Injury Steering committee for the Neurontin Liability Multi District Litigation in Boston, Massachusetts. He has worked closely with the FDA regarding the adverse effects associated with Neurontin, having filed a Citizens Petition seeking enhanced warning of the side effects of this drug, specifically increased suicidal tendencies. Additionally, Mr. Finkelstein is a member of the Executive Steering Committee of the Hormone Replacement Therapy Multi District Litigation in both Philadelphia, Pennsylvania and Little Rock, Arkansas. He is a member of the Plaintiff Steering Committee of the Ortho Evra Birth Control Patch New Jersey Coordinated Litigation, and the Plaintiff Steering Committee of the Viagra Multi District Litigation in Minneapolis, Minnesota.

Case 7:12-cv-08187-VB Document 95-7 Filed 07/17/14 Page 5 of 9

Mr. Finkelstein is a frequent lecturer at Continuing Legal Education courses. His topics include "Science in the Courtroom", "Technology in the Courtroom", "Prosecution of a Pharmaceutical Case", "The Ethics of On-line Advertising", and "Structured Settlements and the Personal Injury Settlement."

In addition to these presentations, Mr. Finkelstein volunteers his time to present his "Commit to Quit Texting While Driving" seminar to area high school students.

Greg Blankinship

Greg Blankinship is a founding partner of FBFG, and he specializes in class actions in state and federal courts. Mr. Blankinship has worked on substantial class action matters representing both defendants and plaintiffs in numerous state, federal, and multi-district class actions, including securities, consumer fraud and wage and hour matters. Mr. Blankinship has been named class counsel by several courts.

Prior to joining the Firm, Mr. Blankinship was an associate with Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP and Greenberg Traurig, LLP. Mr. Blankinship received his B.A. from Emory University in 1991 and his M.A. from the University of North Carolina in 1995. He attended law school at the University of Washington, where he earned his J.D. in 2003. While in law school, Mr. Blankinship was a member of the University of Washington Law Review.

A sampling of Mr. Blankinship's successful cases includes:

- Appointed Class Counsel in *Wise v. Energy Plus Holdings LLC*, No. 11-7345 (S.D.N.Y.). Plaintiffs alleged that Energy Plus, an independent electricity supplier, misrepresented that its rates were reflective of the market when they were much higher. The Court granted final approval of a settlement covering more than 400,000 consumers in eight states and valued at more than \$11,000,000.
- Appointed Class Counsel in *Brenner v. J.C. Penney Company, Inc.*, No. 13-11212 (D. Mass.). Plaintiff alleged that J.C. Penney requested and recorded customers' ZIP codes, which it then used to identify consumers' mailing addresses to send them junk mail, in violation of Massachusetts law. The Court granted final approval of a settlement valued at more than \$3.5 million.
- Appointed Co-Lead Class Counsel in *In Re Michaels Stores, Inc. Zip Code Litigation*, No. 11-cv-10920 (D. Mass.). Plaintiff alleged that Michaels unlawfully collected consumers' personal identification information. Final approval of a class-wide settlement is pending.
- Appointed Class Counsel in *Brenner v. Kohl's Corporation*, No. 13-cv-10935 (D. Mass). State-wide class action alleging that Kohl's unlawfully collected consumers' personal identification information. On December 5, 2013, the Court granted preliminary approval to a settlement valued at \$435,000 and appointed lawyers of FBFG class counsel.

• Appointed Co-Lead Class Counsel in *Tyler v. Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.*, No. 13-10639 (D. Mass.). Plaintiff alleged that Bed, Bath & Beyond illegally requested and recorded customers' ZIP codes.

Mr. Blankinship has also prosecuted numerous class actions on behalf of consumers in New York and nationwide, including claims brought against a prominent video game manufacturer for allegedly intentionally disabling valuable game console features it had previously and prominently advertised, claims brought against a chewing gum manufacturer for alleged false advertising concerning unsubstantiated health benefits, claims brought against a national retail chain for overcharging its customers for their prescriptions, and claims brought against internet marketers for alleged unauthorized credit charges. Mr. Blankinship's broad experience as a litigator has also exposed him to a wide variety of substantive business and consumer issues. He also has substantial experience with the issues and procedural aspects of large class action and complex cases.

Mr. Blankinship is admitted to practice in New York and Massachusetts and is a member of the bars of the U.S. District Courts for the Eastern, Western and Southern Districts of New York, the District of Connecticut, the District of Massachusetts, and the First and Second Circuit Courts of Appeals.

<u>Jeremiah Frei-Pearson</u>

Jeremiah Frei-Pearson is a founding partner of Finkelstein, Blankinship, Frei-Pearson & Garber. He is a passionate advocate and an experienced litigator who represents consumers and employees in complex cases against corporate wrongdoers. As a result of the victories he has won for his clients, the National Trial Lawyers Association selected Mr. Frei-Pearson as a member of the Top 100 Trial Lawyers. Mr. Frei-Pearson practices in federal and state courts throughout the country and his areas of expertise include class actions, employment law, consumer fraud, privacy, and civil rights.

Prior to joining the Firm, Mr. Frei-Pearson was an associate with Kaye Scholer LLP, a multinational law firm, and a staff attorney with Children's Rights, a national public interest law firm representing children in foster care. Mr. Frei-Pearson received his B.A. from Skidmore College, Magna Cum Laude, Phi Beta Kappa in 2000 and he earned his J.D. in 2003 from Stanford Law School. While in law school, Mr. Frei-Pearson was a Public Interest Fellow and served as Senior Symposium Editor of the Stanford Law & Policy Review. A sampling of Mr. Frei-Pearson's significant cases includes:

- Appointed class counsel in *Hanna v. CFL Pizza, LLC*, No. 05-2011-CA-52949m (Fl. Cir. Court). On September 3, 3013, the Court granted final approval of a settlement that created a substantial settlement fund for pizza delivery drivers who alleged violations of the Florida Minimum Wage Act.
- Appointed co-class counsel in *Saint Joseph Health System Medical Information Cases*, JCCP No. 4716 (Cal. Sup. Ct.). In this data breach case, the Court denied Saint Joseph's demurrer and the Court of Appeals upheld that ruling. The Court has ordered discovery to go forward.

- Appointed co-class counsel in *Bellaspica v. PJPA, LLC*, No. 13-3014 (E.D. Pa.). The Court denied defendant's motion to dismiss and granted conditional certification of an FLSA class of pizza delivery drivers who alleged minimum wage violations. The notice period is now open.
- Counsel to the Plaintiff in *D.G. ex rel. Stricklin v. Henry*, No. 08-cv-074 (N.D. Okl.). In this class action to reform Oklahoma's foster care system, the Court certified a statewide class of Oklahoma's foster children (an opinion that was affirmed by the Tenth Circuit). As a result of this litigation, Oklahoma has committed to restructuring its state foster care agency to eliminate dangerous practices (such as an unsafe shelter where babies in state custody disproportionately suffered fractured skulls), and improve measurable outcomes for children in state custody.
- As counsel in *Charlie and Nadine H. v. Christie*, No. 99-3678 (D.N.J.), worked with the state agencies, a federally appointed monitor, and the Court to help ensure implementation of a consent decree to reform New Jersey's foster care system. Among many other significant achievements under the consent decree, New Jersey broke a record for adoptions achieved, significantly reformed supervision procedures that were inadequate, and substantially increased the percentage of foster children who subsequently attended college. Mr. Frei-Pearson continues to be involved in this litigation in a *pro bono* capacity.

Mr. Frei-Pearson has received numerous awards for his legal work, including the New York City Bar Association's Thurgood Marshall Award for his work on death penalty cases, a citation from the New York City Council for his child advocacy work, and the 2010 Palomountain Award from Skidmore College.

Mr. Frei-Pearson is admitted to practice in New York and is a member of the bars of the U.S. District Courts for the Eastern, Western and Southern Districts of New York.

Todd S. Garber

Todd S. Garber is a founding partner in the Firm. Mr. Garber is an experienced litigator, who practices in state and federal courts. His areas of experience include class actions, consumer fraud, securities fraud, complex commercial disputes, business torts, antitrust, and general litigation. Mr. Garber was designated a New York Super Lawyer in 2013, a distinction earned by only five percent of the lawyers in the New York metro area.

Prior to joining the Firm, Mr. Garber worked at Lowey Dannenberg Cohen & Hart, P.C., where he prosecuted and defended complex commercial litigation matters and class actions.

Mr. Garber's career achievements include:

• Appointed Class Counsel in *Brenner v. J.C. Penney Company, Inc.*, No. 13-11212 (D. Mass.). Plaintiff alleged that J.C. Penney requested and recorded customers' ZIP codes, which it then used to identify consumers' mailing addresses to send them junk mail, in

violation of Massachusetts law. The Court granted final approval of a settlement valued at more than \$3.5 million.

- Appointed Co-Lead Class Counsel in *Tyler v. Bed Bath & Beyond, Inc.*, No. 13-10639 (D. Mass.). Plaintiff alleged that Bed, Bath & Beyond illegally requested and recorded customers' ZIP codes.
- As counsel for the New York City Pension Funds, Lead Plaintiff in *In re Juniper Networks, Inc. Sec. Litig.*, No. C-06-04327 JW (N.D. Cal 2010), helped achieve a settlement of \$169.5 million, one of the largest settlements in an options backdating case, after more than three years of hard-fought litigation.
- Involvement in the prosecution of a number of high-profile cases, which have resulted in hundreds of millions of dollars in recoveries for investors, including *In re WorldCom Securities Litigation, In re HealthSouth Securities Litigation, In re DaimlerChrysler AG Securities Litigation, and In re Bayer AG Securities Litigation.*
- Representation of institutional investors in stockholder voting rights and corporate governance cases, including *Gabelli Global Multimedia v. Western Investment LLC*, 700 F. Supp. 2d 748 (D. Md. 2010); *Delcath Systems, Inc. v. Ladd*, 466 F.3d 257 (2d. Cir. 2006); *Salomon Brothers Mun. Partners Fund, Inc. v. Thornton*, 410 F. Supp. 2d 330 (S.D.N.Y. 2006); *meVC Draper Fisher Jurvetson Fund I, Inc. v. Millennium Partners*, 260 F. Supp. 2d 616 (S.D.N.Y. 2003); and *Millenco L.P. v. meVC Draper Fisher Jurvetson Fund I, Inc.*, 824 A.2d 11 (Del. Ch. 2002).

Mr. Garber received his B.A. from Cornell University in 1999 and his J.D. from the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law in 2002, where he was articles editor for the Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law, and was competitively selected to work for the New York City Law Department's Corporation Counsel in its Appellate Division.

Mr. Garber co-authored "Morrison v. National Australia Bank: The Potential Impact on Public Pension Fund Fiduciaries," The NAPPA Report, Vol. 24, Number 3, August 2010, and "Loss Causation in the Ninth Circuit," New York Law Journal, September 2, 2008.

Mr. Garber is admitted to practice in New York and Connecticut and is a member of the bars of the U.S. District Courts for the Eastern, Western and Southern Districts of New York and the Second Circuit Court of Appeals.

Khristoph Becker

Khristoph Becker is an associate at FBFG. Khristoph received his B.A. cum laude from Middlebury College and his J.D. from the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law, where he served as a member of Cardozo's Moot Court Honor Society and as a teaching assistant for a first-year legal research, writing, and oral advocacy class. During law school, Mr. Becker was competitively selected by faculty to intern for Magistrate Judge Patty Shwartz as part of the Alexander Fellows Program. Mr. Becker spent his first summer and entire second year of law school interning for the Innocence Project, and his second summer interning for the Special Litigation Section in the U.S. Department of Justice's Civil Rights Division. Mr. Becker completed his final semester of law school as a visiting student at Northwestern University School of Law. Mr. Becker is a member of the New Jersey bar and he has passed the New York State Bar examination and is awaiting admission. Prior to law school, Mr. Becker worked as a paralegal for a white-collar criminal defense firm in Manhattan, investigated allegations of police misconduct for the City of New York, and trained for the Olympic Trials in decathlon.